

Ownership in the Integrated Water Resources Management Planning Process: A Cross Country Validation of Methods

David Wellington Essaw

*B.Sc. (Hons) Development Planning: Kwame Nkrumah
University of Science and Technology, Kumasi, Ghana
M.Phil Development Studies: University of Cape Coast, Ghana.*

Centre for Ecological Economics and Water Policy Research,
University of New England, Armidale, New South Wales Australia

A thesis submitted for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy, University of New England

July 2007

Some parts of this thesis have already been presented in conferences and published as technical reports.

- 2007 Wolfenden, J.; Evans, M.; **Essaw, D.**; Johnson, F.; Sanderson, A.; Starkey, G.; and Wilkinson, W. (2007) Resilience Management: A Guide for Irrigated Regions, Communities and Enterprises'. Technical Report No 01/07 Cooperative Research Centre for Irrigation Futures.
<http://www.irrigationfutures.org.au/news.asp?catID=9>

Papers presented or accepted to be presented in conferences

- 2007 Dutra, L.X.C.; **Essaw, D.W.**; Gill, R.A.; and Taboada, M.B. 2007. Exploring Alternatives on Community-Based Coral Reef Management: A Case Study from Beloi, Atauro Island, Timor-Leste. International Pacific Marine Educators Conference. Honolulu, Hawaii. From 15-18 January 2007.
- 2007 **Essaw, D. W.**; Wolfenden, J.; Gill, R. (2007) "Ownership in the IWRM planning process: Macintyre Brook Savelugu Nantom case studies" Paper accepted for presentation at the 10th International River Symposium & Environmental Flows Conference to be held between 3-6 September, 2007 in Brisbane, Australia.
- 2006 Dutra, L.X.C.; **Essaw, D.W.**; Gill, R.A.; and Taboada, M.B. (2006). Catalysing community Learning Through Dialogue: A Beloi (East-Timor) Case Study. Education in Post-Conflict Environments: Challenges and Opportunities for Timor-Leste. The University of New England May 3rd 2006. Published online at: <http://www-personal.une.edu.au/~gcarroll/>

DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated firstly, to the Almighty God for His protection and guidance throughout this journey. Secondly, to my lovely wife Cecilia Mensah and children; Papa Kobina Essaw and Ekow Adom Essaw for their understanding and sacrifices while I embarked on this seemingly never-ending journey. Finally, to my mother Aba Fineba, who promised to spend her last 'peswa' towards my education at all levels. 'Aya medase pii'

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my appreciation to a number of people and institutions for their support, which enabled the successful and timely completion of this research.

Dr Roderic Gill, my principal supervisor, provided theoretical and methodological advice throughout this research. He was instrumental in obtaining support from the Centre for Ecological Economics and Water Policy Research (CEEWPR) towards payment of my fees. Dr Gill, I value your contributions. You have been more of a father rather than a mere academic mentor.

Professor John Pigram, my co-supervisor provided reference materials, editing and contacts to other people for information regarding this research. You really motivated me to come to Australia in the first place. Please accept my heart-felt thanks.

Funding for the research conducted pursuant to this thesis was provided by the CRC Irrigation Futures. Dr John Wolfenden was very instrumental in getting the CRC Irrigation Futures top up scholarship. John, I am so grateful for that. Other financial support for this research was provided through a scholarship from the University of New England Research Assistantship (UNERA), and the CEEWPR.

The Regional Irrigation Business Partnership group provided in-kind support with regards to data from the Macintyre Brook Catchment – Australia. World Vision International, WINROCK, Team Consult, Gharthey Associates, Ligba and Bunglung communities, and other West Africa Water Initiative (WAWI) representatives from the Savelugu Nanton District supported data collection from Ghana.

To my colleagues of the CEEWPR, Dr Evans, Dr Jeannet van der Lee, Dr Sam Bartlett, Dr Matt Grey, Michael Drielsma, Isoa Koravulavula, Nazrul Islam, Steve Marchant, Stuart Wright, Eric de Regt, Michael O'Loughlin, Leo Dutra and Mauela Taboada, I say a big thank you for your constructive feedback during our seminars, rendezvous and informal meetings. I must say your feedback shaped my thinking and encouraged me to forge ahead.

I would also like to acknowledge the support I have received from friends, host families and relatives from Australia and Ghana. In particular, I would like to thank, Richard and Gill Willis, Ken and Madeline Fussell, Nevyl and Linda Fuller, Thea Harris, Laurie and Priscilla Piper, Dr and Mrs Alfred Yawson, Dr I. K. Acheampong, Rosemond Boohene, Carina Bosu, Naruanard Sarapaivanich, Hou-Chun (Michael) Chen, Quassy Adjapawn, Nukunu Nanedo, Peter Abugah, Adom Gharthey, Charles Bamfo, Ewuradjoa Sangmuah Tabbicca, Mr and Mrs George Hagan and Prof. Shabaz Khan. Thank you all for your ideas, financial and material resources, advice, proof reading skills, companionship, care and encouragements throughout this research.

Finally, I would like to thank my brothers, sisters and other extended family members for their encouragement and spiritual support.

ABSTRACT

The recognition of the importance of Integrated Water Resource Management (IWRM) is largely in response to addressing the ever-increasing limited water quality and quantity problems that the world faces. Whereas officially, the United Nations through the Global Water Partnership (GWP) has endorsed IWRM as the best means to water resources management, lessons learnt from implementation to date, suggest the need to highlight the planning process more than the plan itself.

The purpose of my research is to explore improved ways of engaging stakeholders in the IWRM planning processes that can serve as a framework to advance IWRM GWP agenda. The methodological synthesis of the study incorporates ideas from broad theoretical areas covering ecological, economics, community and change management settings to inform the design of what is described as the appreciative systems planning (ASP) methodology used in this study.

The methodology developed was tested in Macintyre Brook Catchments in Australia and Savelugu Nantom Catchment in Ghana. On the basis of the outcomes from the two case studies, the study suggests that this methodology can be applied in a diversity of regional settings. For instance, while the concern in the Savelugu Nantom case centred on ability of stakeholders to get resources to help improve the management of water resources in their catchment, in the Macintyre Brook case, concern was more on strategies to implement the outcomes from the process. The extent to which both the institutions and communities came out with water management issues is informed by the application of the ASP methodology. This methodology enabled both the experts and farmers, groups and individuals to express, share and analyse the complex and diverse realities of water issues from their catchments.

The major contribution of this study is the design of a framework to overcome the dilemma of facilitating stakeholder involvement in IWRM planning processes. Of particular importance is the explicit focus on the connection between social, economic and environmental dimensions in decision-making that the water resources issues represent.

OPERATION

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DEDICATION	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iv
ABSTRACT	vi
CERTIFICATION	viii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	ix
LIST OF FIGURES	xiv
LIST OF TABLES	xvi
LIST OF BOXES	xvii
ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS	xviii
Chapter 1 Introduction	1
1.1 The Journey	1
1.2 Setting the Scene	1
1.3 Research Statement	3
1.4 Aims	4
1.5 Expected Outcome	5
1.6 Proposed Methodological Framework	5
1.6.1 Appreciative Systems Planning Approach	7
1.6.2 Case Study Approach	8
1.7 Structure of This Study	9
Chapter 2 Water and Livelihood Issues	11
2.1 Introduction	11
2.2 Water and Livelihood Issues	12
2.3 Poverty and Livelihood	15
2.3.1 Water Poor	17
2.4 A Case for Effective Water Management	18
2.5 Integrated Catchment Management, Integrated River Basin Management and Integrated Water Resource Management	22
2.5.1 Integration of Management Processes	24
Chapter 3 History of International Development in Water Resources Management	26
3.1 Introduction	26

3.2	Historical Excursion into Integrated Water Resource Management...	26
3.3	IWRM in the International Agenda from Mar del Plata 1977 to Kyoto 2003.....	28
3.3.1	United Nations Conference on Water (Mar del Plata 1977).....	29
3.3.2	International Conference on Water and Environment (Dublin 1992).....	29
3.3.3	Eighth World Congress (Cairo 1994).....	30
3.3.4	First World Water Forum (Marrakech 1997).....	31
3.3.5	International Conference on Water and Sustainable Development (Paris 1998).....	32
3.3.6	Second World Water Forum & Ministerial Conference (The Hague 2000).....	32
3.3.7	International Conference on Freshwater (Bonn 2001).....	33
3.3.8	World Summit on Sustainable Development (Johannesburg 2002).....	33
3.3.9	Third World Water Forum (Kyoto 2003).....	34
3.4	Synthesis: IWRM from Mar del Plata to Kyoto.....	34
3.5	Global Water Partnership (GWP)/Integrated Water Resources Management.....	35
3.5.1	IWRM is Defined.....	36
3.6	Review of the Technical Committee Papers Published by GWP/IWRM.....	37
3.7	IWRM and Sustainability Agenda.....	42
3.8	Assumptions Underlining IWRM Concept.....	48
3.8.1	Methods, Methodologies, and Theoretical Perspectives Underlying the IWRM Concept.....	49
3.9	Conclusion.....	58
Chapter 4	Status of IWRM Implementation in the Global Context.....	59
4.1	Introduction.....	59
4.2	The IWRM Governance Structure and Processes.....	59
4.3	Putting IWRM into Practice.....	61
4.3.1	Governance.....	63
4.3.2	Process.....	68
4.3.3	The Way Forward.....	71

Chapter 5 Participatory Planning Approaches: A Reassessment.....	74
5.1 Introduction	74
5.2 Planning Decision Support Approaches.....	74
5.3 Participatory Planning Methodologies.....	76
5.4 Dilemma in the Engagement Processes.....	78
5.4.1 The Problem Solving Approach.....	79
5.4.2 Critique on Participatory Approaches	82
5.5 Current Thinking	84
5.6 Appreciative Inquiry as an Appropriate Framework.	85
Chapter 6 Appreciative Inquiry Perspective.....	89
6.1 Introduction	89
6.2 Evolution and Theoretical Basis of Appreciative Inquiry	90
6.3 What is Appreciative Inquiry?	91
6.4 AI and its Relationship with Complexity Theory, Systems Thinking and Communicative Action Theory.....	93
6.4.1 AI and its Relationship with Complexity Theory.....	93
6.4.2 AI and Systems Thinking	96
6.4.3 AI and Communicative Action Theory.....	97
6.5 AI and IWRM	100
6.6 AI as a Process.....	101
6.6.1 Principles Underlying Appreciative Inquiry.....	101
6.6.2 Assumptions Underlying AI Change Process	106
6.6.3 The Five Core Generic Processes for AI	111
6.6.4 Models Applied	111
6.6.5 Application of AI in the Field	117
6.6.6 Facilitation is Key in AI Processes.....	119
6.7 Management of AI Engagement Processes.....	120
6.7.1 Systems Mapping Approach.....	121
6.7.2 The Appreciative Systems Planning	127
6.7.3 Dealing with Communities with Culturally Embedded Perspective of Problem Focussed Deliberation.....	133
6.7.4 In the Events of a Catastrophe	133
6.8 Conclusion	135

Chapter 7 Engagement Process for Integrated Water Resources	
Management: Australia/Ghana Case Studies	136
7.1 Introduction	136
7.2 The Appreciative Systems Planning Process	136
7.2.1 Initial Preparation.....	136
7.2.2 Dialoguing Process during Institutional and Community Engagement	137
7.3 Institutional Engagement	141
7.3.1 Macintyre Brook Catchment, Australia.....	142
7.3.2 Application of ASP Approach in the Macintyre Brook Catchment, Australia.....	144
7.4 Savelugu Nantom Catchment, Ghana.	148
7.4.1 Application of ASP Approach in the Savelugu Nantom Catchment, Ghana.....	150
7.4.2 Discovering What is Working Well.....	150
7.4.3 Dreaming into the Future.....	156
7.4.4 Lessons from Institutional Engagement.....	160
7.5 Community Level Engagement.....	161
7.5.1 Bunglung and Ligba Community Engagement	161
7.5.2 Discovering What is Working Well in Bunglung and Ligba Communities.....	162
7.5.3 Dreaming into the Future – Bunglung and Ligba Communities .	166
7.6 A Reflection on Processes and Outcomes.....	169
7.7 Chapter Conclusion	173
Chapter 8 Methodological Insights from the Case Studies.....	175
8.1 Introduction	175
8.2 Case Study Insights to Inform the Proposed Methodological Synthesis	175
8.2.1 Insights Pertaining to the Validity of ASP as an Articulation of Systems Thinking	175
8.2.2 Insights Pertaining to the Validity of ASP that are Generated via its Cognisance of Complexity Theory.....	178
8.2.3 Insights Pertaining to the Validity of ASP as an Articulation of Communicative Action	179

8.3	ASP Methodology and Conventional Approach	180
8.4	Validating the Australia and Ghana Case Studies	182
8.4.1	Cultural/social	182
8.4.2	Location	183
8.4.3	Facilitation	184
8.4.4	Ownership of Processes.....	185
8.5	ASP Methodology and Definition of Sustainability	185
8.6	ASP Methodology and IWRM/GWP Agenda	186
Chapter 9	Relevance of Appreciative Systems Planning Approach in the IWRM Planning Process and Conclusions	188
9.1	Introduction	188
9.2	Relevance of the ASP Approach to the IWRM Planning Process....	189
9.2.1	Theoretical Relevance	189
9.2.2	The Process Relevance.....	191
9.2.3	Practical Relevance	193
9.3	Summary of Thesis	194
9.4	Review of Thesis Aims.....	198
9.5	Implications for Theory and Practice.....	200
9.6	Areas that Need further Consideration in the ASP Approach	202
9.7	Areas for Further Research:	203
9.8	Conclusion	203
REFERENCES		205
APPENDICES		226
	Appendix 1: Letter of Information	226
	Appendix 2: Letter of Appreciation	227

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1 The ‘three pillars’ of Integrated Water Resources Management..	38
Figure 3.2 The Integrated Water Resources Management Cycle.....	41
Figure 3.3 IWRM Epistemology.....	55
Figure 5.1 Problem Tree Analysis.....	80
Figure 6.1 A Model of Positive Organisational Change.....	104
Figure 6.2 Reality Formation.....	107
Figure 6.3 Two Different Processes for Organisation Change.....	109
Figure 6.4 Dimensions of Appreciative Inquiry.....	112
Figure 6.5 The Four-D Model.....	113
Figure 6.6 The Four-I Model	116
Figure 6.7 Connecting the Four D and Four I Models.....	117
Figure 6.8 Systems Mapping Planning Process.....	124
Figure 6.9 Building the Future-Armidale.....	125
Figure 6.10 Rural Strategic Planning Steering Committee ‘System Mapping’ in Coffs Harbour.....	126
Figure 7.1 The Appreciative Systems Planning Dialoguing Process.....	138
Figure 7.2 Inglewood, Macintyre Brook Catchment (yellow pinned) in the National Context.....	143
Figure 7.3 Macintyre Brook Catchment-What is working well.....	145
Figure 7.4 Macintyre Brook Catchment-What can be improved in Future..	146
Figure 7.5 Savelugu, Savelugu-Nantom Catchment (yellow pinned) in the National Context.....	149
Figure 7.6 Management of Water Resources in Savelugu Nantom Catchment: Institutional Engagement-What is working well.....	152
Figure 7.7 Management of Water Resources in Savelugu Nantom Catchment: Institutional Engagement-Future.....	158
Figure 7.8 Management of Water Resources in Savelugu Nantom Catchment: Community Engagement (Bunglung)-What is working well....	163
Figure 7.9 Management of Water Resources in Savelugu Nantom Catchment: Community Engagement (Ligba)-What is working well.....	164

Figure 7.10 Management of Water Resources in Savelugu Nantom Catchment: Community Engagement (Bunglung)-Future.....	167
Figure 7.11 Management of Water Resources in Savelugu Nantom Catchment: Community Engagement (Ligba)-Future.....	168
Figure 7.12 Pair Dialogue.....	170
Figure 7.13 Plenary Discussions.....	171
Figure 7.14 Participant (Ligba, Ghana) assisting with Documentation on Systems maps.....	172

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1 The UN Water, Poverty (livelihood) and Millennium Development Goals.....	20
Table 3.1 An Indicative Schematic of Epistemology, Theoretical Perspective and Methodological Associations in Relation to Water Resources Management.....	52
Table 3.2 Summary of Differences between Wicked and Tame Problems...	57
Table 6.1 Positive Core of Organisation Life.....	103
Table 6.2 Schein's three-stage Model of Change Process.....	110
Table 6.3 Step-By-Step to Appreciative Inquiry.....	115
Table 6.4 Change Agendas Suited for AI.....	118

LIST OF BOXES

Box 3.1 Detailed Guidelines on IWRM Framework.....39

Box 6.1 The Dangerous River.....108

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

AI – Appreciative Inquiry

ASP – Appreciative Systems Planning

CEEWPR – Centre for Ecological Economics and Water policy Research

CM – Catchment Management

CRCIF – Cooperative Research Centre for Irrigation Futures

EE – Ecological Economics

GDP – Gross Domestic Product

GWP – Global Water Partnership

ICM – Integrated Catchment Management

IRBM – Integrated River Basin Management

IWRA – International Water Resources Association

IWRM – Integrated Water Resources Management

MDG – Millennium Development Goals

NGO – Non-Governmental Organisations

RBM – River Basin Management

RIBP – Regional Irrigation Business Partnership

SMA – Systems Mapping Approach

TEC - Technical Committee

UN – United Nations

WSSD – World Summit on Sustainable Development

WVI – World Vision International

WWC – World Water Council