

**Education For All in Tajikistan: A Comparative Study  
of Girls' Access to Education in Khorog and Panj**

**A thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements of the  
Master of Education (Hons) – International Education**

**Amanda Holmes BEd (First Class Hons), CELTA**

**October 2009**

**School of Education, The University of New England**

**Supervisors: Dr. Laurence Tamatea & Dr. Izabel Soliman**

# Table of Contents

Table of Contents.....	i
Declaration .....	v
Acknowledgement .....	vi
Abstract .....	vii
Abbreviations.....	ix
List of Tables.....	xi
List of Figures .....	xii
List of Appendices .....	xiii
Chapter One.....	1
<i>Girls’ Access to Education in Rural/Remote Tajikistan.....</i>	<i>1</i>
<i>Introduction.....</i>	<i>1</i>
<i>The Research Focus.....</i>	<i>4</i>
<i>The Problem and Background Information .....</i>	<i>9</i>
<i>Under Soviet Rule .....</i>	<i>9</i>
<i>Independence .....</i>	<i>10</i>
<i>Poverty .....</i>	<i>11</i>
<i>Regional Alliances .....</i>	<i>12</i>
<i>Post-conflict in Tajikistan .....</i>	<i>13</i>
<i>Tajikistan’s Education System .....</i>	<i>14</i>
<i>EFA and the Millennium Development Goals.....</i>	<i>16</i>
<i>Limitations.....</i>	<i>17</i>
<i>Research Questions.....</i>	<i>18</i>
<i>Thesis and Structure of Argument.....</i>	<i>18</i>
<i>Conclusion.....</i>	<i>21</i>
Chapter Two .....	23
<i>The Context of Girls’ Access to Education in Rural/Remote Tajikistan.....</i>	<i>23</i>
<i>Introduction.....</i>	<i>23</i>
<i>Girls’ Access to Education in and around Tajikistan .....</i>	<i>24</i>
<i>Discourse of Development .....</i>	<i>25</i>
<i>Development and Education in Tajikistan.....</i>	<i>26</i>
<i>Post-conflict and Education .....</i>	<i>30</i>
<i>Girls’ Education in Tajikistan.....</i>	<i>33</i>
<i>Girls’ Education in Similar Contexts.....</i>	<i>35</i>
<i>Conclusion.....</i>	<i>40</i>

Chapter Three.....	43
<b>Social Theory Framework</b> .....	43
<i>Enlightenment</i> .....	50
<i>Modernity</i> .....	52
<i>Globalisation</i> .....	55
<i>Capitalism</i> .....	58
<i>The ‘West’ and the ‘Rest’</i> .....	63
<i>Discourse</i> .....	65
<i>Knowledge</i> .....	68
<i>Discourse of Development</i> .....	71
<i>A Neo-liberal Agenda</i> .....	75
<i>Gender Relations</i> .....	78
<i>Conclusion</i> .....	82
Chapter Four .....	84
<b>Methodology: Research in a Cross-cultural and Cross-Language Context</b> .....	84
<i>Introduction</i> .....	84
<b>Research Paradigms</b> .....	84
<i>The Positivist Research Paradigm</i> .....	86
<i>The Interpretive Research Paradigm</i> .....	87
<i>The Critical Research Paradigm</i> .....	88
<b>The Case Study</b> .....	89
<i>The Context of the Case Study</i> .....	90
<b>Types of Interviews</b> .....	95
<i>Semi- structured Interviews</i> .....	100
<b>The Role of an Interpreter</b> .....	103
<b>Recording the Data</b> .....	110
<b>Transcribing the Data</b> .....	110
<b>Analytical Framework</b> .....	111
<b>Critical Discourse Analysis</b> .....	113
<b>Ideologies and Critical Discourse Analysis</b> .....	117
<b>Engaging with Critical Discourse Analysis</b> .....	118
<b>Analysis of Policy</b> .....	119
<i>Policy as Text</i> .....	120
<i>Policy as Discourse</i> .....	121
<b>Leximancer and CDA</b> .....	122
<b>Conclusion</b> .....	125
Chapter Five .....	127
<b>Girls’ Access to Education in Rural Tajikistan: Analysis and Findings from Panj</b> 127	
<i>Introduction</i> .....	127
<b>Discourses Informing Panj Girls’ Access to Education</b> .....	129
<b>The Girls in Panj</b> .....	133
<b>Discourses Affecting Girls’ Access to Education in Panj - School and Related</b>	
<b>Discourses</b> .....	137

<i>School and Education</i> .....	137
<i>School and Work</i> .....	143
<i>School and Lessons</i> .....	147
<b><i>Resistance to Discourses Framing Access to Education in Panj</i></b> .....	<b>149</b>
<b><i>Conclusion</i></b> .....	<b>151</b>
<b>Chapter Six</b> .....	<b>154</b>
<b><i>Girls' Access to Education in Remote Tajikistan: Analysis and Findings from Khorog</i></b> .....	<b>154</b>
<b><i>Introduction</i></b> .....	<b>154</b>
<b><i>Leximancer and Khorog</i></b> .....	<b>156</b>
<b><i>Discourses Informing Khorog Girls' Access to Education</i></b> .....	<b>158</b>
<b><i>The Girls in Khorog</i></b> .....	<b>163</b>
<b><i>Discourses Affecting Girls' Access to Education in Khorog – School and Related Discourses</i></b> .....	<b>166</b>
<i>School</i> .....	166
<i>School and Language</i> .....	173
<i>School and Boys</i> .....	174
<b><i>Resistance to Discourses Framing Access to Education in Khorog</i></b> .....	<b>176</b>
<b><i>Conclusion</i></b> .....	<b>177</b>
<b>Chapter Seven</b> .....	<b>179</b>
<b><i>Access to Education for Girls in Tajikistan – Local links to the Global Context</i></b> ...	<b>179</b>
<b><i>Introduction</i></b> .....	<b>179</b>
<b><i>The Dakar Framework - a Global Education Development Policy</i></b> .....	<b>180</b>
<b><i>Girls' Access to Education in Rural/Remote Tajikistan</i></b> .....	<b>188</b>
<i>The Contexts</i> .....	190
<i>Panj</i> .....	191
<i>Khorog</i> .....	192
<i>The Discourses</i> .....	193
<b><i>The Discursive Factors Informing Girls' Access to Education in Panj and Khorog</i></b> .....	<b>197</b>
<i>Gender Inequality</i> .....	197
<b><i>The Social Factors Informing Girls' Access to Education in Panj and Khorog</i></b> <b>200</b>	
<i>Beliefs and Values</i> .....	200
<b><i>The Material Factors Informing Girls' Access to Education in Panj and Khorog</i></b> .....	<b>204</b>
<i>Poverty</i> .....	204
<b><i>Conclusion</i></b> .....	<b>213</b>
<b>Chapter Eight</b> .....	<b>215</b>
<b><i>Global/Local Continuities and Discontinuities Conclusions and Recommendations</i></b> .....	<b>215</b>
<b><i>Introduction</i></b> .....	<b>215</b>
<b><i>The Research Problem</i></b> .....	<b>216</b>
<b><i>The Research Question</i></b> .....	<b>217</b>

<i>A Historical Perspective to the Theoretical Framework</i> .....	218
<i>Methodology and Analytical Framework</i> .....	219
<i>Poverty and Girls' Access to Education</i> .....	222
<i>Limitations and Recommendation for Future Directions</i> .....	224
<i>Conclusion</i> .....	225
Appendix 1 .....	248
<i>Map of Tajikistan</i> .....	248
Appendix 2 .....	249
<i>Semi-Structured Interview Questions</i> .....	249
Appendix 3.1 .....	250
<i>Information Form for Participants in English</i> .....	250
Appendix 3.2 .....	252
<i>Consent Form for Participants in English</i> .....	252
Appendix 3.3 .....	253
<i>Information Letter for Participants in Uzbek Language</i> .....	253
Appendix 3.4 .....	255
<i>Consent Form for Participants in Uzbek Language</i> .....	255
Appendix 3.5 .....	256
<i>Information Letter for Participants in Pamiri Language</i> .....	256
Appendix 3.6 .....	258
<i>Consent Form for Participants in Pamiri Language</i> .....	258
Appendix 4 .....	259
<i>Ethics Approval from the University of New England</i> .....	259

## **Declaration**

### **Statement of Originality**

I certify that the substance of this thesis has not already been submitted for any degree and is not currently being submitted for any other degree.

I certify that any help received in preparing this thesis, and all sources used, have been acknowledged in this thesis.



Amanda Holmes

Date: 31.10.2009

## **Acknowledgement**

Firstly I would like to acknowledge the support and guidance provided during the course of this research project by my supervisors Dr. Laurence Tamatea and Dr Isabel Soliman. I would particularly like to thank Laurence for his patience over the time he has been working with me, proving advice and direction through his invaluable recommendations and insight into the impact of neo-liberalism in education.

Secondly, I would like to thank my friends at Dushanbe International School and colleagues working in the world of development in Tajikistan for providing me with information, resources and ideas that enabled me to embark on this project.

Thirdly, I would also like to recognise the contribution that all the people participating in this study made, including my translators, the participants, their families and local communities, my school staff and other organisations that provided me with assistance in the location of materials, travel passes, invitations, meetings, and information that enabled me to compile the extensive resources for this thesis.

Finally, I thank my family, particularly my husband Brett and all my friends who have provided emotional and practical support that carried me through to the completion of this thesis. They encouraged me, fed me, put up with the time I spent locked in my study, and kept me going with their faith in me, without which I would not have survived. Thanks especially to Brett for his patient reference checking and proofreading skills.

## **Abstract**

This research project was conducted as part fulfillment of a Master of Education (Hons) in International Education at the University of New England. The study was conducted in two remote/rural communities in Tajikistan, one of the five Central Asian Republics. A case study, this project was carried out in two sites, Panj and Khorog, where twenty-one girls, their parents, teachers, school principals and other community members were interviewed regarding girls' access to education in Tajikistan, in light of the Education for All (EFA) initiatives implemented by Tajikistan's Ministry of Education. The data were analysed using critical discourse analysis (CDA), drawing on critical post-structuralist feminism to understand how girls are positioned by the discourses available to them. The study was grounded in research conducted by UNICEF (d'Hellencourt, 2004) concerning reasons why girls living in and around Dushanbe, the capital of Tajikistan drop out of school. The theory of modernity was used to analyse the contradiction of modernisation, as the country moves from a socialist to a capitalist system, and the apparent return to 'traditional' ways that seem to be limiting access to education for girls. As a country in transition Tajikistan is facing problems inherited from the era of Soviet rule, including a reversal in economic and social development (Basciere and Falkingham, 2009:201), which the international donor community is attempting to alleviate through policy such as that outlined in The Dakar Framework for Action. Thus, the discourse of development is influential in Tajikistan's struggle to cope with independence and is discussed using ideas drawn from the field of post-colonial theory. The use of global policies, such as the The Dakar Framework for Action is



discussed drawing on recent critique of neo-liberalism in order to explain with reference to the data the potential gap between global policy prescriptions and local ‘realities’. It is hoped that the findings of this project will help those working ‘on the ground’ to match global sourced policy with the needs of those living in Tajikistan, particularly girls whose future access to life chances arguably depend on access to education.

## Abbreviations

AD	Anno Domini
ADB	Asian Development Bank
AKF	Aga Khan Foundation
ARC	Analysis Research Consulting
BC	Before Christ
CARK	Central Asian Republics and Kazakhstan
CDA	Critical Discourse Analysis
CIA	Central Intelligence Agency
CIS	Commonwealth of Independent States
EFA	Education for All
EU	European Union
GABO	Gorno Badakhshan Autonomous Oblast (Region)
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
G8	The world's most industrialised nations: France, Germany, Italy, Japan, United Kingdom, United States, Canada and Russia
HIV/AIDS	Human Immunodeficiency Virus/ Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
ICG	International Crisis Group
ICRC	International Committee for the Red Cross
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
IDF	Ideological-discursive Formations

IMF	International Monetary Fund
IRIN	Integrated Regional Information Network
IWPR	Institute for War and Peace Reporting
KGB	The state security police (1954-91) for the former USSR
MDG	Millennium Development Goal
NGO	Non-Government Organisation
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PPP	Purchasing Power Parity
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Plan
SAP	Structural Adjustment Policy
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation
UNHCR	United Nations High Commission for Refugees
UNICEF	United Nations International Emergency Children's Fund
US	United States
USSR	United Soviet Socialist Republic
WB	World Bank
WHO	World Health Organisation
WTO	World Trade Organisation
WWII	World War Two

## List of Tables

Table 1	Discourses identified from participants in Panj	131
Table 2	Participants in Panj	134
Table 3	Discourses identified from participants in Khorog	161
Table 4	Participants in Khorog	164
Table 5	The differences and similarities between the two research sites: The context in Panj and Khorog	191
Table 6	The differences and similarities between the findings from the two research sites: The discourses in Panj and Khorog as identified by Leximancer	194
Table 7	A comparison of the discursive factors affecting access to education for girls in Panj and Khorog	198
Table 8	A comparison of the social factors affecting access to education for girls in Panj and Khorog	201
Table 9	A comparison of the material factors affecting access to education for girls in Panj and Khorog	204

## List of Figures

Figure 1	Discourse as text, interaction and context	115
Figure 2	The concepts within five main themes for Panj	129
Figure 3	The concepts within five main themes for Khorog	157

# List of Appendices

Appendix 1	Map of Tajikistan	248
Appendix 2	Semi-structured interview questions	249
Appendix 3.1	Letter of Information for participants in English	250
Appendix 3.2	Consent forms for participants in English	252
Appendix 3.3	Letter of Information for participants in Uzbek	253
Appendix 3.4	Consent forms for participants in Uzbek	255
Appendix 3.5	Letter of Information for participants in Pamiri	256
Appendix 3.6	Consent forms for participants in Pamiri	258
Appendix 4	Ethics Approval for University of New England	259