

# **Phosphorus nutrition in organic vegetable production**

**Gunasekhar Nachimuthu**  
MSc(Ag) TNAU

A thesis submitted in fulfillment of the requirements  
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

School of Environmental and Rural Science  
University of New England  
Armidale  
New South Wales  
Australia

October 2007

## **Declaration**

I certify that the substance of this thesis has not already been submitted for any other  
degree or qualification.

I certify that any help received in preparing this thesis, and all sources used, have been  
acknowledged in this thesis.



Gunasekhar Nachimuthu

17.10.2007

## Acknowledgements

I am happy to take this opportunity to acknowledge my debts of gratitude to those associated with the research presented in this thesis. First and foremost, I most happily thank my supervisors, Dr. Paul Kristiansen, Dr. Chris Guppy and Dr. Peter Lockwood.

I am most grateful to my Principal supervisor, Dr. Paul Kristiansen for his adroit guidance and constant encouragement throughout my PhD research. His successful funding application for this research, his personal support in dealing with farmers during the soil survey, his encouragement for me to present papers at conferences, along with much help during the past three years must be gratefully acknowledged. I especially thank him for his valuable statistical advice provided consistently even during holidays.

My Co-supervisor, Dr. Chris Guppy, with his sound knowledge in soil chemistry, has made my job easier during the research. Special thanks for teaching me simpler and smarter ways of executing research in soil science.

My Co-supervisor, Dr. Peter Lockwood, with his demonstrated track record of handling research scholars, has provided valuable suggestions throughout my research. Special thanks for his help during the soil survey.

Further, I must thank my supervisory team as a whole for their constructive and timely feedback starting from the experimental plan to the final write up stages. Inspite of their busy schedule they have helped me to complete this work within three years. Special thanks to all supervisors for spending time during holidays and after office hours in giving me vital feed back during the final phase of my PhD.

Thanks to Kathy King for her support in microbial analysis and proof reading of thesis. Help from Dr. Graeme Blair during isotope experiment is gratefully acknowledged. Thanks to Peter English for providing help in glasshouse trials. Thanks to Craig Birchall, Joop Van Luer and Merv Riley for arranging seeds for the research at appropriate time.

Thanks to Prof Acram Taji for her motivation and help. Help from Dr. Brian Sindel, Dr. John Stanley, Dr. Keith Kutchinson, Dr. Om Jhorar and other staff members of Agronomy and Soil Science must also be recognised.

Technical assistance from Leanne Lisle in the Plant Nutrition lab is gratefully acknowledged. Special thanks to her in providing me with a perfect working environment, besides her help in chemical analysis in the lab throughout my PhD candidature. Thanks to Mick Faint for helping in glasshouse trials and soil collection for pot trials. Thanks to Elizabeth for timely administrative help when ever required. Help from George, Gary, Dan and other technical staff of Agronomy and Soil Science in acknlowledged.

The friendship and help from all the post graduate students of Agronomy and other schools will be never forgotten. My special thanks to TNAU friends in Australia, India and overseas for their help.

Financial assistance from Rural Industries Research and Development Corporation is gratefully acknowledged. Thanks to UNE for UNERA-India scholarship without which I could not imagine doing this PhD. Also, I would like to thank Margaret Chapman and the Maurice Wyndham Memorial Trust for the Top-up scholarship which made life much easier in Armidale. Thanks to Thea Harris, Russell Glover, Chris Cooper, Shirley Fraser and other staff members of Research services for their administrative help during last three years.

Thanks to Jeff, Krish and other Safety and Security staff for providing lifts home late at night when ever I required this.

My special thanks to the vegetable farmers for permitting me to take the soil samples and providing me with farm management data.

I am grateful for the constant, unfailing inspiration and encouragement, unbounded love, affection and care, unwavering support and motivation given throughout my academic career by my father, mother and family members and I dedicate my thesis to my parents.

Lastly, I would like to offer a prayer of thanks to the Almighty for being my guiding light and for showering his blessings on me. I thank him for equipping me with the utmost strength to complete this task within the given time frame.

## **Abstract**

While the economic prospects for organic food and fibre products in the Australian and overseas markets are promising, Australian organic growers face several production constraints. Most of the investigations in Australian broad-acre (extensive arable) organic farming systems indicate a decline in soil available P over time, raising questions about the long term sustainability of organic farming in Australia. However, the sparse literature on vegetable production in NSW has indicated an excess of extractable P due to the use of manures and compost to meet N demand. With this in view, field and glasshouse investigations were carried out with the following objectives:

1. to assess the nutrient status (especially extractable soil P) of organic and conventional vegetable farms in a range of contrasting soil types and climatic conditions, to test the general validity of previous findings concerning organic vegetable production.
2. to examine the plant based P management techniques such as choice of cultivars and crop rotation using legumes to overcome P limitations in low fertility soil in order to develop effective phosphorus management strategies for vegetable growing during conversion to organic production

The first objective was examined by testing the hypothesis that the soil fertility status of organic vegetable farms was lower than adjacent conventional farms at three different vegetable growing regions in eastern Australia. Soil samples were collected from paired organic and conventional farms in each location in February 2005 and 2006. Soil chemical properties (pH, electrical conductivity, total nitrogen (N), resin P, KCl-40 sulfur, nitrate-N and ammonium-N) and microbial biomass carbon were similar between organic and conventional vegetable farms, consistent with earlier studies into organic vegetable production in Australia. Soil extractable P pools were medium to high across farm types (average Colwell P >100 mg kg<sup>-1</sup>), possibly due to the use of organic inputs to meet N requirement, e.g. composts, green manure and bulky manure, amongst these organic vegetable growers in a wide range of soil and climatic conditions. Soil biological and chemical properties were strongly influenced by crop management practices and soil type, rather than the type of farming system. Crop management in vegetable production in eastern Australia (whether organic or conventional) should also measure soil nutrient status to avoid over-fertilisation and possible off-farm environmental effects. There is also a need to find a suitable nutrient source that supplies both N and P at an optimum rate for crop growth.

While high input vegetable production systems indicate no limitation in soil extractable P or may face the risk of P accumulation, in inherently low-P soils such as those in Australia, changes in nutrient status during conversion to organic vegetable production would

depend, to a large extent, on management strategies employed and type of inputs used. One such strategy explored as part of the second objective in this thesis is genotype x environment interaction in vegetables. As P nutrition is the focus of this thesis, a minor investigation into the impact of P source on locally grown corn cultivars was conducted to measure the effect of P fertiliser (no fertiliser, (control), rock phosphate (RP), poultry manure (PM) or single superphosphate (SP)) on the growth of four organically certified sweet corn (*Zea mays* L.) cultivars (Balinese, Golden Bantam, Hawaiian and Jolly Roger) and one conventional cultivar (Hybrid 424 (Hybrid)). Phosphorus use efficiencies of applied SP were six to eight times and one to two times higher than RP and PM respectively. Organic cultivar responses relative to the Hybrid were similar in P acquisition under deficient and sufficient P levels. This experiment did not support the hypothesis that the organic cultivars investigated were better adapted for P acquisition in low P status soils. There were only marginal differences between cultivars compared with the more pronounced differences between P sources, highlighting the importance of exploring an alternate P source in organic production.

A number of published reports have indicated successful N management using leguminous cover crops and have suggested that potential exists to use leguminous cover crops to improve P cycling and availability also. A series of experiments were conducted to evaluate the potential of two winter legumes (faba beans (FB) and field peas (FP)) as part of a green manure rotation or as a harvested crop, on the P nutrition of subsequent crops. Phosphorus accumulation by FB and FP at the pod initiation and harvest stages was similar, with maximum P input of both legumes occurring after pod initiation; however this needs further verification under field conditions. The legumes accumulated 5-13 % of the applied P ( $50 \text{ kg P ha}^{-1}$  as SP), potentially supplying only 2.5 to 6.5 kg  $\text{P ha}^{-1}$  to subsequent crops. Field peas acquired similar P from PM and SP, but neither was effective in mobilising P from RP in either the acidic or alkaline soils used.

A dual labelling isotope study conducted to determine the relative contribution of  $^{33}\text{P}$  labelled FB and FP residues, and  $^{32}\text{P}$  labelled inorganic fertiliser to the P nutrition of subsequent corn also indicated FB and FP residues alone, or in combination with fertilisers, contributed up to 10% and 5% of the total P uptake by corn respectively, compared to a maximum of 54% by inorganic fertilisers. Soil solution analysis suggested that some of the P released from the residues remained in an organic form for the entire period of crop growth. The results suggest that incorporation of legume residues with P concentration higher than those observed under field conditions may still not lead to an immediate net P release to subsequent crops. This study concluded that these legumes cannot be recommended as the sole P source during conversion to organic production, but may provide supplemental P after the harvest of their economic produce along with additional P input.

While the findings our field survey confirmed the previous findings that the use of manures and compost to manage N may lead to P accumulation in vegetable farms, the glasshouse studies indicate serious implications for P cycling on organic farms of Australia where native soils are inherently low in P and suggest alternative sources of P should be integrated along with legume residues to overcome the P limitation in organic production especially in low fertility Australian farms.

A longitudinal investigation over several years of similar management on the same farms could lead to better understanding of long-term temporal changes in soil nutrient status in these intensive vegetable production systems. Once this is understood, then the research could focus on developing or identifying better organically approved P sources, designed to meet the immediate nutrient requirement of crops in low input organic systems, provided the incapability of adequate P supply using plant based P management strategies such as choice of cultivars and crop rotation.

## **Publications arising from this thesis**

### **Journals**

- Nachimuthu, G, King, K, Kristiansen, P, Lockwood, P and Guppy, C. 2007. Comparison of methods for measuring soil microbial activity using cotton strips and a respirometer. *Journal of Microbiological Methods*. 69(2): 322-329.
- Nachimuthu, G, Kristiansen, P, Lockwood, P, Guppy, C and King, K. 2007. Comparison of soil chemical and microbial properties in organic and conventional vegetable farms in eastern Australia. Paper submitted to *Agriculture, Ecosystem and Environment* and currently under revision.
- Nachimuthu, G, Kristiansen, P, Guppy, C and Lockwood, P. 2007. Short term phosphorus fertiliser source utilisation by sweet corn (*Zea mays* L.) under organic production. Paper to be submitted to *Agronomy Journal*.
- Nachimuthu, G, Guppy, C, Kristiansen, P and Lockwood, P. 2007. Evaluation of the potential of two legumes to enhance P nutrition in a following crop under organic production in Australia. Paper to be submitted to *Agronomy Journal*.
- Nachimuthu, G, Guppy, C, Kristiansen, P and Lockwood, P. 2007. Isotopic tracing of phosphorus from legume residues and fertilisers to subsequent corn in legume-corn rotation using dual labelling technique. Paper submitted to *Plant and Soil*.

### **Conference Proceedings**

- Nachimuthu, G, Kristiansen, P, Lockwood, P and Guppy, C. 2007b. Soil phosphorus status in organic and conventional vegetable farms in Southeast Queensland, Australia. In: *3rd QLIF Congress, Hohenheim, Germany, March 20-23, 2007*. pp. 40-43
- Nachimuthu, G, Kristiansen, P, Lockwood, P and Guppy, C. 2005. A Comparison of soil properties under organic and conventional farming in Australia. In: *Proceedings of the First Scientific Conference of the International Society of Organic Agriculture Research (ISOFAR), 21 - 23 September 2005*, Adelaide, South Australia. pp. 40-43

## Table of contents

<b>Phosphorus nutrition in organic vegetable production .....</b>	<b>i</b>
<b>Declaration .....</b>	<b>ii</b>
<b>Acknowledgements .....</b>	<b>iii</b>
<b>Abstract .....</b>	<b>v</b>
<b>Publications arising from this thesis .....</b>	<b>viii</b>
<b>Table of contents.....</b>	<b>ix</b>
<b>CHAPTER ONE.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>    1    General introduction .....</b>	<b>2</b>
1.1    Project overview .....	2
1.2    Thesis format .....	3
1.3    Objectives .....	4
<b>    CHAPTER TWO.....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>    2    Literature review .....</b>	<b>7</b>
2.1    Overview of organic farming around the world and Australia.....	7
2.2    Soil properties in organic and conventional farms .....	10
2.2.1    Soil biological properties.....	10
2.2.2    Soil organic carbon, cation exchange and pH .....	12
2.2.3    Nitrogen in organic and conventional farms .....	13
2.2.4    K and secondary nutrients in organic farms .....	14
2.3    Phosphorus in agriculture .....	14
2.3.1    Phosphorus in soil and plants .....	14
2.3.2    Phosphorus in organic and conventional agriculture.....	15
2.3.3    Effect of different inputs on soil phosphorus .....	16
2.3.4    Phosphorus and microbial activity .....	18
2.3.5    Phosphorus management using cover crops and cultivars .....	19
2.3.6    Methods of measuring soil P .....	20
2.3.7    Use of radioisotopes in phosphorus uptake studies .....	21
2.4    Genotype x fertiliser interaction in corn.....	22
2.4.1    Overview of corn production.....	22
2.4.2    Need to explore plant traits in organic production .....	22
2.4.3    Plant adaptation to phosphorus deficiency .....	23
2.4.4    Cultivar x phosphorus interaction in corn .....	24
2.5    Legumes and phosphorus benefits.....	25

2.5.1	Influence of cover crops on soil pH.....	26
2.5.2	Changes in soil after plant residue addition and P availability.....	26
2.5.3	Partitioning of nutrients by root and shoot in legumes.....	27
2.5.4	Organic P mineralisation rate of applied green manures.....	28
2.5.5	Effect of cover crops on P benefits in subsequent crop.....	28
2.5.6	Contribution of residues and fertilisers to crop growth and P uptake .....	29
2.6	Conclusions and research gaps.....	30
<b>CHAPTER THREE.....</b>		<b>32</b>
<b>3 Comparison of soil chemical and microbial properties in organic and conventional vegetable farms in eastern Australia .....</b>		<b>33</b>
3.1	Introduction .....	34
3.2	Materials and methods.....	36
3.2.1	Initial soil sampling and characteristics.....	36
3.2.2	Soil microbial biomass carbon .....	38
3.2.3	Chemical and textural analysis.....	39
3.2.4	Statistical analysis .....	39
3.3	Results .....	42
3.3.1	Management variables.....	42
3.3.2	Soil pH and EC .....	42
3.3.3	Microbial biomass and total carbon.....	42
3.3.4	Total N, C:N ratio, ammonium-N, nitrate-N .....	45
3.3.5	Resin P and KCl-40 sulfur.....	46
3.3.6	Exchangeable cations .....	46
3.4	Discussion.....	48
3.4.1	Nutrient status and management history of vegetable farms.....	48
3.4.2	Soil pH.....	48
3.4.3	Soil microbial biomass .....	49
3.4.4	C:N ratio and Total C .....	49
3.4.5	Soil nitrogen .....	50
3.4.6	Soil extractable P .....	50
3.4.7	Exchangeable cations .....	52
3.5	Conclusion.....	52
<b>CHAPTER FOUR .....</b>		<b>55</b>
<b>4 Short term phosphorus fertiliser source utilisation by sweet corn (<i>Zea mays L.</i>) cultivars .....</b>		<b>56</b>

4.1	Introduction .....	57
4.2	Materials and methods.....	59
4.2.1	Experimental design and setup.....	59
4.2.2	Solution sampling, biometric measurements and plant analysis.....	61
4.2.3	Statistical Analysis .....	61
4.3	Results .....	62
4.3.1	Shoot dry matter .....	62
4.3.2	Root dry matter.....	62
4.3.3	Root:shoot ratio .....	63
4.3.4	Phosphorus uptake.....	63
4.3.5	Phosphorus use efficiency .....	65
4.3.6	Nitrogen and potassium.....	66
4.3.7	Soil solution P, ammonium and nitrate concentrations .....	66
4.4	Discussion.....	69
4.5	Conclusion.....	74
<b>CHAPTER FIVE</b>	.....	<b>77</b>
<b>5</b>	<b>Evaluation of the potential of two legumes to enhance P nutrition in a following crop under organic production in Australia .....</b>	<b>78</b>
5.1	Introduction .....	79
5.2	Materials and methods.....	80
5.2.1	Experimental design and setup.....	80
5.2.2	Statistical Analysis .....	82
5.3	Results .....	83
5.3.1	Temporal changes in P accumulation.....	83
5.3.2	Plant dry matter .....	84
5.3.3	Phosphorus uptake.....	85
5.3.4	Phosphorus use efficiency .....	86
5.3.5	Nitrogen and potassium .....	86
5.3.6	Post harvest soil nutrient status .....	86
5.4	Discussion.....	88
5.4.1	Experiment 1 .....	88
5.4.2	Experiment 2 .....	89
5.5	Conclusion.....	91
<b>CHAPTER SIX</b>	.....	<b>94</b>

<b>6 Isotopic tracing of phosphorus from <math>^{33}\text{P}</math> labelled legume residues and <math>^{32}\text{P}</math> labelled fertilisers to subsequent corn in legume-corn rotation .....</b>	<b>95</b>
6.1 Introduction .....	96
6.2 Materials and methods.....	97
6.2.1 Experimental design and setup.....	97
6.2.2 Preparation of $^{33}\text{P}$ labelled legume residues .....	99
6.2.3 Residue and fertiliser application and corn growth.....	100
6.2.4 Soil solution analysis, harvest and plant analysis.....	101
6.2.5 Contribution of P sources to P in plant and soil solution .....	102
6.2.6 Statistical analysis .....	103
6.3 Results .....	104
6.3.1 Plant dry matter and P uptake.....	104
6.3.2 Phosphorus use efficiency .....	104
6.3.3 Contribution of legume residues and fertilisers to corn P uptake .....	104
6.3.4 Soil solution P dynamics .....	105
6.4 Discussion.....	107
6.5 Conclusion.....	112
<b>CHAPTER SEVEN .....</b>	<b>115</b>
<b>7 Conclusions and future research.....</b>	<b>116</b>
7.1 General conclusions.....	116
7.2 Implication for farmers.....	117
7.3 Limitations of current research and implication for researchers .....	117
<b>8 References .....</b>	<b>119</b>
<b>9 Appendix 1 Screening phosphorus responsive soils and assessing the optimal rate for screened soils through pot trials.....</b>	<b>134</b>
9.1 Screening P responsive soils .....	134
9.1.1 Materials and methods.....	134
9.1.2 Results and discussion .....	135
9.2 Study on NP interaction in vertisol.....	136
9.2.1 Materials and methods.....	136
9.2.2 Results and Discussions .....	137
9.3 Determination of optimal P rate for corn growth in three types of soil.....	137
9.3.1 Materials and methods.....	137
9.3.2 Results and discussions .....	138

<b>10 Appendix 2 Determination of optimal P rate for faba bean and field peas grown in three types of soil.....</b>	<b>140</b>
10.1.1 Materials and methods.....	140
10.1.2 Results and discussions .....	140
<b>11 Appendix 3 Additional information related to Chapter 4 and 5.....</b>	<b>142</b>
<b>12 Appendix 4 Comparison of methods for measuring soil microbial activity using cotton strips and a respirometer .....</b>	<b>145</b>
12.1 Introduction .....	145
12.2 Materials and methods.....	146
12.2.1 Initial soil sampling and characteristics.....	146
12.2.2 Cotton strip incubation .....	146
12.2.3 CSA image analysis method.....	147
12.2.4 CSA tensometer method.....	147
12.2.5 Respirometer method.....	147
12.2.6 Economics of three methods .....	148
12.2.7 Statistical analysis .....	148
12.3 Results and discussion.....	148
12.3.1 CSA methods.....	148
12.3.2 Comparison of CSA and respirometer methods.....	149
12.3.3 Comparison of CSA methods.....	150
12.3.4 Comparison of costs and practicability of each type of measurement ....	150
12.4 Conclusion.....	151
<b>13 Appendix 5 Paper published in conference proceedings of QLIF conference. Soil phosphorus status in organic and conventional vegetable farms in Southeast Queensland, Australia .....</b>	<b>158</b>
13.1 Introduction .....	158
13.2 Materials and methods.....	159
13.3 Results .....	159
13.4 Discussion.....	160
13.5 Conclusions .....	161