

'Sea-Change' and Landscape Change:

A spatial examination of trend and alternative landscape futures for the Northern Rivers Region of New South Wales, Australia



Philip Morley,
B.Sc (UniSA), M.Env.St (Adelaide)

Institute for Rural Futures
UNESCO Centre for Bioregional Resource Management

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy,
University of New England, Armidale, Australia.

July 2009

Frontispiece:

Artwork by John Grant and David Brunckhorst 1999. Used with permission.

All other photographs used in this thesis are the work and copyright of the author.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS AND DEDICATION

The Institute for Rural Futures provided significant material, financial and moral support for the duration of this thesis, and my deepest thanks go to Professor David Brunkhorst for always believing in me as my PhD meandered throughout its long journey in what seemed like an endless process. My thanks must also go to all the other IRF staff both past and current, who have made the Institute one of the best places to work.

Funding for this thesis was also generously provided by the University of New England through a UNERA scholarship and my gratitude goes to the University and in particular to Thea Harris, who was always supportive and understanding.

Spatial data was provided by the NSW National Parks and Wildlife Service, the NSW Department of Planning, NSW Department of Lands and the Australian Bureau of Statistics. Without their support in this way, this thesis would not have been possible.

Finally, I cannot adequately express in words, my most sincere and deepest gratitude to my family, who were always patient, supportive, understanding and ready with a joke whenever it was needed.

*Nurture your mind with great thoughts, for you will never
go any higher than you think. Benjamin Disraeli*

ABSTRACT

Past policies and landscape changes influence future directions. Human society tooled with powerful machines since the industrial revolution have become the major altering force on landscapes and regions. The affluence of some recent generations in developed countries adds further social expectations for change, particularly urban development in naturally aesthetic places. Internal migration to a comfortable beach side lifestyle or "hobby farm" puts enormous pressure on local government to make land available and provide services to meet these expectations. Pro-development policies and planning has therefore created landscape changes that include the loss of agricultural land, vegetation communities, and an increased demand on ecosystem services.

Rapid large scale change is affecting many rural coastal regions of Australia. Faced with enormous "Sea Change" migration induced development, urbanisation and consequent land use, many of these regions are heading towards landscapes of 'concrete jungles', less productive land and degraded ecosystems. The enormous challenge is how to balance these social drivers with ecological sustainability and agricultural production needs in the long term. Are we stuck, with no escape, on an out of control railway train heading straight for the concrete jungle, reduced resilience and future collapse (Diamond 2005)? Perhaps however, there are other directions. Are there other visions or

designs of alternative futures that are plausible to implement and provide for more adaptive sustainable pathways?

The Alternative Landscape Futures approach presented here contributes new tools, knowledge and options to guide long-term policy and planning of regions. Building on Carl Steinitz (1990, 1993) methodology and integrating past-trend future trajectory analysis with landscape ecology and design principles, a multi-scaled hybrid approach applicable to landscapes of very large regions was developed. A case study of Northern Rivers region of the state of New South Wales, Australia was used to test and demonstrate these methods. Spatial modeling of the essential elements of a very complex debate about regional development and sustainability is used to produce a number of future scenarios that geographically represent potential and plausible changes that might occur or be applied (through planned design) to regional landscapes in the medium to long term. The outcomes of visual and quantitative analysis and assessment provide a clear understanding of the future consequences of present day decisions for communities, planners and policy makers.

In all, 28 future scenario models were produced through a cellular automata algorithm and geographical information system. The main landscape design elements in these scenarios were four population levels and associated urban growth with various agricultural and environmental

restrictions to development. These elements were incorporated into the following models.

- Future trajectory – A ‘business as usual’ approach based on the continuation of the past trends of urban development.
- Environmental Priority – Future urban growth with restrictions for key habitats, landscape corridors, riparian vegetation and acid-sulphate soils.
- Agricultural Priority – Incorporating protection from urban development of the most productive and historically valuable agricultural land within the region.
- Agricultural and Environmental Priority – With two scenario variations of future urban growth encompassing the constraints of both agricultural and environmental priority.
- Coastal Protection – With two scenario variations of modeling a concerted shift of new urban development further inland and into southern parts of the region.

The future consequences of the continuation of past trends or ‘business as usual’ urban development models are also quantitatively and geographically defined. While there is no panacea, it is very clear that, either through decisive, adaptive action, or by inaction, society is deciding today where we are headed in the future.

The design and evolution of alternative landscape future scenarios for “places”, even large regions undergoing high population growth pressures

can better inform choices and decisions and help understand their consequences. By “scaling-up” McHarg’s (1967, 1992 reprint) vision to “Design by Nature” mindful of the future, the development and application of alternative future landscapes contribute to long term sustainability of broad regional landscapes.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements and Dedication	i
Abstract	ii
Table of Contents	vii
List of Figures	xi
List of Tables	xv
Chapter 1 Introduction	1
1.1 Research Aims and Questions	6
1.2 Thesis Structure	10
Chapter 2 The Future of Changing places in Changing Spaces: An Overview of the Literature	13
2.1 Spatial Planning	15
2.2 Planning in Australia	17
2.2.1 Regional Planning in Australia.....	19
2.3 Migration within Australia and the 'Sea-change' Phenomenon.....	21
2.3.1 Effects of Population Migration and Development in Coastal Areas	24
2.3.2 Local Government Concerns in Coastal Areas	27
2.4 Social-Ecological Systems and Landscape Ecology	30
2.4.1 Landscape Ecology and Bioregions	30
2.4.2 Socio-Ecological Systems.....	34
2.4.3 Systems Interactions.....	37
2.4.4 Regional Landscape Ecology and Design in Planning for the Future	39
2.5 Remote Sensing And Land Cover Spatial Analysis.....	42
2.5.1 Land Cover and Landscape Change Analysis.....	44
2.6 Modelling Future Landscapes And Land Use.....	47
2.6.1 Cellular Automata	49
2.6.2 SLUETH	51
2.7 Redesigning Future Change: Planning for Alternative Futures.....	54
2.7.1 Scenarios and Planning	54

2.7.2	Alternative Landscape Futures Scenario Design.....	59
2.7.3	Outline of Approach to Alternative Landscape Futures Techniques.....	61
2.8	Scenario Development Framework	68
Chapter 3	Northern Rivers Study Area.....	73
3.1	Description of the Northern Rivers Region	74
3.1.1	Vision of the Northern Rivers Region	78
3.1.2	Ecological Features of the Northern Rivers Region	81
3.2	Demographic Change in the Northern Rivers Region	85
3.3	Historical Land Use and Land Cover	88
3.3.1	Historical Land Use / Land Cover Change	93
3.3.2	Population Growth and Urban Area	95
3.4	Summary	98
Chapter 4	Methodology	101
4.1	Parameters in Trend Analysis and Scenario Development.....	102
4.2	Development of Future Landscape Scenarios.....	105
4.2.1	Population Growth	106
4.2.1.1	Zoning	107
4.2.1.2	Population Density.....	114
4.2.1.3	Future Population Density.....	116
4.2.1.4	Future Population Levels.....	117
4.2.2	Scenario Development	120
4.2.2.1	Placement Algorithm	120
4.2.2.2	Scenario Generation.....	122
4.3	Scenario Evaluation	123
4.4	Future Landscape Scenarios	125
4.5	Alternative Future Landscapes	125
Chapter 5	Minimal Constraint Scenario	127
5.1	Constraints	129
5.1.1	Buildable Area.....	133
5.2	Population 403839 Scenario Results	135
5.3	Population 558911 Scenario Results	141
5.4	Population 727657 Scenario Results	144

5.5	Population 955497 Scenario Results	154
5.6	Summary	162
Chapter 6 Environmental Priority Scenario		163
6.1	Constraints	166
6.1.1	Acid Sulphate Soils	166
6.1.2	Riparian Vegetation	169
6.1.3	Key Habitats and Corridors.....	171
6.1.4	Buildable Area	173
6.2	Population.....	175
6.3	Results	175
6.3.1	Change Tables	185
6.3.2	Ecosystem Change.....	187
6.4	Summary	193
Chapter 7 Agricultural Priority Scenario.....		195
7.1	Orchards.....	196
7.1.1	Orchard Expansion Calculations	197
7.1.2	Buildable Area	198
7.1.3	Results.....	200
7.2	Constraints	201
7.3	Population.....	203
7.4	Results	203
7.4.1	Change Tables	203
7.5	Summary	219
Chapter 8 Agricultural and Environmental Priority Scenario		221
8.1	Buildable Area.....	222
8.2	Population.....	226
8.2.1	Controlled Population Density	227
8.2.2	Urban Shift	229
8.3	Controlled Density Results.....	231
8.3.1	Change Tables	241
8.4	Urban Shift Results	249
8.4.1	Change Tables	258

8.5	Summary	266
Chapter 9	Coastal Protection Scenario.....	269
9.1	Population	270
9.2	Coastal Protection With Minimal Constraints Results	273
9.2.1	Change Tables.....	283
9.3	Coastal Protection with Agricultural and Environmental Protection Results.....	290
9.3.1	Change Tables.....	300
9.4	Summary	307
Chapter 10	Discussion.....	309
10.1	Review of Scenario Results	311
10.2	The Future of Agriculture in the Region	315
10.3	The Contradiction of Water Scarcity and Abundance	318
10.4	Future Development of Alternative Futures Methodology	320
10.4.1	Zoning and Population Density	320
10.4.2	Land Allotments.....	322
10.4.3	Conservation Planning and Alternative Landscape Futures	322
10.5	Alternative Futures and Community Involvement.....	324
Chapter 11	Conclusion: A Way Forward.....	327
Appendix 1	Identifying Land use / Land cover trends for Future Scenarios in the Northern Rivers Region of New South Wales	331
Appendix 2	Urban Lots Program.....	359
Appendix 3	AML SCRIPT SAMPLE	369
Bibliography	375

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1: Intended Contributions of Current PhD	9
Figure 2.1: Participants and Relations in a Planning System	16
Figure 2.2: Age Distribution of People Moving to Coastal Areas	22
Figure 2.3: Interactions of Elements in Socio-Ecological Systems to Form Resultant Landscapes	35
Figure 2.4: Cycles of Adaptive Implementation of ALF Scenarios by Local to Regional Communities and Policy Makers	62
Figure 2.5: The Steintz Alternative Landscape Futures Analytical Framework	63
Figure 2.6: Landscape Futures Conceptual Model of Trends, Scenarios and Future Trajectory	70
Figure 2.7: Generalised Procedure of Trajectories of Change and Alternative Landscape Futures Modelling	71
Figure 3.1: Study Area (white) within Northern Rivers region of NSW	75
Figure 3.2: Migration within NSW	78
Figure 3.3: National Parks Estate Within the Study Area	82
Figure 3.4: Rare, Threatened, Vulnerable or Endangered Vegetation ..	84
Figure 3.5: Change in Total Number of Persons by Census Collection District	86
Figure 3.6: Number of People with a Different Address, 5 years prior to census	87
Figure 3.7: LULC for 1980,1985,1990	91
Figure 3.8: LULC for 1995, 2000, 2004	92
Figure 3.9: Relationship Between Change in Population and Change in Number of Dwellings	97
Figure 4.1: Generalised Interactions of Landscape Elements	103
Figure 4.2: Methodology for Scenario Development	105
Figure 4.3: Change in Population by Census Collection District	110
Figure 4.4: Change in Urban Area by Census Collection District	111
Figure 4.5: Zoning of Northern Rivers Region Used in Scenario Modelling	112
Figure 4.6: Spatial Area (ha) Per Person	115
Figure 4.7: Estimated Future Urban Area Per Person (ha)	116
Figure 5.1: Major Roads Constraint	130

Figure 5.2: Areas with a Slope Greater Than 25%	131
Figure 5.3: State Forests and the National Parks And Wildlife Estate	132
Figure 5.4: Buildable Area Minimal Constraints Scenario	134
Figure 5.5: Regional LULC Change with Population 403839	136
Figure 5.6: Regional LULC Change with Population 403839, Far North Coast Portion	137
Figure 5.7: Regional LULC Change with Population 558911	142
Figure 5.8: Regional LULC Change with Population 558911, Far North Coast Portion	143
Figure 5.9: Regional LULC Change with Population 727657	149
Figure 5.10: Regional LULC Change with Population 727657, Far North Coast Portion	150
Figure 5.11: Regional LULC Change with Population 955497	156
Figure 5.12: Regional LULC Change with Population 955497, Far North Coast Portion	157
Figure 6.1: Areas with a high risk of having Acid-Sulphate Soils.....	168
Figure 6.2: Riparian Vegetation, RAMSAR and Important Wetlands	170
Figure 6.3: Key Habitat and Corridors	172
Figure 6.4: Buildable Area Environmental Priority Scenario	174
Figure 6.5: Environmental Priority LULC for Population 403839	177
Figure 6.6: Environmental Priority LULC for Population 403839, Far North Coast Portion	178
Figure 6.7: Environmental Priority LULC for Population 558911	179
Figure 6.8: Environmental Priority LULC for Population 558911, Far North Coast Portion	180
Figure 6.9: Environmental Priority LULC for Population 727657	181
Figure 6.10: Environmental Priority LULC for Population 727657, Far North Coast Portion	182
Figure 6.11: Environmental Priority LULC for Population 955497, Far North Coast Portion	183
Figure 6.12: Environmental Priority LULC for Population 955497, Far North Coast Portion	184
Figure 7.1: Buildable Area for Growth of Orchards	199
Figure 7.2: Projected Orchards Merged with LULC 2004	200
Figure 7.3: Protected Agricultural Land Constraint.....	202
Figure 7.4: Agricultural Priority Scenario For Population 403839.....	204

Figure 7.5: Agricultural Priority Scenario For Population 403839, Far North Coast Portion.....	205
Figure 7.6: Agricultural Priority Scenario For Population 558911	206
Figure 7.7: Agricultural Priority Scenario For Population 558911, Far North Coast Portion.....	207
Figure 7.8: Agricultural Priority Scenario For Population 727657	208
Figure 7.9: Agricultural Priority Scenario For Population 727657, Far North Coast Portion.....	209
Figure 7.10: Agricultural Priority Scenario For Population 955497	210
Figure 7.11: Agricultural Priority Scenario For Population 955497, Far North Coast Portion.....	211
Figure 8.1: Buildable Area for Agricultural and Environmental Priority Scenarios.....	224
Figure 8.2: Minimal constraints Buildable Area	225
Figure 8.3: Agriculture and Environment Priority Controlled Density Land Use Population 403839	233
Figure 8.4: Agriculture and Environment Priority Controlled Density Land Use Population 403839, Far North Coast Portion	234
Figure 8.5: Agriculture and Environment Priority Controlled Density Land Use Population 558911	235
Figure 8.6: Agriculture and Environment Priority Controlled Density Land Use Population 55891, far North Coast Portion	236
Figure 8.7: Agriculture and Environment Priority Controlled Density Land Use Population 727657	237
Figure 8.8: Agriculture and Environment Priority Controlled Density Land Use Population 727657, Far North Coast Portion	238
Figure 8.9: Agriculture and Environment Priority Controlled Density Land Use Population 955497	239
Figure 8.10: Agriculture and environment priority controlled density land use figure population 955497, Far North Coast Portion	240
Figure 8.11: Agriculture and Environment Priority Urban Shift Land Use Population 403839	250
Figure 8.12 Agriculture and Environment Priority Urban Shift Land Use Population 403839, Far North Coast portion	251
Figure 8.13: Agriculture and Environment Priority Urban Shift Population 558911	252
Figure 8.14: Agriculture and Environment Priority Urban Shift Population 558911, Far North Coast Portion	253

Figure 8.15: Agriculture and Environment Priority Urban Shift Population 727657	254
Figure 8.16: Agriculture and Environment Priority Urban Shift Population 727657, Far North Coast portion	255
Figure 8.17: Agriculture and Environment Priority Urban Shift Population 955497	256
Figure 8.18: Agriculture and Environment Priority Urban Shift Population 955497, Far North Coast portion	257
Figure 9.1: Coastal Protection with Minimal Constraints Population 403839..	275
Figure 9.2: Coastal Protection with Minimal Constraints Population 403839, Far North Coast Portion	276
Figure 9.3: Coastal Protection with Minimal Constraints Population 558911 ..	277
Figure 9.4: Coastal Protection with Minimal Constraints Population 558911, Far North Coast Portion	278
Figure 9.5: Coastal Protection with Minimal Constraints Population 727657 ..	279
Figure 9.6: Coastal Protection with Minimal Constraints Population 727657, Far North Coast portion.....	280
Figure 9.7: Coastal Protection with Minimal Constraints Population 955497 ..	281
Figure 9.8: Coastal Protection with Minimal Constraints Population 955497, Far North Coast Portion	282
Figure 9.9: Coastal Protection with Population 403839	292
Figure 9.10: Coastal Protection with Population 403839, Far North Coast Portion	293
Figure 9.11: Coastal Protection with Population 558911	294
Figure 9.12: Coastal Protection with Population 558911, Far North Coast Portion	295
Figure 9.13: Coastal Protection with Population 727657	296
Figure 9.14: Coastal Protection with Population 727657, Far North Coast Portion	297
Figure 9.15: Coastal Protection with Population 955497	298
Figure 9.16: Coastal Protection with Population 955497, Far North Coast Portion	299
Figure 10.1 Reduced Fragmentation and Impact of Coastal Areas.....	315

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1 Mapped Cover Type Descriptions.....	90
Table 3.2 Area (hectares) For Each Cover Type by Time Period	94
Table 3.3 Change in Urban Area and Population by Decade.....	96
Table 4.1 List of Data Used, Sources, Processing and Use in Scenarios	104
Table 4.2 Population and Urban Area by Zone	113
Table 4.3 Spatial Area (ha) per Person	115
Table 4.4 Estimated Future Urban Area per Person (ha)	116
Table 4.5 Linear Growth of Population by Zone	117
Table 4.6 Exponential Population Growth by Zone.....	118
Table 4.7 Scenarios Contained in Each Chapter	126
Table 5.1: Population 403839	135
Table 5.2: Land Use Change for Population 403839	138
Table 5.3: Change in Vegetation Types for Population 403839	139
Table 5.4: Population 558911	141
Table 5.5: Land Use Change for Population 558911	144
Table 5.6: Change in Vegetation Types for Population 558911	145
Table 5.7: Population 727657	147
Table 5.8: Land Use Change for Population 727657	151
Table 5.9: Change in Vegetation Types for Population 727657	152
Table 5.10: Population 955497	155
Table 5.11: Land Use Change for Population 955497	158
Table 5.12: Change in Vegetation Types for Population 955497	159
Table 6.1 Land Use Change for Environmental Priority Scenarios	185
Table 6.2 Land Use Change by Ecosystem Type for Environmental Priority Scenarios	187
Table 7.1: Growth of Orchards (25 x 25M cells)	198
Table 7.2: Land Use Change for Projected Orchards.....	201
Table 7.3: Land Use Change for Agricultural Priority Scenario	212
Table 7.4: Land Use Change by Ecosystem Type for Agricultural Priority Scenarios	214
Table 8.1: Agriculture and Environment Priority Controlled Density Population Projections.....	228

Table 8.2: Agriculture and Environment Priority Urban Shift Population Projections.....	230
Table 8.3: Land Use Change by Class for Agricultural and Environmental Priority Controlled Density Scenarios	241
Table 8.4: Land Use Change By Vegetation Type for Agricultural and Environmental Priority Controlled Density Scenarios	243
Table 8.5: Land Use Change by Class for Agriculture and Environmental Priority urban shift scenarios	258
Table 8.6: Land Use Change by Vegetation Type for Urban Shift Scenario ...	260
Table 9.1: Population calculations for Coastal Protection Scenarios	271
Table 9.2: Population and Urban Cell Allocation For Coastal Protection Scenarios.....	272
Table 9.3: Land Use Change for Coastal Protection with Minimal Constraints Scenarios	283
Table 9.4: Land Use Change by Vegetation Type for Coastal Protection Minimal Constraints Scenarios	285
Table 9.3: Land Use Change for Coastal Protection Agricultural and Environmental Protection Scenarios.....	300
Table 9.6: Land Use Change by Vegetation Type for Coastal Protection Agricultural and Environmental Protection Scenarios	302