

Acts of Compassion: Consoling Grief in the Art, Literature, and Music of Early Humanist Padua

Jason Stoessel*

Against the backdrop of the regulated restraint of the public displays of extreme emotion by civic authorities in late medieval Italian society, early Paduan humanists Giovanni Conversini, Pier Paolo Vergerio, and Francesco Zabarella cultivated compassion for the suffering of friends through acts of consolation. By sharing signs of suffering within a framework of classicized literary conventions, this bid for compassion signals an intervention in an older emotional regime by a community of early humanists in Padua in league with a pan-Italian network of prominent literary, social, and political figures. This new emotional regime also extends to the music of Johannes Ciconia and Antonio Zacara da Teramo. Both composers invite compassion from their listeners through analogous signs of suffering in their settings of consolatory texts. In the decades after Ciconia's death, a community of humanists and musicians transformed this emotional legacy into a collection of musical commemorations for some of Padua's greatest sons and the singers of their songs.

In this article, I analyse evidence of past artistic, literary, and musical acts that express fellow feeling and care towards the depicted, narrated, or sung suffering subject. Such an approach investigates how signs of suffering in works of art, literature, and music invite compassion—that is, feelings of ‘suffering with’—as an emotional response in the viewer, reader, and listener, thereby offering solace to anxious hearts through the opportunity of emotional communion with the subject.¹ I view consolatory acts through the lens of grief, an all-too-

* I wish to offer my sincere thanks to Dr Bethany Hamblen, Archives and Record Manager of Balliol College and the Bodleian Library, Oxford, for providing digital images of Oxford, Balliol College Library, MS 288. I express my deep gratitude to Dr Diana G. Barnes for her careful reading of the typescript of this article, suggested improvements, and encouragement, and Dr Giulia Torello-Hill for kindly assisting with the translation that appears in the Appendix. I also thank the anonymous reviewers of this article for their comments and feedback.

¹ See the recent exploration of the etymology of compassion as ‘suffering with’, in Diana G. Barnes and Delia Falconer, ‘Compassion, a Timely Feeling’, *Emotions: History, Culture, Society*, 4.1 (2020), 1–18 (pp. 3–4). See also Sarah McNamer, *Affective Meditation and the Invention of Medieval Compassion* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2010), p. 11; McNamer provides a useful cross-cultural comparison, which illustrates how early European compassion differs from cognates of ‘compassion’ in the world’s cultures. Marjorie Garber’s brief history of the terms ‘compassion’, ‘sympathy’, and ‘empathy’ is less useful, since, like her editor Lauren Berlant, she generalizes in her claim that compassion (and to the same extent sympathy) includes an element of condescension, especially when compassion

common form of human suffering that invites or demands the kindness of a compassionate act of consolation. My focus is emotional communities of artists, early humanists, and musicians in late medieval Padua who used consolatory acts to cultivate compassion. My article extends in its chronological scope from the death of Francesco Petrararch (1304–1374) to the third decade of the fifteenth century. Against the backdrop of a regime of emotional restraint enforced by civic authorities of Italian communes, early humanists at Padua, including Giovanni Conversini (1343–1408), Francesco Zabarella (1360–1417), and Pier Paolo Vergerio (1380–1444), cultivate compassion for the suffering of the mourner in their consolatory writings and public oratory. Their consolatory acts offer insights into the compassion of these men for grieving friends and fellow Paduans in contrast to the prevailing hegemonic emotional regime.² Yet, like depictions of grief in Padua's art, their writings also reveal gendered responses to grief as part of what must be regarded as an emotional community of humanists that extended beyond Padua to a network of friendships with other Italian humanists and like-minded individuals.

In parallel with these developments, musical composition in Padua also participates in acts of consolation. The music of the composer Johannes Ciconia (c. 1370–1412), who was active in Padua from 1401, reveals a fresh concern for musical expression in which the emotive capacity of music is explored in unprecedented and poignant ways.³ In this respect, Ciconia's music represents a sharpening of emotional effect already pioneered by another composer, Antonio Zacara da Teramo (d. 1413–1416), whose music was evidently known at Padua and with whom Ciconia probably maintained an association developed earlier in his career at Rome. I contend that Ciconia provided solace for grieving Paduans in difficult times, and that in the decades after his death, a community of musicians, who remained close to humanist trends in the Veneto, assembled Ciconia's musical legacy to memorialize the achievements of Padua's greatest sons.

is exercised between agents of unequal power or status; see Marjorie Garber, 'Compassion', in *Compassion: The Culture and Politics of an Emotion*, ed. by Lauren Berlant (New York: Routledge, 2004), pp. 15–27 (p. 20).

² On emotional regimes, see William M. Reddy, *The Navigation of Feeling: A Framework for the History of Emotions* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004).

³ In this respect, this article addresses a gap in current histories of premodern emotion and music. Spitzer, for example, identifies four 'flavours' of premodern musical emotion in which there is a two-century lacuna between thirteenth-century 'Thomistic descents' and sixteenth-century humanism; see Michael Spitzer, 'Four Flavours of Pre-Modern Emotion', in *The Routledge Handbook of Musical Signification*, ed. by Esti Steinberg and William P. Dougherty (New York: Routledge, 2020), pp. 267–76. Also see Michael Spitzer, *A History of Emotion in Western Music: A Thousand Years from Chant to Pop* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2020); and Denis Collins and Jennifer Nevile, 'Music and Dance', in *A Cultural History of the Emotions in the Late Medieval, Reformation, and Renaissance Age*, ed. by Andrew Lynch and Susan Broomhall (London: Bloomsbury, 2019), iii, 49–68.

I. Emotional Regimes in Late Medieval Italy

At the centre of my enquiry is the seeming contradiction in late medieval Italian cities like Padua between a growing interest in more overt expressions of emotions in art, music, and words, and regimes of emotional restraint. That dualism, arising out of both a concern of authorities to maintain civic order by prohibiting contagious expressions of extreme emotion, and also humanists' novel exploration of their shared, subjective experiences, points to different levels of engagement with civic morality and philosophy. On one level, early humanists like Petrarch reinforce and amplify regimes of emotional restraint by leaning on classical and early Christian moral thought. Early humanism was influenced by several of the themes that arose in Christian literature, and by the revival of classical thought, especially Stoicism (which was nonetheless present in forms of early Christian thought) and Peripatetic philosophy.⁴

The permeation of Aristotelian philosophy into the medieval theorization of emotions can already be witnessed in Thomas Aquinas's lengthy treatment of sorrow (*tristitia*) in his influential *Summa Theologiae*, including its remedy through consolation.⁵ For Aquinas, *tristitia* is rational sorrow, while *dolor* is a general, irrational, or immediate suffering. Such fine distinctions are not always maintained outside the philosophical tradition: readers of Aquinas must accept a certain latitude of language, as illustrated by his reference to passages in the *Confessions* in which Saint Augustine grieves (*dolebat*) over the death of a friend.⁶

Aquinas's discussion of five remedies for sorrow is useful for backgrounding humanist discourse against earlier scholastic thought on the relationship between sorrow and compassion.⁷ At first, we might be struck by the common cure for sorrow in each remedy: pleasure (*delectatio*). While it is hard to accept that pleasure mitigates or lessens even the most extreme forms of sorrow (including grief), Aquinas describes the capacity of compassion to ease the burden of suffering precisely in these terms. Drawing on Aristotle's *Nicomachean Ethics*, Aquinas explains the third remedy for sorrow:

When a person's friends are sorrowful for him (*contristantur ei*), he perceives that he is loved by them. This is pleasurable. [...] Whence, since every pleasure mitigates sorrow [...] it follows that a compassionate friend (*amicus condolens*) mitigates sorrow.⁸

⁴ For an excellent introduction to the various philosophical foundations of late medieval conceptualisations of emotions, see Simo Knuuttila, *Emotions in Ancient and Medieval Philosophy* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004).

⁵ Robert Miner, *Thomas Aquinas on the Passions: A Study of Summa Theologiae 1a2 22–48* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), pp. 188–211.

⁶ Aquinas, *Summa Theologiae*, 1a2, 38.2.co.

⁷ Miner, *Thomas Aquinas*, pp. 203–07.

⁸ *Summa Theologiae*, 1a2, 38.3.co; translation adapted from Miner, *Thomas Aquinas*, p. 205.

The agency of friendship and fellow feeling in this statement is striking. At the same time, it is also difficult in the context of early humanism to ignore Aquinas's fourth remedy for sorrow: the contemplation of truth and the greatest pleasure that it brings to the contemplative intellect. In cases when the very nature of truth is questioned in humanist discourse, the potential to console an equally strong-minded grieving friend is contested in ways that Aquinas himself, within his fusion of Aristotelian reason and Christian (especially Augustinian) theology, does not anticipate. The next generation of humanists instead transplants Petrarch's subjectivity, found throughout their predecessor's poetry and letters, into a new sphere of consolatory literature, which includes letters, philosophical tracts, and epideictic oratory.⁹ This development occurs in the context of an emergent fellowship of humanists at the end of the fourteenth century in centres like Florence, Milan, and Padua.

Christian friendship is central to expressions of compassion in early humanist consolation literature.¹⁰ While early humanists might seem the intellectual elites of their societies, it is worth recalling their often humble origins and erstwhile attainment of cultural capital and credibility occurred in societies still predicated upon power structures maintained through religious hierarchy, title, familial wealth, and patron–client allegiances. For these new men, compassion operated within a sense of community arising from a synthesis of classical models of friendship with Christian notions of universal friendship, an ideal that arose earlier in Christian society in parallel and in communion with Hellenistic Jewish concepts of friendship in late antiquity.¹¹ By examining compassionate acts of consolation to assuage the grief of friends and associates, I hope to shed light on at least one facet of what Barbara Rosenwein terms an 'emotional community'.¹² The emotional community of early humanists at Padua was bound by the contradictions of the restraint of outward raw emotional expression (weeping, wailing, and so on) while at the same time desiring to push language, art, and music in new directions inspired by the rhetorical formalism of classical modes of expression.¹³

⁹ On Petrarch's subjectivity in his *Canzoniere* and *Familiars*, see respectively John Freccero, 'The Fig Tree and the Laurel: Petrarch's Poetics', in *Petrarch*, ed. by Harold Bloom (New York: Chelsea House, 1989), pp. 43–55; and Unn Falkeid, 'Petrarch, Mont Ventoux and the Modern Self', *Forum Italicum: A Journal of Italian Studies*, 43 (2009), 5–28.

¹⁰ George W. McClure, *Sorrow and Consolation in Italian Humanism* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1991), pp. 75–80.

¹¹ On the latter, see Françoise Mirguet, *An Early History of Compassion: Emotion and Imagination in Hellenistic Judaism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2017).

¹² Barbara H. Rosenwein, *Emotional Communities in the Early Middle Ages* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2006), pp. 24–25.

¹³ While similar lay confraternities in Florence and Bologna might provide ample evidence for emotional regimes, the scope of this article, focused on a community of humanists and musicians, and the very different development of confraternities in Padua, especially their absence from the patronage of the significant public artworks discussed in this article, recommends against such an approach. On Paduan confraternities, see Giuseppina De Sandre Gasparini, *Statuti di confraternite religiose di Padova nel medio evo: Testi, studio introduttivo e cenni storici* (Padova: Istituto per la storia ecclesiastica padovana, 1974); Giuseppina De

The supplanting of outward signs of extreme emotional expression by stylized but by no means stereotyped gestures points to a process in which novel homosocial conventions in early humanism allow its participants to employ signs of suffering in their literary and musical works without the risk of raising the eyebrows (and exercising the bailiffs) of late medieval Italian civic society. Petrarch, Conversini, and Vergerio all admit that there is a place for weeping in times of grief. Yet, as men, they seek to constrain the outward signs of their suffering towards a set of shared conventions. To weep excessively and without restraint was still considered effeminate in their view. The sharing of cultivated signs of suffering, whether literary or musical, emerges at the end of the fourteenth century as a newly permissible mode of emotional expression, especially in acts of consolation. Through this framework, we might better understand how communities of early humanists developed novel emotional regimes in the confines of homosocial conventions inspired by models from the classical past. Compassion was nurtured in these emotional communities through sophisticated acts of consolation and a shared system of signs for communicating suffering. The recognition of such signs by the members of a community is a matter of culture. In the cases of ‘musical signs’ examined in this article, humanists were imbued with shared knowledge and experience to facilitate their shared recognition of literary and musical ‘codes’. As Jacques Attali explains:

Music is inscribed between noise and silence, in the space of the social codification it reveals. Every code of music is rooted in the ideologies and technologies of its age, and at the same time produces them. If it is deceptive to conceptualize a succession of musical codes corresponding to a succession of economic and political relations, it is because time traverses music and music gives meaning to time.¹⁴

The concept of *emotives* provides the theoretical mechanism by which to analyse early humanist consolation as an act of compassion. Reddy defines emotives as words, speech, and gestures that have the potential to move listeners, readers, and so on emotionally.¹⁵ In this sense, emotives can represent a linguistic field, and

Sandre Gasparini, ‘Lineamenti e vicende della Confraternita di S. Antonio di Padova (secoli XIV e XV)’, in *Liturgia pietà e ministeri al Santo di Padova fra il XIII e il XX secolo*, ed. by Antonino Poppi (Vicenza: Neri Pozza, 1978), pp. 217–43; Beatrice Varini, ‘Spunti per una indagine sull’economia della Confraternita (anni 1484–1488)’, in *Liturgia pietà e ministeri al Santo di Padova fra il XIII e il XX secolo*, ed. by Poppi, pp. 235–43; and Giuseppina De Sandre Gasparini, ‘Il movimento delle confraternite nell’area Veneta’, in *Le Mouvement confraternel au Moyen Âge. France, Italie, Suisse. Actes de la table ronde de Lausanne (9–11 Mai 1985)* (Rome: École Française de Rome, 1987), pp. 361–94. Quite distinct from lay confraternities, the confraternity of priests and clerics (*fratelea cappelloranorum*) in Padua developed over several centuries from what can only be described as a corporate entity to an association concerned with the care of souls; see Antonio Rigon, *Clero e Città: ‘Fratalea cappelloranorum’, parroci, cura d’anime in Padova dal XII al XV secolo* (Padua: Istituto per la storia ecclesiastica padovana, 1988).

¹⁴ Jacques Attali, *Noise: The Political Economy of Music*, trans. by Brian Massumi (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1985), p. 19.

¹⁵ Reddy, *The Navigation of Feeling*, p. 104.

as such, are ‘best understood as imprecise designations for a cluster of mental and somatic events exhibiting family resemblances’.¹⁶ But they can also be non-verbal signs and gestures, especially in the realm of art and music. As will be demonstrated below, the concept of emotives is also useful for describing musical effects, which present as analogues to figures of speech in this period, especially when brought into coordination with emotional words and sentiments in poetry set to music.¹⁷

The consequences of this approach are useful for the history of compassion. I do not dispute that compassion is predominantly constructed as a feminine emotion in most early European cultures. Rather, the writings, orations, and sung poetry of early humanists and their associates, as performative scripts of consolation,¹⁸ signal a new trend in the masculine performance of compassion. The role of Franciscan affective meditation can by no means be dismissed in the context of Padua, home to the relics and cult of the order’s second most venerated male saint, and in light of the relations between the religious order and prominent humanists. Yet, the acts of consolation by these men tread a thin line between emotional restraint and emotive rhetorical expression. They signal a new phase in the European history of compassion. This novelty is one of the signs of the early maturity of humanism in Italy, which remained dominant in the following centuries.

II. Grief and Compassion in Trecento Paduan Art

A new arrival in Padua around the year 1400 would have marvelled at the splendour of the city’s architecture and art: its impressive palaces, cathedral, churches, and oratories, most of which had been freshly decorated with the finest frescoes by leading artists of the day. The imagery that adorned the walls of medieval buildings was not only decorative. It operated iconically, especially in the context of religious settings, to evoke the presence of divinity and sanctity that was a part of medieval religious experience.¹⁹ Artists also wove civic identity into the fabric of these paintings, entangling biblical and hagiographic pasts with the present. Today, they stand as testaments to the ideas, ideals, and communities of feeling in the late medieval city.

Beginning with artists like Giotto di Bondone (c. 1267–1337), Trecento religious painters sought to represent the emotions of subjects to move the viewer emotionally. A well-known development in European Christian art was the shift from depicting the crucified Christ as a triumphant wide-eyed figure to a dead Jesus, eyes closed, and body battered, bruised, and disfigured. This approach was

¹⁶ McNamer, *Affective Meditation*, p. 11.

¹⁷ Jason Stoessel, ‘*Con lagreme bagnandome el viso*: Mourning and Music in Late Medieval Padua’, *Plainsong and Medieval Music*, 24 (2015), 71–89.

¹⁸ McNamer, *Affective Meditation*, pp. 12–13.

¹⁹ Hans Belting, *Likeness and Presence: A History of the Image before the Era of Art*, trans. by Edmund Jephcott (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994).

closely related to the rise of affective theological meditation that emphasized the suffering of Christ as part of a strategy of compassionate engagement to encourage the faithful to repent and to embrace penitence in recognition of His sacrifice.²⁰

Behavioural conventions of contemporary Italian civic society provide a background to these affective novelties. Carol Lansing, for example, analyses the restraint and gendering of emotions, including grief, in late medieval Italy. From the thirteenth century, the laws of Italian communes were reformed to regulate male grief and to prevent excessive emotional displays that authorities believed endangered civic order. Among the several examples from Trecento art, Giotto's *Lamentation of Christ* (Arena Chapel, Padua, c. 1305–06) represents extremes of gendered grief: Mary caresses her dead son's head, Mary Magdalene one of his feet, both weeping; the young John sweeps his head and arms back in a stylized gesture of despair, otherwise known as the Hippolytus gesture; even the angels weep and tear at their hair or clasp their faces in grief.²¹ Yet, the older Joseph of Arimathea and another bearded male, possibly St Peter, stand composed, seemingly unmoved by the events before them. Women grieve openly, while young men express little more than despair.

In late fourteenth-century Padua, an even sharper divide emerges in the gendering of grief in painting. Completed around 1397 in the Oratorio di San Michele, Jacopo da Verona's *Funeral of the Virgin* reveals a contrasting approach to representing grief in art (Figure 1). Most of the disciples are composed and prayerful with nothing more than a furrowed brow or downcast eyes; one clasps his cheeks, another covers his eyes and a third wipes tears away from his eyes; the figure in the middle, probably St Peter, reads the last rites from a book. The overall impression is the quiet sadness of male participants, not the raging grief of Giotto's *Lamentation*.

Altichiero da Zevio completed several religious cycles under the patronage of the Lupi family between 1376 and 1384 in Padua. The first, along the back wall of the Chapel of San Giacomo in the Basilica of San Antonio, consists of a large crucifixion scene.²² Altichiero painted a second crucifixion at the opposite end of the Oratorio di San Giorgio, found to the right side of the piazza facing the basilica. This second crucifixion scene is more compact, spanned on either wall of the oratory by hagiographic cycles for St George and St Lucy. In the lower left quarter of the San Giorgio crucifixion, below a gaunt, bleeding, and lifeless crucified Christ, Mary has fainted with grief, held up by Mary Magdalene;

²⁰ McNamer, *Affective Meditation*, p. 2.

²¹ Carol Lansing, *Passion and Order: Restraint of Grief in the Medieval Italian Communes* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2008), p. 141; Heather Graham, 'Compassionate Suffering: Somatic Selfhood and Gendered Affect in Italian Lamentation Imagery', in *Visualizing Sensuous Suffering and Affective Pain in Early Modern Europe and the Spanish Americas*, ed. by Heather Graham and Lauren G. Kilroy-Ewbank (Leiden: Brill, 2017), pp. 82–115.

²² On the commissioning of the chapel, see Louise Bourdua, *Franciscans and Art Patronage in Late Medieval Italy* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), pp. 109–20.



Figure 1.

Jacopo da Verona, *The Funeral of the Virgin* (c. 1397), detail.
Oratorio di San Michele, Padua.

(Photograph: J. Stoessel)

John gestures as if to offer consolation to the group, while most of the other men (Roman soldiers and officials) look on with little expression shown on their faces.

Altichiero inserted portraits of significant contemporary figures into his San Giacomo and San Giorgio cycles, including his patrons, two Carraresi lords of Padua, and several noted humanists. In the San Giacomo cycle, a portrait of Petrarch appears on the left wall in a scene known as the Council of King Ramiro or the Dream of Charlemagne.²³ In the Oratory, Petrarch stands with his amanuensis, Lombardo della Seta, as witnesses to St George's baptism of the King of Cyrene. Another scene in the Oratory, the Funeral of St Lucy, further perpetuates gender stereotypes and includes portraits of several contemporary intellectuals and potentates. One of them, in the foreground with a red head-covering exposing his ears, is possibly another Paduan humanist, Giovanni Dondi (Figure 2).²⁴

Bonifacio Lupi, with his wife Caterina and Raimondino Lupi, commissioned the Chapel of San Giacomo and Oratorio di San Giorgio as memorials, providing generous endowments to ensure the singing of masses for their souls.²⁵ Lombardo

²³ The debate over the interpretation of this fresco is encapsulated in Bourdua, *Franciscans and Art Patronage*, p. 119.

²⁴ Giovanni Mardersteig, 'I ritratti del Petrarca e dei suoi amici a Padova', *Italia Medioevale e Umanistica*, 17 (1974), 251–80 (p. 277).

²⁵ On the commission and painting of the chapel and oratory, see Diana Norman, 'Those Who Pay, Those Who Pray and Those Who Paint: Two Funerary Chapels', in *Siena, Florence and Padua: Art, Society and Religion 1280–1400*, ed. by Diana Norman (New Haven and London:



Figure 2.

Altichiero da Zevio, *Funeral of St Lucy* (c. 1378–c. 1384). Oratorio di San Giorgio, Padua.
(Photograph: The Picture Art Collection / Alamy Stock Photo)

della Seta played a prominent role in supervising the San Giacomo project during the regular absences of Bonifacio and his devoted Caterina.²⁶ Neither the friars nor the lay confraternity of San Antonio had any agency in the commission of the chapel and the supervision of its works. Rather, Lombardo, possibly under the instructions of Bonifacio or Caterina, strove to reinforce their connections to the ruling Carrara family and Padua's humanists.²⁷ The intrusion of humanist portraits into the baptism scene in the Oratorio di San Giorgio points to the same political and intellectual sympathies, and again to the possible instrumentality of Lombardo della Seta in this project. A similar situation obtains in the case of Jacopo da Verona's cycle in the Oratorio di San Michele. Pietro de' Bovi, a well-placed member of the Carrara court, was responsible for its commission.²⁸ Again, portraits of Francesco il Vecchio da Carrara, and possibly Bovi himself, reveal an intent to memorialize Padua's recent past and the patronage of those still living whose thoughts had turned to their own fate. These commemorative monuments represent the cultural and civic interests of one of Padua's prominent families and their entangled relationship with the city's early humanists.²⁹

When Altichiero completed his frescoes, Petrarch was but a memory. Dondi had died just a year after the estimated date of completion of the San Giorgio cycle. Lombardo della Seta was no more by 1390. Their depiction among those still living refers to earlier times, vividly preserving their memory among the living.³⁰ The commemoration of Padua's humanists in monumental art marks the completion of a teleology that arises from consolation, often through eulogy for the deceased, and became an embedded part of the city's civic identity maintained to the present day.

Yale University in association with The Open University, 1995), pp. 169–93 (pp. 179–91); and Bourdua, *Franciscans and Art Patronage*, pp. 108–31.

²⁶ Bourdua, *Franciscans and Art Patronage*, p. 121.

²⁷ On Carrara patronage, see Margaret Plant, 'Patronage in the Circle of the Carrara Family: Padua, 1337–1405', in *Patronage, Art, and Society in Renaissance Italy*, ed. by F. W. Kent, Patricia Simons, and J. C. Eade (Canberra and Oxford: Humanities Research Centre – Clarendon Press, 1987), pp. 177–99. On Caterina's prolonged relationship with Il Santo after Bonifacio's death, and her successful wish to be entombed in the Chapel of San Giacomo, see Louise Bourdua, "'Stand by Your Man": Caterina Lupi, Wife of Bonifacio. Artistic Patronage Beyond the Deathbed in Late Medieval Padua', in *Venice and the Veneto during the Renaissance: The Legacy of Benjamin Kohl*, ed. by Michael Knapton, John Easton Law, and Alison A. Smith (Florence: Firenze University Press, 2014), pp. 405–28.

²⁸ F. Flores D'Arcais, 'Jacopo da Verona e la decorazione della cappella Bovi in San Michele a Padova', *Arte Veneta*, 27 (1973), 9–24; Chiara Duò, 'Nuovi contributi sugli affreschi della Cappella Bovi a San Michele', *Padova e il suo territorio*, 149 (2011), 17–22.

²⁹ Painted and sculpted portraits of Enrico Scrovegni in the Arena Chapel, Padua, provide an early precedent to the subsequent chapels discussed here; see Norman, 'Those Who Pay', p. 192.

³⁰ This imagery also functions at the level of the *ars memorativa*, particularly through its emplacement of strongly affective scenery within an architectural framework; see Anne Dunlop, 'Allegory, Painting and Petrarch', *Word & Image*, 24 (2008), 77–91 (pp. 85–86).

III. *Consolatio* in Early Humanist Literature at Padua

The intrusion of humanists into the affective schemata of Padua's late fourteenth-century art invites further consideration of their role in shaping emotional restraint while also exercising themselves in compassionate responses to the grief of members of their extended emotional community.³¹ Petrarch's *Remedies for Fortune Fair and Foul*, for example, relies on a Stoic therapeutic approach to explore the sudden death of an infant son.³² In his letters, Petrarch also consoles his correspondents for the unexpected or violent deaths of family or friends, often in strongly gendered language. He chides one addressee, who is distressed by the knowledge that a good friend's corpse was tossed into the sea, for clinging to the sentiments of an old woman, rather than being manly and philosophical about the futility of holding on to such ideas. Elsewhere Petrarch observes that although tears are warranted for the death of a loved one, it is manly to limit and to control them. Indeed, when Petrarch weeps excessively for a friend killed by bandits, he accuses himself of falling prey to grief 'like a woman or silly man'.³³ Yet, in the end, he admits that weeping provides a cathartic remedy for purging grief and relieving his mind of its burden, despite the risk of appearing 'pitiable and unmanly'.³⁴

Petrarch's attitudes to grief hardened towards the end of his life, although the context and addressee shaped his advice. In a wide-ranging letter dated 1373 (published in his *Seniles* xiv. 1), Petrarch advised the lord of Padua, Francesco il Vecchio da Carrara, to restrict noisy wailing and lamentation at Padua's funerals.³⁵ Petrarch's motives are Stoic in seeking to maintain the dignity of the dead and in noting the pointlessness of excessive emotions, but his words also reflect a Christian piousness that looks back to the writings of Church fathers. Rather than loud displays of grief, Christian hymns ought to be sung or prayers for the soul of the deceased during funerals said softly or silently.³⁶ On the other hand, Petrarch's candid advice to the ruler of Padua stands in stark contrast to his earlier letters to King Robert of Naples and Rienzi Cola, marking perhaps a thawing of humanist ideals in the face of a long life of adapting to political realities.³⁷

³¹ George McClure and Lansing have examined Petrarch's writings as sources for understanding early humanists' subjective experience of grief, and his classicizing approach to emotional restraint; see George W. McClure, 'The Art of Mourning: Autobiographical Writings on the Loss of a Son in Italian Humanist Thought (1400–1461)', *Renaissance Quarterly*, 39.3 (1986), 440–475; McClure, *Sorrow and Consolation*, pp. 18–72; and Lansing, *Passion and Order*, pp. 187–202.

³² McClure, *Sorrow and Consolation*, pp. 60–68; Lansing, *Passion and Order*, pp. 189–90.

³³ Lansing, *Passion and Order*, p. 195.

³⁴ Lansing, *Passion and Order*, p. 197.

³⁵ Francesco Petrarca, 'Ad magnificum Franciscum de Carraria Padue dominum, qualis esse debeat qui rem publicam regit [Seniles, XIV, 1]', in *Epistole di Francesco Petrarca*, ed. by Ugo Dotti (Turin: UTET, 1983), pp. 760–837.

³⁶ Lansing, *Passion and Order*, p. 202.

³⁷ John Richards, *Petrarch's Influence on the Iconography of the Carrara Palace in Padua: The Conflict between Ancestral and Antique Themes in the Fourteenth Century*

Petrarch's advice had little effect on medieval Padua's funerary customs, despite repeated instances where authorities or public figures tried to regulate public mourning. The successor of Francesco il Vecchio, and last lord of Padua, Francesco Novello da Carrara, issued sumptuary laws (statutes) in 1398 restricting excessive behaviours and displays of grieving at funerals.³⁸ Pointedly, a bell could only be rung with the permission of the seignorial council. Funeral processions were to be accompanied by the singing of psalms and confined to the parish of the church in which the citizen was being buried. Several other restrictions were placed on the dress of funeralgoers and the decoration of the funeral cortege. While this seems to represent a Christian moralization of grief, civic restraint may have been required in this troubled period during which Padua was sandwiched between an ascendant Lombardy and the Mediterranean superpower Venice.

Petrarch's consolatory writings are both philosophical statements of an ideal moral self and also acts of compassion within a discourse that treated excessive emotions as potentially dangerous to civic society and the common good. Petrarch's successors continued to develop these themes in their writings. After the deaths of his sons, Piero and Andrea, in quick succession in the middle of 1400, Coluccio Salutati received a series of consolatory letters from friends.³⁹ Zabarella wrote from Padua to offer consolation in the Stoic vein, praising Salutati for his strength in adversity.⁴⁰ As George McClure notes, '[c]learly Zabarella's intention was charitably to give back to Salutati the same type of reasoned solace that he had ministered to so many others in their grief'.⁴¹ Salutati responded by rejecting Zabarella's praise of his grief-stricken composure on theological grounds: it would suggest that he was more resilient than Job, who was grief-stricken upon learning of the death of his sons, or Christ, who wept on hearing of Lazarus's death.⁴² Rather, by recounting his grief as he watched his son dying, the Florentine spurned classical rational consolation, instead entrusting his solace to the grace of an omnipotent God. Salutati's rebuff was followed by another exchange of letters. Zabarella staunchly defended his precepts, such as the immortality of the soul, shared by Ciceronian philosophy and Christian theology. Although this disagreement might erode any sense of true compassion between friends, Salutati acknowledges Zabarella's compassion. He sees Zabarella's willingness to share in another's grief (or other strong emotions) as an attribute of true friendship and fellowship.⁴³ True friends could agree to disagree on the

(Lewiston: Edwin Mellen Press, 2007), p. 8.

³⁸ Antonio Bonardi, *Il Lusso di altri tempi in Padova: studio storico con documenti inediti* (Venice: Tip. Emiliana, 1909), p. 11; Catherine Kovesi Killerby, *Sumptuary Law in Italy 1200–1500* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002), p. 71.

³⁹ McClure, *Sorrow and Consolation*, pp. 95–99.

⁴⁰ Coluccio Salutati, *Epistolario*, ed. by Francesco Novati, 4 vols (Rome: Tipografia del Senato, 1891–1911), iv (1911), 347–49 (letter 17).

⁴¹ McClure, *Sorrow and Consolation*, p. 95.

⁴² Salutati, *Epistolario*, III (1896), 408–22 (letter 23).

⁴³ McClure, *Sorrow and Consolation*, pp. 79–80.

philosophical or theological truths of consolation, but still engage in the fellowship of common feeling.

Shortly after the epistolary exchange of Zabarella and Salutati, Giovanni Conversini da Ravenna composed a consolatory tract that he sent to his close friend Paolo Rugolo in Treviso.⁴⁴ At the time of its writing, Conversini was chancellor in the court of Francesco Novello da Carrara at Padua.⁴⁵ Surviving letters indicate that Conversini knew Salutati and Zabarella, and the younger Pier Paolo Vergerio and Leonardo Giustinian (discussed below).⁴⁶ As a young man and a school master in Belluno, Conversini penned a consolation to Donato Albanzani on the death of Petrarch.⁴⁷ Conversini had been a friend of Petrarch, and had called on him in Arquà less than a year before his death. Conversini's *De consolatione de obitu filii* (1401) describes his grief at the loss of his adult son Israele (1375–1400).⁴⁸ Conversini's self-consolation possibly draws upon one of Petrarch's late works, although as a dialogue between Sorrow (*Maestus*) and the Consoler (*Solator*), it might also demonstrate Conversini's awareness of the recent exchange between Zabarella and Salutati.⁴⁹ As McClure notes, '[t]hrough a regimen of debate, remembrance, and rumination, Conversini too gave quarter to his sorrow by fashioning a literary framework for mourning'.⁵⁰

Early in Conversini's dialogue, Sorrow discusses how the compassionate respond to sincere displays of grief (see Appendix). The passage in question reveals much about Conversini's thought on how friends react to grief with acts of consolation. An act of consolation is only possible when one possesses fellow feeling for the sufferer: the absence of love for another makes compassion

⁴⁴ Benjamin Kohl, 'The Works of Giovanni di Conversino da Ravenna: A Catalogue of Manuscripts and Editions', *Traditio*, 31 (1975), 349–67 (p. 356, n. 15); Carmen Cardelle de Hartmann, *Lateinische Dialoge 1200–1400: Literaturhistorische Studie und Repertorium* (Leiden: Brill, 2007), pp. 666–67. Apart from short transcriptions in Remigio Sabbadini, *Giovanni da Ravenna, insigne figura d'umanista (1343–1408) da documenti inediti* (Como: Tipografia editrice Ostinelli di C. Nani, 1924), pp. 174–76, nos. 43–44, there is no published edition of this dialogue.

⁴⁵ Sabbadini, *Giovanni da Ravenna*, remains the most comprehensive biography of Conversini; valuable additions from archival evidence and further precisions are found in Giovanni Conversini da Ravenna, *Two Court Treatises: De primo eius introitu ad aulam, De delectatione regnantium*, ed. by Benjamin G. Kohl and James Day (Munich: Wilhelm Fink, 1987).

⁴⁶ Kohl, 'The Works of Giovanni di Conversino da Ravenna', Letters 20 (Padua, 1394), 21 (Padua, 1400), 55 (Venice, 1405), 61 (Muggia, 1406), 68 (Muggia, 1407), 70 (Muggia, 1407), 78 (Muggia, 1407), 84 (Muggia, 1407), and 94 (Muggia, 1395); Thomas E. Morrissey, 'The Humanist and the Franciscan: A Letter of Giovanni Conversino da Ravenna to Peter Philargus of Candia', *Franciscan Studies*, 52 (1992), 183–89 (p. 184).

⁴⁷ Benjamin G. Kohl and James Day, 'Giovanni Conversini's *Consolatio ad Donatum* on the Death of Petrarch', *Studies in the Renaissance*, 21 (1974), 9–30.

⁴⁸ Sabbadini, *Giovanni da Ravenna*, pp. 86–88. Conversini also writes about the death of his two young children in his autobiography; Nicolai Rubinstein, 'A Grammar Teacher's Autobiography: Giovanni Conversini's *Rationarium vite*', *Renaissance Studies*, 2 (1988), 154–62 (p. 162).

⁴⁹ McClure, *Sorrow and Consolation*, p. 104.

⁵⁰ McClure, *Sorrow and Consolation*, p. 104.

impossible. Worse still is when someone, who shares no love for the sufferer, feigns compassion. Conversini continues with a series of examples of paternal grief, drawn from biblical and classical traditions, to legitimate overt displays of weeping.⁵¹ All serve to defend his own mourning for his dead son. Conversini offers a contemporary humanist's understanding of grief as a performative act, a kind of compassionate reciprocation through natural acts of consolation. Conversini also recalls how, when family members at funerals commemorate the dead with songs and polyphony, they refer less to their love for the deceased than to the dangerous lot of inconstant life, which is not particular to them. He explains: the more we love, the more we are tortured by grief and pour forth the signs of suffering, that is, weeping and wailing. Yet, Conversini cautions, tears and noisy lament are sometimes feigned; for example, for dead and despised tyrants: whether feigned or true, compassion is prompted by the outward display of sorrow.

Humanists continued to cultivate consolatory letter writing at Padua in the following decades. Notable examples include a letter of Gasparino Barzizza, professor of rhetoric at the university, to Pietro Marcello, Venetian patrician and Bishop of Padua (r. 1409–1428), on the occasion of the death of Pietro's brother Girolamo in 1420.⁵² Barzizza praises Pietro's steadfastness in grief, given that Pietro had also recently lost his father, another brother, two of his sisters, and a nephew.⁵³ Pietro himself wrote a short letter of consolation when he was still bishop of Caneda (r. 1399–1409) to fellow Venetian Fantino Dandolo in 1405. Although this letter is not a full-blown example of humanist consolatory literature, nonetheless it references classical authors, Terence and Cicero.⁵⁴

Later in the fifteenth century, a community of humanists addressed extraordinary letters and tracts of consolation to Jacopo Antonio Marcello. Marcello had sunk into a deep abyss of grief following the death of his nine-year-old son Valerio in 1461.⁵⁵ Like his uncle, Marcello was a Venetian who had acquired the former Carraresi castle at Monselice, a satellite town of Padua. After more than seventeen months, numerous literary friends and associates could not assuage Marcello's mourning; indeed, Jacopo Antonio defends his grief through the pen of Gregorio Bevilacqua in an *Excusatio* appended at the end of a manuscript that was destined to be sent to Marcello's literary friend, King René d'Anjou. It seems that the manuscript never reached Anjou's court. Margaret King contextualizes the

⁵¹ Classical sources include Vergil, *Aeneid*, II, 559–562; and Terence, *Adelphoe*, 125. Biblical references include Judges 11.29–40; II Samuel 1.12; II Samuel 18.1–17; John 11.1–45. Conversini also makes passing references to early Church fathers and the teachings of St Francis of Assisi.

⁵² Joseph Alexander Furiectus, *Gasparini Barzizii Bergomatis et Guinforti filii opera* (Rome: Jo. Maria Salvioni, 1723), pp. 85–87.

⁵³ Remigio Sabbadini, 'Antonio da Romagno e Pietro Marcello', *Nuovo Archivio Veneto*, n.s., 15 (1915), 207–46 (p. 217).

⁵⁴ Sabbadini, 'Antonio da Romagno', pp. 218 and 236–37 (edition of letter).

⁵⁵ This paragraph draws on Margaret King, *The Death of the Child Valerio Marcello* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994).

consolatory tradition witnessed in Marcello's compilation as a genre that emerged in the later decades of the fourteenth century. An elegant feature of King's analysis is the identification of contrasting philosophic foundations in the writings of various authors, which divide between the Stoic and Peripatetic schools, suffused by Christian biblical and theological discourse. The debate over the foundations of consolation, which Salutati and Zaberella initiated at the beginning of the century, continued throughout the fifteenth century.

Each example of consolatory or self-consolatory literature from late medieval Padua can be understood within Lansing's discussion of Italian civic society and the regulation of emotional expression.⁵⁶ Whereas unbridled outbursts of grief were discouraged or explicitly prohibited (with the threat of a fine or brief imprisonment as a deterrent), literary expression provided a means by which men of letters (and women as the fifteenth century progressed) might express their grief and console friends in their mourning. Their consolatory acts represent a type of novel homosocial gendering of certain expressions of grief, a series of literary affordances where signs of suffering could be expressed in refined language, predominantly Latin, but at times in the courtly tenor of the vernacular. In reality, civic regulations were scarcely intended for humanists, who represented an intellectually distinct, but socially prominent, community in the broader civic community of Italian city states. At the level of letter writing and consolatory tracts, however, these humanist emotional expressions would have remained largely invisible to the broader populations of late medieval cities. Where humanism's voice was heard, particularly at the court and in public oratory, speakers attempt to move their listeners, but it is often veiled in learning that seeks to privilege the social, political, and academic ambitions of an inner circle at the expense of the broader population.⁵⁷

IV. A Community of Humanists and Musicians in early Fifteenth-Century Padua

The affairs of Ciconia, Zabarella, and Vergerio were closely entwined in early fifteenth-century Padua. Zabarella had ensured that Ciconia found a living when he arrived at Padua. Zabarella was professor of canon and civic laws (often referred to in archival documents as 'both laws') at Padua's university, and archpriest of the same city's cathedral. His prominence as a figure of authority and learning is evident from his network of correspondents, the calibre of his students, and the increasingly important role he assumed in the affairs of the divided church during the last phase of the Great Schism (1378–1418).⁵⁸ It is possible that Zabarella

⁵⁶ Lansing, *Passion and Order*, pp. 200–02.

⁵⁷ John M. McManamon, *Funeral Oratory and the Cultural Ideals of Italian Humanism* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1989).

⁵⁸ Gasparo Zonta, *Francesco Zabarella (1360–1417)* (Padua: Tipografia del Seminario, 1915); Dieter Girgensohn, 'Francesco Zabarella da Padova. Dottrina e attività politica di un professore di diritto durante il grande scisma d'occidente', *Quaderni per la storia dell'Università di Padova*, 26/27 (1994), 1–48; Dieter Girgensohn, 'Studenti e tradizione delle opere di

had already encountered Ciconia, possibly during a 1397–98 visit to Rome, if not earlier.

Ciconia also picks up many of the themes of early humanism at Padua in his musical settings. This situation is unsurprising, given his documented connections with Zabarella and Vergerio. Before his arrival in Padua, Ciconia, who seems to have been born in Liège around 1370, was listed as a *familiaris* in the household of Cardinal Philippe d'Alençon in Rome in 1391.⁵⁹ In Rome, Ciconia would have had an opportunity to engage with new musical styles, including that of the slightly older Antonio Zacara da Teramo. Although various hypotheses have been advanced for Ciconia's whereabouts between 1391 and his arrival at Padua, no archival evidence has come to light to support these claims.⁶⁰ Philippe's death in 1397 leaves several years unaccounted for. Ciconia is documented in Padua from 1401 until his death in 1412. The Paduan notary Pietro Bono recorded the collation of two clerical benefices to Ciconia by authority of Zabarella, for the parish church of San Biagio di Ronchalea on 11 July and then for a chaplaincy at Padua cathedral on 14 July 1401.⁶¹ Both notarial acts name Vergerio as a witness in Zabarella's own house. A notary act dated 30 July 1401 furnishes firm evidence for Ciconia's presence in Padua when he takes physical possession of the first benefice at the parish church itself. Notably, besides a local Benedictine prior, Luca *cantore di abbazia* from the Benedictine abbey of Santa Giustina in Padua is a witness to the act, possibly also affirming Ciconia's induction into the musical

Francesco Zabarella nell'Europa centrale', in *Studenti, Università, città nella storia padovana. Atti del convegno, Padova 6–8 febbraio 1998*, ed. by Francesco Piovan and Luciana Sitran Rea (Trieste: Lint, 2001), pp. 127–76.

⁵⁹ Giuliano Di Bacco and John Nadas, 'Verso uno "stile internazionale" della musica nelle cappelle papali e cardinalizie durante il Grande Scisma (1378–1417): il caso di Johannes Ciconia da Liège', in *Collectanea I*, ed. by Adalbert Roth (Vatican City: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 1994), pp. 7–74 (pp. 13–17).

⁶⁰ John Nadas and Agostino Ziino, *The Lucca Codex: Codice Mancini: Lucca, Archivio di Stato, MS 184. Perugia, Biblioteca Comunale 'Augusta', MS 3065* (Lucca: Libreria Musicale Italiana, 1990), p. 43.

⁶¹ Ciconia resigned from the second benefice early the following year. For summaries of documentary evidence for Ciconia at Padua see: Suzanne Clercx, *Johannes Ciconia: un musicien liégeois et son temps (vers 1335–1411)* (Brussels: Palais des Academies, 1960); Anne Hallmark, 'Protector, imo verus pater: Francesco Zabarella's Patronage of Johannes Ciconia', in *Music in Renaissance Cities and Courts: Studies in Honor of Lewis Lockwood*, ed. by Jessie Ann Owens and Anthony M. Cummings (Warren, MI: Harmonie Park Press, 1997), pp. 153–68; Anne Hallmark, 'Johannes Ciconia: Reviewing the Documentary Evidence', in *Beyond 50 Years of Ars Nova Studies at Certaldo 1959–2009*, ed. by Marco Gozzi, Agostino Ziino, and Francesco Zimei (Lucca: Libreria Musicale Italiana, 2014), pp. 265–85; with additions in Jason Stoessel, 'Con lagreme bagnandome el viso', pp. 73–74; and Jason Stoessel, 'Climbing Mont Ventoux: The Contest/Context of Scholasticism and Humanism in Early Fifteenth-Century Paduan Music Theory and Practice', *Intellectual History Review*, 27 (2017), 317–32 (p. 327, n. 23). The argument for distinguishing Ciconia from his father of the same name, in response to Clercx's earlier biography that conflated both into a single individual and narrative, is treated in David Fallows, 'Ciconia padre e figlio', *Rivista Italiana di Musicologia*, 11.2 (1976), 171–77. Also see Giuliano Di Bacco and others, 'Ciconia, Johannes', in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, ed. by Stanley Sadie (London: Grove, 2001), v, 836–42.

brotherhood at Padua. Earlier on the day, the same notary Giacomo Albertini records that Zabarella had authorized his nephew, Marino Zabarella, to invest Ciconia with the benefice. Marino is described as a student of canon law. The delegation of authority to invest a cleric with a local benefice was usually reserved to the bishop. Zabarella, as archpriest of the cathedral, had assumed considerable local authority in the shadow of an indulgent episcopal administrator, Stefano da Carrara, natural son of Francesco il Vecchio da Carrara.⁶² Another of Zabarella's cohabitating law students, Arnold Geilhoven, was present in Zabarella's house to witness the delegation of authority to Marino.⁶³ As a minor figure in early northern humanism, Geilhoven was responsible for transferring knowledge of Petrarch's writings over the Alps after completing his studies at Padua.⁶⁴

It is possible that Ciconia was already at Padua no later than 13 May of the same year if he is the 'Johannes quondam Johannis de Alemania', familiar (that is, household member) of Francesco Zabarella, who is recorded as a witness to the act of transferring a benefice on that day in Zabarella's house. The first explicit mention of Ciconia in the Paduan archives for the collation of the clerical benefice of San Biagio di Ronchalea refers to 'Master Johannes Ciconia, son of Johannes Ciconia from the city of Liège' ('M. Johanni cyconie filii Johannis ciconie de civitate leodiensis'). The shared reference to Johannes the son of Johannes and the fact that Liège belonged to the German archdiocese of Cologne in the Middle Ages offer points of congruency between the May and July archival documents, pointing to the strong possibility that Ciconia was already in Padua, and in Zabarella's household, for the collation of benefices. Interestingly, in his will dated 28 December 1410 and made on the eve of his departure from Padua to take up the bishopric of Florence, Zabarella included the provision that three of his oldest familiars, including Johannes de Alemania, should each inherit 25 ducats if they were still with him at the time of his death. The same will instructs that books containing Cicero's *Tusculan Disputations*, Pliny's *Letters*, Cicero's *De amicitia* and forensic orations, and a large collection of Petrarch's writings are to be left to Vergerio. Instructions follow, stating that several legal texts, including his own commentary on the Clementine decretals, should go to his nephew Marino.

That Zabarella places Vergerio before his own kin in his will is a telling indication of his regard for the younger humanist and the strength of their friendship. Vergerio would later write a long biographical letter to Paduan Ludovico Buzzacarini prefaced by a description of his own grief following

⁶² Matteo Melchiorre, *'Ecclesia Nostra': La cattedrale di Padova, il suo capitolo e i suoi canonici nel primo secolo veneziano (1406–1509)* (Rome: Istituto storico italiano per il medio evo, 2014), p. 91.

⁶³ Both notarial acts of 30 July 1401 are edited in Anne Hallmark, 'Gratiosus, Ciconia, and Other Musicians at Padua Cathedral: Some Footnotes to Present Knowledge', in *L'Arts Nova italiana del Trecento VI*, ed. by Guilio Cattin and Patrizia Dalla Vecchia (Certaldo: Polis, 1992), pp. 69–84 (pp. 81–82).

⁶⁴ Nicholas Mann, 'Arnold Geilhoven: An Early Disciple of Petrarch in the Low Countries', *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes*, 32 (1969), 73–108.

Zabarella's sudden death at the Council of Constance on 26 September 1417.⁶⁵ Again, the letter is telling, as the author represents his strong emotions in a literary medium while advocating outward emotional restraint to respect the memory of the deceased. Although he can neither stop himself from bursting into tears anew nor hide his pain, Vergerio resolves to share what he knows of Zabarella's life without any signs of suffering ('absque ulla significatione doloris'), since tears are useless when the loss is irreparable ('cum inutiles sint lacrimae, quanto iam irreparabile damnum est'). It is proper to shed tears at funerals and afterwards, but rationality must rule the suffering that remains daily, to ensure that the memory of the deceased's good deeds and praiseworthiness remain with him for the rest of his days.

Vergerio's early humanist credentials are evident in his other writings. Notably, at Padua in 1402, he wrote a treatise on the moral education befitting youths, which was staple reading over the following century or so.⁶⁶ His orations are strongly (though not completely) classicized in their vocabulary.⁶⁷ They also make abundant use of classical figures of speech for achieving emotional effect.⁶⁸ Vergerio's presence among the humanists orbiting the Carrara court and Zabarella's household reveals a concentration of experimental literary expression that looks back to classical Roman antiquity while responding to more recent trends arising from Petrarch's legacy at Padua. Similar engagement with current trends in Padua can be discerned in Ciconia's compositions.

⁶⁵ Pier Paolo Vergerio, *Epistolario*, ed. by Leonardo Smith (Rome: Istituto Storico Italiano per il medio evo, 1934), pp. 362–78. Smith dates the letter to 27 October or 6 November 1417.

⁶⁶ David Robey, 'Humanism and Education in the Early Quattrocento: The *De ingenuis moribus* of P. P. Vergerio', *Bibliothèque d'humanisme et Renaissance*, 42 (1980), 27–58. Vergerio's *De ingenuis moribus et liberalibus adulescentiae studiis liber* is edited in Attilio Gnesotto, 'Petri Pauli Vergerii *De ingenuis moribus et liberalibus studiis adulescentiae*', *Atti e memorie della R. Accademia di scienze lettere ed arti in Padova*, n.s., 34 (1917), 75–156, with a translation in Craig W. Kallendorf, *Humanist Educational Treatises* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2002), pp. 1–91.

⁶⁷ John M. McManamon, 'Innovation in Early Humanist Rhetoric: The Oratory of Pier Paolo Vergerio', *Rinascimento: Rivista dell'Istituto Nazionale di Studi sul Rinascimento*, n.s., 21 (1982), 3–32; John M. McManamon, *Funeral Oratory and the Cultural Ideals of Italian Humanism*; John M. McManamon, *Pierpaolo Vergerio the Elder: The Humanist as Orator* (Tempe, AZ: Medieval & Renaissance Texts & Studies, 1996).

⁶⁸ Stoessel, 'Con lagreme bagnandome el viso', pp. 77–81.

V. Compassionate Musical Consolations

Music at Padua in the late fourteenth and early fifteenth centuries provides further examples of acts of consolation. Although the following discussion focuses on examples of composed musical polyphony, Gregorian chant remained the most quotidian musical expression of death in the medieval funereal liturgy. By this time these rites were mostly standardized throughout Europe. Evidence for their use at Padua reveals that they follow the liturgy of the widely dispersed Use of Rome, allowing some deviations common to particular monastic orders at this time.⁶⁹ Furthermore, the liturgy of death dictated that these rites consisted of sung prayers for the dead. Any consolation arising from these ritualized acts rests in the reassurance that the deceased had been commended into the care of God for resurrection to life eternal. By its very nature, the final rites of the church for the dead were incapable of providing personalized consolation. For that, we need to look to the new music in this period.

Many Latin texts that Ciconia set to music refer to the civic values of humanist culture and publicly celebrate the achievement of men.⁷⁰ In his songs, Ciconia also demonstrates an interest in the subjective human experience of love and death. In relation to the latter, Ciconia set to music a vernacular outburst of grief, *Con lagreme bagnandome el viso*, which can also be seen as a consolatory act:

Con lagreme bagnandome el viso,
 El mio signor lassay
 ond'io me strugo in guay
 quando io me penso esser da luy diviso.

Ay, me dolente, ay, dura dispartita
 che may non fay ritorno in questo mondo.
 Ay, cruda morte, ay, despjetata vita,
 Cho'me partesti dal mio amor iocundo.

Ay, ingorda malvasa sença fondo,
 fuor d'ogni temperance,
 sgroppa omay toa balança
 poy ch'è tolto may ogni gioco e riso.⁷¹

⁶⁹ Giulio Cattin and Antonio Lovato, *Contributi per la storia della musica sacra a Padova* (Padua: Istituto per la Storia Ecclesiastica Padovana, 1993); Giulio Cattin and Anna Vildera, *Il 'Liber Ordinarius' della chiesa padovana* (Padua: Istituto per la storia ecclesiastica padovana, 2002); Elisabetta Russo, 'La musica e i riti funebri a Padova secondo le cronache e i libri liturgici del sec. XIV' (unpublished tesi di laurea, Università degli Studi di Padova, 2007), pp. 91–137.

⁷⁰ Jason Stoessel, 'Music and Moral Philosophy in Early Fifteenth-Century Padua', in *Identity and Locality in Early European Music 1028–1740*, ed. by Jason Stoessel (Farnham: Ashgate, 2009), pp. 107–27.

⁷¹ Source: Lucca, Archivio di Stato, MS 184, fol. 54r. The Italian follows the Lucca Codex's orthography, including dots of elision beneath vowels. Diacritics and apostrophes of contraction have also been added. Translation by J. Stoessel.

(With tears bathing my face,
I have lost my lord
so that I waste away in woe
when I think of being separated from him.

O my suffering, O harsh loss
that you are never returning to this world.
O harsh death, O pitiless life,
How have you parted me from my happy love.

O gluttonous evil without end,
beyond all measure,
your scales now teeter
since all joy and laughter is ever taken away.)

In one manuscript, a scribe noted that the ballata ‘was made for Francesco, lord of Padua’ (‘Ballata fatta per messer francescho singnior di padova’). The song dates from shortly after January 1406, when Francesco da Carrara the Younger was murdered by Venetian prison guards after the surrender of Padua to La Serenissima, and the young Venetian Leonardo Giustinian penned the Italian text.⁷² Delicate sighing motives in the music capture the mourner’s suffering, while musical repetition of short melodic motives parallels the use of anaphora in classical rhetoric and contemporary examples of humanistic oratory, especially the funeral orations of Pier Paolo Vergerio at Padua.⁷³ Indeed, the whole song is a musico-rhetorical exercise intended to move a listener in the same way that classically inspired humanist oratory strove to move an audience.⁷⁴ In sharing the suffering of sung poetry amplified through musical expression, the listener engages in compassionate listening.

Ciconia’s song survives in no less than sixteen sources. It enjoyed a longevity in the *cantasi come* tradition in which new religious texts or *laude* were sung by secular confraternities to well-known secular songs.⁷⁵ One of the most important sources of the *ballata* is a dismembered manuscript, now recovered, reconstructed and familiar to music historians as the Lucca Codex (owing to the fact that most of the fragments constituting the manuscript were recovered from

⁷² David Fallows, ‘Leonardo Giustinian and Quattrocento Polyphonic Song’, in *L’edizione critica tra testo musicale e testo letterario: Atti del convegno internazionale (Cremona 4–8 Ottobre 1992)*, ed. by Renato Borghi and Pietro Zappalà (Lucca: Libreria Musicale Italiana, 1995), pp. 247–60.

⁷³ McManamon, ‘Innovation in Early Humanist Rhetoric’; McManamon, *Pierpaolo Vergerio the Elder*.

⁷⁴ Stoessel, ‘*Con lagreme bagnandome el viso*’, pp. 75–81.

⁷⁵ On the Laudesi companies of Florence and their singing of *cantasi come laude* (including settings to Ciconia’s music), see Blake Wilson, *Music and Merchants: The Laudesi Companies of Republican Florence* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1992); and Blake Wilson, *Singing Poetry in Renaissance Florence: The cantasi come Tradition (1375–1550) with CD-ROM* (Florence: Olschki–Fontecolombo Institute, Western Australia, 2009).

the Archivio di Stato in Lucca, Italy).⁷⁶ It is the only manuscript that ascribes the song to Ciconia. Agostino Ziino and John Nádas propose that copying of the Lucca Codex began at Padua, within Ciconia's lifetime, before being taken to the Council of Pisa in 1409 and then Florence around 1410.⁷⁷ Although it survives only in a fragmentary state, *Con lagreme* is part of the most extensive collection of songs by Ciconia in the Lucca Codex.

The songs of contemporary composer Antonio Zacara da Teramo are also amply represented in the Lucca Codex. Zacara—as he is known in the musicological literature—was a major composer from around the year 1400. Ciconia must have met Zacara in Rome in 1391 or earlier, where Zacara was named in documents as an apostolic *scriptor*, illuminator, and very famous singer.⁷⁸ While the details of Zacara's biography have only emerged with greater clarity in the last few years, the greatest part of his career seems to have been entwined with the papal politics of the Great Schism of the West (1378–1418) and the papal residencies in Rome, Pisa, and possibly Bologna. The composer may have even visited Padua in 1410 to attend the doctoral examination of Simone de Lellis, on which occasion he composed his song *Je suy navvrés tan fort / Gnaff 'a le guagnele, et (io) anch' to toglì*.⁷⁹ It is clear that, if we accept Padua as the origin of the Lucca Codex, many of Zacara's songs—possibly even recently composed ones—were known in the north Italian city.

In the context of early humanist Padua, at least one of Zacara's songs resonated with the consolatory acts of early humanists at Padua. Zacara's *Plorans ploravi* was copied in a cluster of the composer's songs which appears just seven folios after Ciconia's *Con lagreme bagnadome el viso* in the Lucca Codex.⁸⁰ *Plorans* is a highly personal lament for the composer's infant son, Giacomo, who was named after St James of Compostela:

⁷⁶ Nádas and Ziino, *The Lucca Codex*; John Nádas and Agostino Ziino, 'Two Newly Discovered Leaves of the Lucca Codex', *Studi Musicali*, 34 (2005), 3–23, 10 plates.

⁷⁷ Nádas and Ziino, *The Lucca Codex*, p. 48.

⁷⁸ Agostino Ziino, 'Magister Antonius dictus Zacharias de Teramo: alcune date e molte ipotesi', *Rivista Italiana di Musicologia*, 14.2 (1979), 311–348; Anna Esposito, "'Magistro Zaccara" e l'antifonario dell'Ospedale di S. Spirito in Sassia', in *Scrittura, biblioteche e stampa a Roma nel Quattrocento, Atti del. 2. seminario*, ed. by Massimo Miglio, P. Ferenga, and Anna Modigliani (Vatican City: Scuola Vaticana di Paleografia, Diplomatica e Archivistica, 1983), pp. 334–42, 446–49; Anna Esposito, 'Maestro Zaccara da Teramo "scriptore et miniature" di un antifonario per l'ospedale di Santo Spirito in Sassia a Roma', *Recercare*, 4 (1992), 167–78; Giuliano Di Bacco and John Nádas, 'Zacara e i suoi colleghi italiani nella cappella papale', in *Antonio Zacara da Teramo e il suo tempo*, ed. by Francesco Zimei (Lucca: Libreria Musicale Italiana, 2004), pp. 33–54.

⁷⁹ Francesco Zimei, 'Note sul soggiorno padovano di Zacara', in *I frammenti musicali padovani tra Santa Giustina e la diffusione della musica in Europa: Giornata di studio, Padova, Abbazia di S. Giustina-Biblioteca Universitaria 15 giugno 2006*, ed. by Francesco Facchin and Pietro Gnan (Padua: Biblioteca Universitaria di Padova, 2011), pp. 215–28.

⁸⁰ The Italian adopts the same principles of orthography as Figure 3 but is indebted to the edition (using modernized conventions) in Francesco Zimei, 'Variazioni sul tema della Fortuna', in *Antonio Zacara da Teramo e il suo tempo*, ed. by Zimei, pp. 229–43 (p. 236).

Plorans ploravi perché la Fortuna
 pur sopra ad me diriga sua potenza.
 Ploraboque, ché a ley força e prudença
 resistere non li vale tanto é importuna.

Maldetta quella che 'l mondo raduna,
 quella nutrice e l'ora che me 'l tolse:
 nature debitum in unda persolse,
 sospiri a lo mio cor sempre s'aduna.

In ulnis patris expirò cum pianto,
 per rinovar le penè fi questo canto
 Martiro fo ne la sua puericia
 quel che per nome avea quel del Galicia.⁸¹

(I have wept sore since Fortune
 has exercised her power over me.
 I shall weep because the strength and prudence to
 resist her is worthless and ill-timed.

Cursed is she who rules the world,
 that carer and the hour that took him from me:
 nature's debt was paid in a flood (riot?),
 My heart is always filled with sighs.

He died weeping in the arms of his father,
 I wrote this song to recall the suffering.
 In his childhood he was a martyr just like the
 Galician after whom he was named.)

The mixture of Italian and Latin in *Plorans ploravi* characterizes several of Zacara's song texts. References to the allegorical figure of Fortune also occur in other fourteenth-century songs, though Zacara seems to take especial delight in blaming Lady Luck for his misfortunes. We might recall how in his consolatory dialogue Conversini noted the use of funeral songs that referred to the inconstant lot of life (Appendix). Fortune's revolving wheel was a well-known metaphorical image in the art of this period, representing the waxing and waning of the affairs of men.⁸² This contrasts with *Con lagreme bagnandome*, in which Justice (and her antithesis Injustice) bears the brunt of Giustinian's complaint.

Plorans ploravi also contains intertextual references to the Lamentations of Jeremiah 1.2 and 9.1. Both versions would have been familiar to medieval

⁸¹ Source: Lucca, Archivio di Stato, MS 184, fols 61v–62v. The Italian adopts the source's orthography but is indebted to the edition (using modernized conventions) in Francesco Zimei, 'Variazioni sul tema della Fortuna', in *Antonio Zacara da Teramo e il suo tempo*, ed. by Zimei, pp. 229–43 (p. 236). Translation by J. Stoessel.

⁸² On the theme of Fortune and her symbolism in music, see, for example, Anna Zayaruznaya, "'She has a wheel that turns ...': Crossed and Contradictory Voices in Machaut's Motets', *Early Music History*, 28 (2009), 185–240.

people from their use in the first nocturn of Maundy Thursday during Holy Week. In the Lamentations, the allegorical Jerusalem ‘weepeth sore in the night, and her tears are on her cheeks: among all her lovers she hath none to comfort her’ (‘Plorans, ploravit in nocte et lacryme eius in maxillis eius; non est qui consoletur eam ex omnibus caris eius’). The striking imagery of tears bathing the cheeks of the mourner also occurs in Ciconia’s *Con lagreme bagnandome*. Although the pervasiveness of the biblical model cannot be discounted, the imagery was widespread in fourteenth-century Italian poetry.⁸³

Like Conversini, Ciconia and Zacara also represent weeping as the outward sign of sorrow in their laments. Each composer uses music as an analogue to the act of shedding tears. Francesco Zimei describes the opening of *Plorans ploravi*, with its descending melodic line and syncopated rhythms, as ‘an astonishing imitation of weeping’.⁸⁴ Musical gestures like these can be understood as emotives, which operate both in tandem and independently with reference to textual emotives, that is, emotional words. Later, the attentive listener is rewarded by further text–music relationships which underscore the composer’s exploration of the emotional substance of his lyrics. The *ritornello* of *Plorans ploravi* changes from the duple time of the previous section to triple time. This section features melodic lines containing the most poignant musically accentuated expressions of the poet’s grief. In particular, the musical setting of the line ‘in ulnis patris expirò cum pianto’ in bars 94–97 of Figure 3 accentuates the textual alliterations on ‘p’ and ‘x/s’ which, together with the syllabic setting in paired quavers, painfully portray the child’s last gasps.⁸⁵ The melodic leap of a fifth on ‘pianto’ (weeping) at the end of the phrase serves as a musico-rhetorical gesture, a musical emulation of the raised voice or wailing of the mourner. The delicate descending crotchet pairs separated by rests in bars 98–99, which return in bars 109–112, seem further to emulate the poet’s sighs of despair, interspersed with breathless syncopated passages and additional descending melodic lines.

After an initial focus on the inconstancy of life’s affairs, Zacara’s pivot to the memory of his dying son, and his stated intention of composing his song to remember (and ease) his suffering, point to self-consolation akin to that found in Conversini. Although the scale of Zacara’s lyric pales in comparison with the lengthy exploration of personal grief in Conversini’s *De consolatione de obitu filii*, *Plorans ploravi* nonetheless belongs to a tradition of fathers attempting to console themselves through art and literature over the death of a son. Zacara’s highly personal song contrasts with Ciconia’s lament for a ‘father of the people’ who seems to have met an unjust end. Yet, both can be read as consolatory. In both, the poet expresses grief over the loss of a beloved, be it a doomed prince or an innocent child. Whether Ciconia’s lament represents what Conversini might have

⁸³ Stoessel, ‘*Con lagreme bagnandome el viso*’, pp. 81–84.

⁸⁴ Zimei, ‘Variazioni sul tema della Fortuna’, p. 238.

⁸⁵ An edition of *Plorans ploravi* appears in Nádás and Ziino, *The Lucca Codex*, pp. 101–04.

Cantus

Tenor

In Mar

In Mar

90

ul - nis pa-tris ex - pi - rò cum
ti - ro fo ne la su - a pue-

ul - nis pa-tris ex - pi - rò cum
ti - ro fo ne la su - a pue-

96

pian ri - to, per ri - no - var le pene fi que-sto can -
ri cia quel che per nome a - vea quel del Ga - li -

pian ri - to, per ri - no - var le pene fi que-sto can -
ri cia quel che per nome a - vea quel del Ga - li -

102

108

114

to.
cia.

to.
cia.

Figure 3.

Ritornello, Antonio Zacara da Teramo, *Plorans ploravi perché la Fortuna*,
transcribed by J. Stoessel.

(Source: Lucca, Archivio di Stato, MS 184)

Figure 4.

Johannes Ciconia, *Con lagreme bagnandome el viso, Piede (B section)*.

(Adapted from Margaret Bent and Anne Hallmark, *The Works of Ciconia* [Monaco: Éditions de L'Oiseau-Lyre, 1985])

considered feigned sorrow for a dead tyrant is possibly irrelevant, if one considers his setting of Giustinian's poem a consolatory act for the Paduan people who had recently lost their independence as a proud city state to a new mistress, Venice, in 1406.

Like *Plorans ploravi*, the second section (the *piede*) of *Con lagreme bagnandome el viso* sees an intensification of the musico-rhetorical emphasis of the text (Figure 4).⁸⁶ Ciconia sets Giustinian's cry of sorrow, 'Ay, me dolente', with a dramatic musical gesture of a descending minor third transformed to a

⁸⁶ Margaret Bent and Anne Hallmark, *The Works of Ciconia*, Polyphonic Music of the Fourteenth Century, 24 (Monaco: Éditions de L'Oiseau-Lyre, 1985).

jarring ascending major third in bar 49. The explicit association of the musical (e)motive with the poet's suffering in bar 50 (the notes D-C-D-B), emphasized moreover by parallel motion between both voices, is immediately amplified in the following passage with a sequential and desperate quickening of the same melodic figure. The full effect of this text–music relation is realized by the long melisma concluding the *piede*. In this passage the same sorrowful motive returns repeatedly, in imitation and transformed, in both voices in bars 76–78.⁸⁷ Amplifying Giustinian's clever structural parallelism, the singing of 'morte' in the place of the last two syllables of 'dolente' reinforces the listener's impression of the cause and effect of the poet's suffering.

Just as consolatory literature provides a means by which humanists could explore difficult emotions within the conventions of emotional restraint mandated by laws and regulations of their city states, songs like *Con lagreme* and *Plorans ploravi* provided an outlet for expressing these types of emotions. Yet, as elsewhere in contemporary late medieval society, it seems from the evidence to hand that the composers and singers of these songs were afforded a greater latitude in their expression of public emotion, at the very least, within a particular community of musicians and humanists. While authors, like Petrarch, and lawmakers, such as Francesco Novello da Carrara, sought to constrain emotional expression at funerals by mandating the singing of hymns or psalms, the songs examined here extend beyond those prayerful forms of song into highly personalized acts of consolation that invite listeners to join the singer-poet in their suffering. In other words, these songs cultivate compassion.

It is not unreasonable to suggest that the composer of one of these songs responded to the other's musical innovation, although the speculative chronology of each musical setting makes the arrow of influence difficult to identify. While these types of musical settings are not by any stretch of the imagination so-called word painting, as cultivated in music of later centuries, they illustrate a newfound musical sensitivity to shifting understandings of compassion. This corpus, growing from possibly close collaboration, provides evidence of the development of a new, individualized musical style out of Rome in the last decade of the fourteenth century.

VI. Afterlives and Afterword

In the context of the Lucca Codex, songs like *Con lagreme* and *Plorans ploravi* seem to have been included very soon after the events that precipitated them. Padua, with its lord defeated and murdered, surrendered to Venice in 1406. Zimei speculates that Zacara's son might have been killed during riots in Rome in 1405. If so, then Ciconia may have known Zacara's setting. In both cases, we might wonder what relevance laments for a fallen lord and a papal singer's child would have had for the compiler of the Lucca Codex. The early humanists of Padua were

⁸⁷ See Stoessel, 'Con lagreme bagnandome el viso', pp. 85–86, for further analysis of rhetorical effects in this song.

clearly interested in preserving literary acts of compassion: laments in the Lucca Codex offer a parallel manifestation of this exploration of human subjectivity and the sharing of fellow feeling through song rather than the written word. By its very nature, song is something that is heard, that invites listening and in turn invites—as in the case of lament—the listener to participate in the emotive gestures of sorrow, to explore compassion for a sung subject, and to receive consolation to their own suffering. This in no way diminishes these songs’ musical worth: these musical settings offer much to the listener in their musical amplification of the sentiment of the texts. Yet, as a collection of songs, the Lucca Codex also translates these laments into commemorations. Over time there is no longer need for consolation. In collecting laments like Ciconia’s and Zacara’s, the compiler of the Lucca Codex participates in a memorial culture that resembles the frescoes of Altichiero found in the votive chapels of San Antonio and Padua’s oratories. In the end, the Lucca Codex became testimony to the memory of its composers, until their names were forgotten, their music could no longer be understood, and the book was taken apart to become wrappers for archival documents, awaiting rediscovery by musicologists in the twentieth century.

Although Altichiero’s frescoes have stood for centuries on the walls of Padua’s oratories and basilica, the music of Ciconia and Zacara had to wait hundreds of years to be rediscovered. There are many similarities between Altichiero’s monumental art, with its portraits of Carraresi princes and early humanists, and Ciconia’s music, which sings of princes, prelates, and Padua. *Con lagreme bagnandome* hints at this relationship, but for a firmer picture we need to turn to Ciconia’s motets, a genre which has been frequently associated with architectural and monumental themes. Ciconia created his own musical portraits in the form of musical settings of texts celebrating the house of Carrara, Francesco Zabarella, three Paduan bishops (Stefano da Carrara, Alban Michiel, and Pietro Marcello), an abbot (Andrea da Carrara), and Padua’s splendour.⁸⁸ Another motet text celebrates the early humanist Pietros Filargos of Candia’s visit to Padua on 6 March 1406.⁸⁹ Filargos was elected Pope Alexander V at the Council of Pisa in 1409. The motet undoubtedly was paired with a speech that Zabarella gave to welcome Filargos on the occasion of his visit.⁹⁰ Through references to the Book of

⁸⁸ Bent and Hallmark, *The Works of Ciconia*; Stoessel, ‘Music and Moral Philosophy’, pp. 111–26; Robert Nosow, *Ritual Meanings in the Fifteenth-Century Motet* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), pp. 56–70. Ciconia also wrote motets in honour of Venetian Doge Michele Steno; see Julie E. Cumming, ‘Music for the Doge in Early Renaissance Venice’, *Speculum*, 67 (1992), 324–64 (p. 355); and Jamie Reuland, ‘Voicing the Doge’s Sacred Image’, *Journal of Musicology*, 2 (2015), 198–245 (pp. 232–43).

⁸⁹ This new reading and earlier dating of Ciconia’s ‘O Petre Christi discipule’ appears in Jason Stoessel, ‘Johannes Ciconia and his Italian Poets: Text, Image and Beyond in Early-Fifteenth-Century Padua’, in *Polyphonic Voices: Poetic and Musical Dialogues in the European Ars Nova*, ed. by Anna Alberni, Antonio Calvia, and Maria Sofia Lannutti (Florence: Edizioni del Galluzzo, 2021), pp. 211–35 (pp. 228–33).

⁹⁰ Thomas E. Morrissey, ‘Peter of Candia at Padua and Venice in March 1406’, in *Reform and Renewal in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance: Studies in Honor of Louis Pascoe, S.J.*, ed.

Genesis and to Book XII of Vergil's *Aeneid*, the speech itself seems to beg an end to the schism of the Western Church, although it can equally be read as a plea for the cardinal's compassionate intercession on behalf of the people of Padua, who had recently watched the downfall of the ruling Carrara family and the annexation of their city by Venice.

These compositions, and many more of Ciconia's, were collected into a music manuscript by the singers at Padua who had outlived Ciconia, some of whom later moved (along with the manuscript) to Vicenza in the retinue of Bishop Pietro Miani.⁹¹ During the manuscript's first phase of compilation in Padua, Pietro Marcello (see above) was bishop. Now in Bologna, thanks to Padre Giambattista Martini's energetic collecting of music books in the eighteenth century, this manuscript seems to have been the product of a community of singers who sought to preserve the music and texts of recently deceased composers alongside the new works of rising stars like the Franco-Flemish composer Guillaume Du Fay.

At this point, my article comes full circle by returning to Petrarch and his enduring posthumous legacy in Paduan culture. Du Fay himself was complicit in cultivating the memory of Petrarch by setting the last *canzone* of the poet's *Canzoniere*, *Vergine bella, che di sol vestita*.⁹² Du Fay's selection of Petrarch's *canzone* was unusual, given the lack of tradition around setting this poetical form to music, pointing to Du Fay's rhetorical commitment to the musical emphasis of significant words. This is most clearly manifest in the melodic descent to the lowest note in the piece in the line 'misera extrema dell'umane cose'.⁹³ Yet, if Du Fay's setting was composed in honour of the fiftieth anniversary of Petrarch's death,⁹⁴ its presence in the Bologna manuscript parallels the shift of the emotional focus of Ciconia's settings from compassion and grief (and consolation) to

by Thomas M. Izbicki and Christopher M. Bellitto (Leiden: Brill, 2000), pp. 155–73 (pp. 170–71).

⁹¹ Margaret Bent, *Bologna Q15: The Making and Remaking of a Musical Manuscript*, 2 vols (Lucca: Libreria Musicale Italiana, 2008), 1, 3–4. See also Margaret Bent, 'Music and the Early Veneto Humanists', *Proceedings of the British Academy*, 101 (1998), 101–30; Margaret Bent, 'Some Singers of Polyphony in Padua and Vicenza around Pietro Emiliani and Francesco Malipiero', in *Beyond 50 Years of Ars Nova Studies at Certaldo 1959–2009*, pp. 287–303; Margaret Bent, 'Orfeo: Dominus Presbiter Orpheus de Padua', in '*Qui musicam in se habet*': *Studies in Honor of Alejandro Enrique Planchart*, ed. by Anna Zayaruznaya, Bonnie J. Blackburn, and Stanley Boorman (Middleton: American Institute of Musicology, 2015), pp. 231–56; and Margaret Bent, 'Melchior or Marchion de Civilibus: New Documents', in *Music and Culture in the Middle Ages and Beyond: Liturgy, Sources, Symbolism*, ed. by Benjamin Brand and David J. Rothenberg (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), pp. 175–90. I am most grateful to Professor Bent for her generosity in sharing her discoveries and recent publications over the years.

⁹² Francesco Petrarca [Petrarch], *Rerum vulgarium fragmenta*, ed. by Giuseppe Savoca (Florence: Olschki, 2008), pp. 590–97.

⁹³ Giulio Cattin, 'Vergine bella: da Petrarch a Du Fay', in *Petrarca e il suo tempo*, ed. by Gilda Mantovani (Milan: Skira, 2006), pp. 205–12 (pp. 210–12).

⁹⁴ Margaret Bent, 'Petrarch, Padua, the Malatestas, Du Fay and *Vergine bella*', in *Bon jour, Bon mois et bonne estrenne: Essays of Renaissance Music in Honour of David Fallows*, ed. by Fabrice Fitch and Jacobijn Kiel (Woodbridge: Boydell and Brewer, 2011), pp. 86–96.

commemoration and devotion. Indeed, this may go some way to explaining why a copy of Ciconia's *Con lagreme* was excised from the Bologna manuscript, surviving only as a fragment on the back of a pastedown removed from the manuscript when it was restored several years ago.

The shifting posthumous reception of the music of Ciconia hints at the precariousness of consolatory literature and art. Historians need to work hard to recover the emotional significance of these collections of emotive gestures. The cases examined here point to an emotional community of humanists and musicians in Padua in the period when Ciconia called the city home. A full sense of Ciconia's centrality to the musical life of the city is sometimes difficult to grasp more than six centuries after his death, but unravelling the connections between his music and a broader community of humanists active in Padua, with connections to other centres in Italy, has begun to flesh out a cultural history of music and emotions in late medieval Padua. It can be no accident that Zacara's music found such a prominent place in the Lucca Codex when it was begun at Padua: even if we are uncertain whether Zacara visited the city, Ciconia surely knew his music. The fellowship between Zacara, Ciconia, and other composers at this time, strengthened by great Church councils like the one in Pisa in 1409, as well as the network of patrons and protectors who often occupied prominent positions in the ecclesiastical hierarchy, marks the emergence of an early brotherhood of composers that was to become a central feature of musical life later in the fifteenth century.⁹⁵ This brotherhood emulated humanist culture even more so than earlier generations, turning inwards to lament the death of their predecessors in profound and enduring ways that resonate to the present day. This renaissance of emotional self-expression in music begins earlier in Padua. While the viewpoints of musicologists can often invert the conventional understanding of history through their emphasis on musical creativity, the cases examined here indicate that composer-singers and men of new learning in Ciconia's Padua engaged in the exploration of novel emotional regimes in parallel and at times in direct collaboration.

University of New England, Armidale

⁹⁵ See, for example, Jane Hatter, *Composing Community in Late Medieval Music: Self-Reference, Pedagogy and Practice* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019), chaps 3 and 4.

Appendix

Extract from Conversini's *De consolatione de obitu filii* (1401). Transcribed by author from Oxford, Balliol College Library, MS 288, fols 52^r–53^r. Capitalization and punctuation is editorial.

[fol. 52^r B]

S[olator]. Muliebre est dolori indulgere; Virile calcare!

M[estus]. Imo inhumanum minime sentire dolenda vel severa nimirum iactantia [fol. 52^v A] animo simulante velare. Profecto qui non amat non dolet. Oritur enim de nature lege compassio. Nam alieni sensum doloris, nisi animo per similitudinem introceptum [*sic*] complectamur spectatum in alio, non dolemus. Quod enim experimento in se abhorreat, sensu speciem in memoria suscitante, compatiitur animis quia species amati coherescens introrsus amanti qualis excitatur intus talem gignit affectum felix iocundum adversa turbatum.

Ideo qui patres sunt liberum iacturam in patribus absque doloris morsu non audiunt quia mentis oculis dum lustrat in memoria quid foris sentit iuxta imaginatam speciem sauciat et geritur quodammodo in ipsa quod sentitur in alio. Quod magnus vates expressit cum spectasset Aeneas senem Priamum natumque obtruncare ad aras inquit 'At me tum primum saevus circumstetit horror; obstipui, subiit cari genitoris imago, ut regem equevum crudeli vulnere [MS funere] vidi

Consoler: It is womanly to indulge in suffering, manly to scorn it!

Mourner: On the contrary, it is inhuman not to feel suffering enough or to hide it in a disingenuous soul with an obvious stern ostentation. Surely to love is to suffer. Indeed, compassion arises from the law of nature. For we are not pained by another's feeling of suffering by means of its resemblance seeping into our soul unless we embrace it when seen in the other. Indeed, what we may abhor to experience ourselves, when a sensation stirs up an image stored in our memory, we have compassion in our souls because a certain happy sight of the beloved clinging to the lover is stirred inwardly and brings forth such pleasant affection within, that had been troubled by an adversity.

For that reason, there are fathers who cannot hear of the loss of a child among their forefathers without a pang of suffering, because in the mind's eye, so long as what he feels from outside alongside an imagined appearance illuminates his memory, he is wounded and is drawn into it in a very certain way because it is felt in another. The great poet [Virgil] describes this when Aeneas witnessed the old Priam and his son being slaughtered at the altar: 'But then dire horror at first surrounded me; I was astounded, the image of my dear father rose up, as I saw the equally aged king breathe out his life

vitam ex[h]alantem, subiit deserta Creusa et direpta domus et parvi casus Juli.' Ita rursum qui minime pater fuit, quia dolentis patris imagine caruit, patrum gementium audit lamenta non sentit. Id germano Terentianus obiecit 'Ei mihi disce' inquit 'pater esse ab hiis qui vere sciunt' [recte: Ei mihi pater esse disce ab illis, qui vere sciunt].

Flevit ideo super Lazarum Christus et laudatus est. Ecclesiae inquit [fol. 52^v B] scriptura quomodo amabant eum, luxerunt filii genitorem Israelem XXX diebus. Flevit filia Jephthae mensibus duobus. Fatum suum persequebatur Absalom patrem et tamen pater defuncto lacrimas uberes non negavit. Flevit quoque populus Jonatham planctu magno valde.

Sed ut at initium redeam, primus utique pater quo nullus scientior editus unquam fuit toto seculo luxisse filium memoratur. Ita dolet quisque subduci quod amat ut etiam quorum certissima in celo felicitas extimatur eos obire lugeant, sic planctus, lamenta, questus Dyonisii et Thimothei magistro sublato praedicantur. Flevere Ambrosium familiares et noti flevere Martinum. fletus est Augustinus. fletus Franciscus quamquam certa fides inter beatos reponeret. Natos procul ablegamus ad sapientie studia. Patresfamilias mercature negotio peregrinantur. Nec illos siccis luminibus nec istos spe licet reditus limine emitti.

from the cruel wound, Creusa abandoned, the house ransacked and the fall of little Julius' (*Aeneid*, II. 559–62). Thus, on the contrary, he, who was not at all a father, because he wanted to embrace the ghost of his suffering father, heard the lament of weeping forefathers [and] did not feel. The Terentian character [sc. Demea] scolded his brother: 'Oh dear, learn', he said, 'to be a father from these who really know'. (Terence, *Adelphoe*, 125).

Therefore, Christ wept for Lazarus, and he was praised: The Church's scriptures tell of how they loved him [sc. Lazarus] (John 11.1–45). Israel's sons mourned their father for thirty days. The daughter of Jephthah wept for two months (Judges 11.29–40). It was said Absalom attacked his father and yet the father did not deny his death abundant tears (II Samuel 18.1–17). The people also greatly wept for Jonathan in loud lament (II Samuel 1.12).

But so that I might return to the beginning, certainly the first father, who is said to be the wisest man that ever existed in all times, is remembered to have wept for his son. Just as everyone suffers when what they love is taken away, although they believe in their most certain happiness in heaven, they mourn that they die, so too the wailing, laments, and mourning of Dionysius and Timothy for their fallen master were foretold. The household did weep for Ambrose and friends wept for Martin. Augustine was wept for; Francis was wept for, although his firm faith placed him among the blessed. We send sons far away to study philosophy. The heads of families travel around for their commercial business. Neither the former with dry eyes, nor the latter with hope for their return, may be farewelled from our lintels.

natura patitur tam fructus rei
praesentis vivat, contristat absentis.

Ergo si recenti adhuc vulnere filium
parens fleo in quo virtutis normam
violo? Aut enim omnis humana
consuetudo damnabilis aut decessu
carissimorum pignorum lugere,
plangere, conturbari nature lex
est? Si qui autem funera cantibus
et symphoniis fletibusque natales
celebrare consueverunt, minime ad
suorum caritatem sed ad infestam
vite [fol. 53^r A] mutabilis sortem
que nulla sui parte flenda non est
refererunt. Quare quo amplius
amamus ampliore dolore torquemur
signaque dolentis uberius pro
hostia cordis effundimus. Ita in
his fidem lacrima vendicat ut sepe
misero in funere tyrannorum, qui
plurimum odere, acriores eiulatus
exundantioresque ploratus quo
fore ubi nequaquam est dilectio
credatur, emittunt, quo quidem
simulacro doloris, servi plurumque
dominorum, uxor mariti, maritus
uxoris, frater fratris, genitoris etiam
filius, exequias comitatur. Si ergo
lacrima nonnumquam amorem ubi
minime viget iactare novit, quanto
magis, quando verus stimulat,
contineri nequit? Etsi condecorat
fictum dolorem quomodo
dedecorat verum sevoque vulnere
prodeuntem?

Nature toils so that the enjoyment of what
is present lasts and is afflicted by what is
absent.

Therefore, if I, a parent, with still so recent
a wound, weep for a son, in what way do
I violate the norms of virtue? For is either
all human custom damnable, or is it a law
of nature to mourn, to lament, to be upset
by the death of a much beloved child?
Whoever is accustomed to celebrating
funerals with songs, hymns, and tears,
recount less the family's affection for loved
ones and more the hostile fate of their
unpredictable life, which is in every way
deplorable. For this reason, the more we
love, the more we are torn by grief and
pour out the signs of our suffering more
copiously for the sacrifice of our heart.
Thus, in the subdued funeral of a tyrant,
a tear is a claim for loyalty for those who
hated him the most, who force out more
bitter wailing and more overflowing
lament to make others believe that they
are not rejoicing, they indeed display a
grief that resembles what is experienced,
when attending their funeral, by slaves
for their master, a wife for her husband,
a husband for his wife, a brother for his
sibling, or even a son for his own parent.
If, therefore, a tear sometimes tries to boast
of love when it does not flourish at all, how
much more, when truth goads it forth, can
it not be contained? Even if it [sometimes]
embellishes feigned suffering, how does
it dishonour true pain coming out of a
terrible loss?