Beliefs shaping the practice of Christian school leadership:

Implications for the principalship

Ian Sinclair O'Harae

B.A. (University of Sydney), Dip. Ed. (Sydney Teachers' College),M. Ed. St. (College of Christian Higher Education)

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy of the University of New England

Acknowledgements

'The end of a matter is better than its beginning', so wrote the wise person in Ecclesiastes 7:8, so the end of a thesis is better than its beginning. The journey from commencement to conclusion of this research project has been the result of the help and encouragement of many people whom I wish to acknowledge and thank.

I wish to express thanks to my superb supervisors Professor Kay Harman and Dr Dan Riley for their careful, insightful, and thought provoking supervision throughout the entire project.

To the principals, staff and board members who participated in this study, thank you for the access you provided to your schools, beliefs and lives.

I express my thanks to the staff of St George Christian School for their input over many years, as well as to the board for their support, especially in allowing me to take a term's study leave in 2003 to work on the project. It was a great privilege to serve as principal of SGCS. I also thank my friends from Stanmore Baptist Church who have encouraged and supported me over many years and I am delighted to have the privilege of serving them as pastor.

I especially thank my wife Pamela for her constant love, wisdom, support and encouragement. I also express thanks to our wonderful children Alison, Campbell, Bronwyn, Esther and Robert, all of whom have been a strength and source of real encouragement.

Finally, I thank my God for his grace and strength in enabling me to complete the thesis; my prayer from first to last has been that it will bring glory to him and be useful for his kingdom.

Soli Deo Gloria

Abstract

This research investigated the extent to which the biblical and theological beliefs of principals associated with the Christian Schools Australia (CSA) group influenced their leadership practices.

In many nations worldwide schools are experiencing a series of seismic shifts in terms of the educational, social, economic and political expectations being placed on them. In this process the role of principals has come under greater scrutiny as they seek to effectively lead increasingly complex, sophisticated educational centres of learning and teaching.

Researchers have explored the influence that principals have on the dynamics of such diverse areas as school culture, community, values, relationships, stress, academic performance of students, and professional development of staff. However, limited research has taken place to investigate how the personal beliefs of principals influence their school leadership practices.

This research project was undertaken within the Christian school sector, which is one of the most rapidly growing areas of Australian education. Its purpose was to determine how and to what extent the biblical and theological beliefs held by principals of the Christian Schools Australia (CSA) group influenced their school leadership practices. The notion of leadership was explored through examining various theories, especially those of transformational and servant leadership. Additionally an inductive method was employed to explore the biblical dimensions of leadership, concluding that the Bible identifies Christ as the paradigm for human leadership, and that leaders are to be seen as God's people in God's place to fulfil God's purposes. Against this theoretical and theological background the research was undertaken in three interconnected phases, adopting a case study methodology which offered a multi-method, triangulated approach.

Phase 1 was designed to establish what core theological beliefs were held by principals within the sector, and to what extent these beliefs were considered to be influential in the ways that principals led their schools. This was done by collecting data from questionnaires completed by principals across the nation. Phase 2 was designed to explore what core educational leadership competencies principals of Christian schools possessed. Data relating to specific educational leadership behaviours and practices were collected by using an online 360° review of principals which was completed by up to 35 staff from their respective schools. The results from these were compared with national benchmarks to ascertain the relative status of their educational leadership capabilities. Phase 3 consisted of 96 interviews with principals, board members and staff from six case study schools in both urban and regional areas across Australia. These interviews explored in depth the question of whether the biblical and theological beliefs of principals did influence their school leadership practices.

Findings from this research indicate that Christian school principals do hold a set of core biblical and theological beliefs which they view to be highly influential for their leadership practices and that they do possess core educational leadership competencies generally equivalent to national benchmarks. A major conclusion is that biblical and theological beliefs do influence school leadership practices, especially in the important areas of vision, leadership style and relationships, but they do not do so uniformly or consistently. Nor is the positive correlation between beliefs held and practices an indicator of effective leadership.

Implications of the findings are the importance of having systems and mechanisms in place for principal preparation that include biblical, theological and organizational training.

Certification

I certify that the substance of this thesis has not already been submitted for any degree and is not currently being submitted for any other degree or qualification.

I certify that any help received in preparing this thesis, and all sources used, have been acknowledged in this thesis.



Ian Sinclair O'Harae

Table of Contents

Acknow	ledgements	ii
Abstract	t	iii
Certifica	ation	v
Table of	Contents	vi
Abbrevi	ations	xv
Chapter	1 Context, purpose and orientation	
Ir	ntroduction	1
P	urpose	4
Α	ssumptions	4
C	Prientation	6
C	Context	9
В	siblical leadership and schools	14
N	Methodology	17
S	ignificance of the study	18
L	imitations of the study	19
C	Outline of the thesis	20
Chapter	2 Literature review	22
Ir	ntroduction	22
Ir	n the eye of the beholder – defining leadership	23
T	rait or 'Great man' Theory	25
В	sehaviour theories	26
S	ituational and Contingency theories	28
T	ransactional/Transformational theory	29
	Measuring Transformational leadership	30
Т	ransformational leadership and schools	31

	Servant leadership theory	35
	Measuring Servant leadership	36
	Distributed leadership	41
	Leadership theories and this study	42
	Conceptual framework	43
	The leader as person	46
	Leadership and credibility	48
	Leadership and relationships	51
	Leadership and values	52
	Leadership confronting a challenging, changing environment	54
	Relationship of this study to previous areas of research	56
	Summary	60
Chapt	er 3 Biblical perspectives on leadership	62
	Introduction	62
	Towards a biblical perspective on leadership	62
	Old Testament words	63
	New Testament words	65
	Towards establishing a biblical framework	67
	The enigma of biblical leadership	72
	Constructing a theological framework	73
	The Triune nature of God as the core determiner for leadership	73
	Leadership inherent in the Triune God	74
	Leadership is inherent in humanity as created in the image of God	79
	Humanity - male and female - created in the image of God	82
	Leadership and Jesus Christ – the God-Human	83
	Summary	85
Chapt	er 4 Biblical leaders and leadership motifs	87
	Introduction	87
	Old Testament conceptualisations of leadership	87
	Leadership in pre-fall Eden	87
	Specific Old Testament leadership roles	88

	Servant motif	91
	The OT use of 'ebed	92
	The Servant of the Lord	92
	Shepherd motif	95
	New Testament perspectives on leadership	96
	Christ as the Servant of the Lord	97
	Christ as Shepherd of his people	99
	New Testament patterns of leadership	100
	New Testament leadership and its Greco-Roman background	102
	Summary	105
Chapt	er 5 Methodological considerations	107
	Introduction	107
	Rationale	108
	Ethical considerations	109
	Research codes to maintain anonymity	109
	Selection of schools for the study	111
	Case study methodology	113
	Research phases	116
	Linguistic and philosophical dimensions	117
	Verifiability and triangulation	119
	The methodological process	120
	Phase 1: Survey/Questionnaire	120
	Phase 2: 360° Principal profiling	122
	Phase 3: Semi-structured interviews with key informants	124
	The interview process	125
	Qualitative Data Analysis Software (QDAS)	127
	QSR N6	128
	Summary	131
Chapte	er 6 Key beliefs shaping the practice of leadership	133
	Introduction	133
	Phase 1 Survey/Questionnaire	133
	Demography	134

	Summary of demographic data	136
	Main motivation for becoming a principal	136
	The call	136
	Making a difference	140
	Core beliefs	142
	Rationale for including the five areas of Christian belief	143
	Core beliefs – The Bible	145
	Core beliefs – God	146
	Core beliefs – humanity	147
	Core beliefs – Jesus Christ	148
	Core beliefs – Salvation	149
	Other influential beliefs, factors or comments	151
	Open-ended questions	152
	The main factors shaping an understanding and practice of leadership	155
	God's sovereignty	156
	The Bible	157
	The call	158
	Principals' vision of Christian leadership	159
	The dual dimensions of Christian schools	161
	What principals hope to accomplish in leading their present school	164
	Strategies to achieve these goals	166
	Spiritual dimensions – Prayer and Bible teaching	167
	Conclusions from Phase 1	168
Chapt	er 7 Educational leadership competencies:	
	Findings and discussion	170
	Introduction	170
	Phase 2: 360° leadership profiling	170
	QUT's Quality Leadership Profile (QLP)	172
	QLP results	176
	Christian school specific items	177
	School and principal profiles	179
	Sydney Christian College	180
	Melbourne Christian College	186

Brish	oane Christian College	192
Kiml	perley Christian College	197
Eyre	Christian College	201
Huor	n Christian College	205
Com	parative tables	210
Sumi	mary	212
Chapter 8	Chapter 8 Case study schools: Principals' biblical and	
	theological beliefs and school vision	214
Intro	duction	214
Fram	ework	215
	Vision	216
	Relationships	216
	Leadership styles	217
Lead	ership practices and vision	218
	How Paul's biblical and theological beliefs influence	
	the vision of SCC	218
	How Robert's biblical and theological beliefs influence	
	the vision of MCC	222
	How Michael's biblical and theological beliefs influence	
	the vision of BCC	226
	How John's biblical and theological beliefs influence	
	the vision of KCC	230
	How David's biblical and theological beliefs influence	
	the vision of ECC	232
	How Steven's biblical and theological beliefs influence	
	the vision of HCC	236
Sum	mary	238
Chapter 9	Case study schools: Principals' biblical	
	and theological beliefs –	
	Relationships and leadership styles	240
	Relationships	240
	Staff	240

Power		245
	Relationships and conflict with board and/or church	245
Leade	rship styles	252
	Motivation	252
	Legacy	257
Summ	ary	261
	The person of the principal	262
	The history of the school	263
	Relationships	263
	The relationship of the principal with the board chair	264
	The relationship of principals, schools with the	
	sponsoring church	265
	The perception of the principal by staff	265
Chapter 10	Conclusions and recommendations	266
Introd	uction	266
		267
Key co	onclusions	269
1	Christian school principals adhere to core	
bib	plical and theological beliefs	269
2	Christian school principals displayed	
con	re educational leadership competencies	269
3	The biblical and theological beliefs of principals do	
inf	luence their school leadership practices,	
bu	t not uniformly or consistently	270
	Vision	270
	Personality types and perceived people skills	271
	The identity of the organization as a Christian school	273
	School success was measured by tangible and intangible elements	273
	Curriculum and pedagogy	274
	Intra-school relationships	275
	Governance	275
	Building community and developing culture	276
	Conflict management	277

	Organizational structures	277
	Spirituality	278
	Recommendations	279
	Principal preparation	280
	Theological training	282
	Training in biblical leadership	283
	Areas for further research	284
	Gender and leadership in Christian schools	284
	Effective mechanisms for the biblical and	
	theological training of principals	284
	The relationship between personality types	
	and emotional intelligence and the principalship	285
	Relationships between the sponsoring church	
	and the school	285
List of tab	oles	
1	Order of persons in NT Trinitarian passages	76
2	NT uses of Isaiah's Servant songs	95
3	School codes and principal pseudonyms	110
4	Case study school profiles	112
5	Principal age	134
6	Principal gender	134
7	Principal cultural background	134
8	Principal tertiary qualifications	135
9	Principal total years in teaching	135
10	Total years as principal	135
11	Total years as principal at current school	135
12	Principal: Other professions	136
13	Core beliefs – the Bible	145
14	Core beliefs – God	146
15	Core beliefs – Humanity	148
16	Core beliefs – Jesus Christ	149
17	Core beliefs – Salvation	150

18	The main factors shaping an understanding and practice	
	of leadership	153
19	The main biblical and theological beliefs shaping an	
	understanding and practice of leadership	155
20	CSA principal QLP averages compared with national averages	176
21	Christian School specific items: Principal averages	178
22	Christian School specific items: Principal averages by ranking	179
23	Paul's QLP averages compared with national and CSA averages	181
24	Differences between Paul and other school respondents	181
25	Paul and further development required	182
26	Paul and Christian leadership profiling	184
27	Robert's QLP averages compared with national and CSA averages	188
28	Differences between Robert and other school respondents	188
29	Robert and Christian leadership profiling	191
30	Michael's QLP averages compared with national and	
	CSA averages	193
31	Differences between Michael and other school respondents	194
32	Michael and Christian leadership profiling	195
33	John's QLP averages compared with CSA and national averages	198
34	Differences between John and other school respondents	199
35	John and Christian leadership profiling	200
36	David and Christian leadership profiling	203
37	Differences between David and other school respondents	203
38	David and Christian leadership profiling	204
39	Steven's QLP averages compared with CSA and national	
	averages	206
40	Steven compared with CSA averages	207
41	Steven and Christian leadership profiling	208
42	Six principals QLP average scores compared with national and	
	CSA averages	210
43	Six principals Christian specific items average scores compared	
	with CSA averages	211

List of figures

1	Conceptual framework	45
2	A theological framework for biblical dimensions of leadership	68
3	Conceptual and biblical framework linkage	70
4	Research phases	116
5	Epistemological and methodological linkage	119
6	Key Christian belief-school outcome connections	163
7	The principal's biblical and theological beliefs and	
	school leadership practices	215
8	Terry's Action Wheel	263
Bib	liography	287
App	pendices	321
App	pendix 1	322
	Invitation letter to CSA principals	322
	Information sheet	323
	Consent form Phase 1	325
	Questionnaire	326
App	pendix 2	338
	Information sheet Phases 2 and 3	338
	Consent form Phases 2 and 3	340
	Letter re QLP	341
	QLP 360° profiling process and questions sets	343
Арр	pendix 3	348
	Suggested in school interview process	348
	Case study interview questions	351

Abbreviations

Bible books

Old Testament

Gen Genesis

Ex Exodus

Lev Leviticus

Num Numbers

Deut Deuteronomy

Josh Joshua

Jud Judges

Ruth Ruth

1 Sam 1 Samuel

2 Sam 2 Samuel

1 Kings 1 Kings

2 Kings 2 Kings

1 Chron 1 Chronicles

2 Chron 2 Chronicles

Ezra Ezra

Neh Nehemiah

Est Esther

Job Job

Ps (plural Pss) Psalms

Prov Proverbs

Eccl Ecclesiastes

Song of Solomon

Is Isaiah

Jer Jeremiah

Lam Lamentations

Ezek Ezekiel

Dan Daniel

Hos Hosea

Joel Joel

Amos Amos

Obad Obadiah

Jon Jonah

Mic Micah

Nah Nahum

Hab Habakkuk

Zeph Zephaniah

Hag Haggai

Zech Zechariah

Mal Malachi

New Testament

Matt Matthew

Mark Mark

Luke Luke

John John

Acts Acts of the Apostles

Rom Romans

1 Cor 1 Corinthians

2 Cor 2 Corinthians

Gal Galatians

Eph Ephesians

Phil Philippians

Col Colossians

1 Thess 1 Thessalonians

2 Thess 2 Thessalonians

1 Tim 1 Timothy

2 Tim 2 Timothy

Titus Titus

Phm Philemon

Heb Hebrews

James James

1 Pet 1 Peter

2 Pet 2 Peter

1 John 1 John 2 John 3 John 3 John Jude Jude

Rev Revelation

Other abbreviations

OT Old Testament

LXX Septuagint

NT New Testament

BC Before Christ

AD Anno Domini

CCS Christian Community Schools

CSA Christian Schools Australia

CPCS Christian Parent Controlled Schools

ACE Accelerated Christian Education

AOG Assemblies of God

School pseudonyms

SCC Sydney Christian College

MCC Melbourne Christian College

BCC Brisbane Christian College

KCC Kimberley Christian College

ECC Eyre Christian College

HCC Huon Christian College

English Bible

The English Bible quotations throughout this thesis are from the English Standard Version ©2001 (ESV)