The dilemma of adaptation and assimilation:

a case study of the Temple Society Australia.

by

Irene Anne Bouzo
Dip T (Prim) Burwood Teachers College
Cert of Adult Education Hawthorn Institute of Education
Post Grad Dip Multicultural Education University of New England

A thesis submitted for the Doctorate of Philosophy of the University of New England

28 March 2007

I certify that I am the sole author and that the substance of this thesis has not already been submitted for any degree and is not being currently submitted for other degrees.

I certify that to the best of my knowledge that any help received in preparing this thesis, and all sources used, have been acknowledged in this thesis.



## **Acknowledgments**

I extend my heartfelt thanks to the following people for their assistance and support:

To my principal supervisor Professor Anne-Katrin Eckermann for the outstanding quality of her advice and guidance, her uplifting support through most difficult times and for challenging me to aspire to the highest potential.

To my co-supervisor Dr Mariel Tisdell for invaluable advice and assistance with the German language and translations.

To the Regional Council of the Temple Society Australia for the support and encouragement which included permission to conduct the research, and to the Archive Personnel for their kind and friendly assistance in the location of references.

To the interview participants for their warm welcome, generosity and the depth of personal stories they shared. My thoughts are with those who have since passed away. May they rest in peace.

To the many members of the Temple Society who contributed their wisdom and who read and commented on the manuscript.

To my friend and support person Renate Beilharz, who challenged, questioned and encouraged me to persevere and overcome obstacles.

To Hulda Wagner and Peter G. Hornung who read the entire manuscript and offered valuable insights that were underpinned by their deep understanding of Templer history and languages.

To Susan Manton who worked through the entire manuscript and gave me invaluable advice on clarity of words, passages and layout improvements.

To my son Jevan for his assistance with computer analysis software, and to him and my daughter Tamara for their unfailing support and encouragement over many years.

To my husband Emad for his understanding and constant support in every aspect of our family life that set me free to complete this thesis.

#### **Dedication**

This thesis is dedicated to my parents Abram Dyck and Friedel nee Heselschwerdt who lived by the Templer faith.

#### **Abstract**

This thesis examines the dilemma of adaptation and assimilation and language maintenance or shift in the faith-based, immigrant community, the Temple Society Australia (TSA). The case study is of German-speaking Templer 'accidental immigrants', many displaced and unrepatriable, who arrived in Australia from the 1940s to 1960s, and includes their locally-born partners and children. The study challenges the assumption that the Templers assimilated successfully. Assimilationist thinking has been revisited recently through the government's push for a national identity based on national values. Australia is a country with a wide diversity of languages, still characterised by a monolingual mindset (Clyne 2005). Explored are the rich community languages resources and multiple identities of an immigrant community that has shaped and been shaped by Australian institutions for 65 years. Ordinary Templers tell the extraordinary stories of how they adjusted, the cultural and linguistic choices that impacted on their community building and how their transnational identities were formed.

This ethnographic case study, conducted from an insider participant-researcher perspective, was located around Melbourne. The data were collected from personal profile and language use surveys, internal TSA archives, interviews of 69 Templers in Swabian, German and English, as well as researcher-participant observations at religious and community events. The analysis used Ethnograph computer software.

The findings illustrate that the Templer immigrants went through nine ways of thinking about adaptation rather than assimilating. Three distinct profiles of Templers and their offspring are evidenced: the first generation of inward-lookers, the one-and-a-half generation of assimilation experts and the second generation of adapters. A positive expression of multiple collective identities of the Templer community emerges that consists of religious, diaspora, bilingual and transnational identities. The results reinforce the need for inclusion of immigrant stories and complementary multiple identities as community builders that shape Australia's nation-building and national identity.

#### **CONTENTS**

LIST OF TABLES	5
LIST OF ACRONYMS	7
GLOSSARY	8
CHAPTER 1	17
INTRODUCTION	17
CONTEXT OF THE STUDY	19
DELIMITATIONS AND LIMITATIONS	21
ASSUMPTIONS	22
SIGNIFICANCE OF THE PROBLEM	23
THE SHAPE OF THE STUDY AND FOLLOWING CHAPTERS	24
CHAPTER 2	26
LITERATURE REVIEW	26
Introduction	26
ADAPTATION AND ASSIMILATION	28
Adaptation is never finished	28
The legacy of forgotten assimilation years: immigrants are only welcome if	31
Beyond assimilation	
THE TEMPLERS IN VICTORIA: ADAPTATION AND ASSIMILATION	39
LANGUAGE CONTACT	43
Linguistic diversity matters	
Diversity amongst German-speaking immigrants	44
The cult of bilingualism	46
Loss of diversity: language shift	47
Maintaining diversity: stable bilingualism	
Bridging the language of the diaspora	
Diversity matters to 'world kids' at school	
THE GERMAN-SPEAKING TEMPLERS IN MELBOURNE	
IDENTITY	
Identity formation in the diaspora	
Markers of identification	
THE SWABIAN-PALESTINIAN TEMPLERS IN MELBOURNE	
Conclusion	67
CHAPTER 3	70
METHODOLOGY	70
Introduction	
QUALITATIVE DESIGN BASED ON NATURALISTIC PARADIGM	71

Assumptions	71
Case study as research design	
DESCRIPTION OF THE STUDY	
Researcher-participant	
Snowball technique	
Sampling procedures	
DATA COLLECTION	
Interviews	
Demographic, immigration history and language surveys	
Archival sources	
Direct observation	
Data analysis	81
ETHICAL ISSUES	83
LIMITATIONS	
Trustworthiness and authenticity in data collection and analysis	86
CONCLUSION	
CHAPTER 4	90
THE IMPACT OF ASSIMILATION ON ADAPTATION AND LANGUAGE	90
Introduction	
DEMOGRAPHIC PROFILE OF TEMPLERS INTERVIEWED	
TEMPLERS' RESPONSES TO THREE RESEARCH QUESTIONS	
ASSIMILATIONIST THINKING	
Trying to fit in	
"Coming out" as accidental immigrants	
Better off naturalised	
RE-ESTABLISHMENT THINKING	
Strong ties create urban Templer village life	
"Mitmachen" - readiness to help and sacrifice for community service	
IDEALISED THINKING OR ACCUMULATED MEMORY	
The unforgettable German Colonies	
Going home to Tatura	
Benchmarking community life from there to here	
RELIGIOUS THINKING	
Keeping the faith - lost hopes and dreams	
Templer core values	
Conclusion	145
CHAPTER 5	149
THE IMPACT OF LANGUAGE RETENTION, TRANSMISSION AND SHIFT (	
	149
Introduction	149
ETHNICITY THINKING	
German ethnicity – valuable cultural capital or unwanted baggage	
The balancing act of being 'German at heart' in Australia	
At home in Australia	
BILINGUAL THINKING	
Schwäbisch is the best language	
The dilemma of German language transmission	
Core values of language and religion	
Insider Templer talk	
Nowadays I read more English	
Conclusion	
CHAPTER 6	211

IDENTITY FORMATION, ADAPTATION AND COMMUNITY STRENGTH	211
Introduction	211
DIASPORA THINKING	212
Multiple loyalties	213
Bonds of tradition and heritage	215
Loyalties to many homelands	218
TRANSNATIONAL THINKING	225
Elasticity of belonging	227
Back home tourism	227
Transnational religious communities	
One president, two regions	231
Transnational thinking and language revival	234
Mapping the transnational multiple history trail	236
COMMUNITY BUILDING THINKING	238
Quest for membership	239
The changing nature of communities	242
Focus on faith	248
Infrastructure takeover and makeover	252
Symbolic bonding and building bridges	257
CONCLUSION	264
CHAPTER 7	268
CONCLUSION	268
Introduction	268
NINE WAYS OF THINKING ABOUT ADAPTATION	
THE DILEMMAS OF ADAPTATION OR ASSIMILATION / LANGUAGE MAINTENANCE OR SHIFT	
1. Dispersal or re-grouping	
2. To be the same or different	
3. Language maintenance and linguistic assimilation	
4. To speak German and not want to	
5. Competing core values of religion and language	
6. Who will take over?	
PRODUCTIVE CONSEQUENCES OF DILEMMAS	
About assimilation	
About language retention	
IDENTITY FORMATION IN THREE STEPS	
MULTIPLE TEMPLER IDENTITIES	
Religious identity	
Diaspora identity	
Bilingual identity	
Transnational identity	
THREE GENERATION PROFILES	
The first generation: the inward-lookers	282
The one-and-a-half generation: the assimilation experts	
The second generation: the adapters	
Conclusion	
RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH	288
Multilingual communities	
Multi-faith communities	
Capacity building and community development	
BIBLIOGRAPHY	291
A PPENDICES	

VERSION)		
APPENDIX 2 PLAIN LANC	UAGE STATEMENT: OPEN LETTER TO ALL INTERVIEW PARTICIPAN	NTS (C
VERSION)		
	TERVIEW SCHEDULE - QUESTIONS 1-44	
	SCHEDULE FOR KEY PERSONS	
APPENDIX 5 LANGUAGE	SURVEY ON SELF-ASCRIBED COMPETENCY	
APPENDIX 6 LANGUAGE	SURVEY ON SELF-ASCRIBED USE AND DOMAINS	
	OATA SURVEY	
APPENDIX 8 CONTENT A	NALYSIS OF RUNDSCHREIBEN AND TEMPLER RECORD (TRIAL VE	RSION
APPENDIX 9 CONTENT A	NALYSIS OF TEMPLER RECORD - FINAL VERSION OF CATEGORIES	BASE
EMERGING THEMES		
	FOR RESEARCH PARTICIPANT	
APPENDIX 11 TABLE A1	- CONTENT ANALYSIS OF TSA RUNDSCHREIBEN (CIRCULAR) IN	1950s
	- TEMPLER VOLUNTEER WORK WITH NON-TEMPLER GROUPS	
	F THE SOCIETY	
	E TEMPLE SOCIETY, PHILOSOPHICAL CONCEPTS	

### LIST OF TABLES

Table 3. 1 Gender and Birthplace of Interviewees	. 77
Table 4. 1 Birthplace and age of participants at time of interview	. 92
Table 4. 2 Age of participants at time of migration to Australia	
Table 4. 3 Templer participants born in Australia	
Table 4. 4 Age groups of interviewed Templers during internment in Australia	
Table 4. 5 Residential areas of interview participants in Melbourne regions	
Table 4. 6 Templer volunteering work indicated by interview participants	
Table 4. 7 Importance of community service amongst interview participants	
Table 4. 8 Strong trend in group responses to questions about Templer faith	
Table 5. 1 Number of comments that expressed participants' feelings about their Germ	nan
background	155
Table 5. 2 Number of comments that reported language use in the home	164
Table 5. 3 Number of positive comments about children, grandchildren who studied	
German	173
Table 5. 4 Responses to the question: Should marriage partners learn German?	178
Table 5. 5 Number of comments on the use of German and English in Saal	183
Table 5. 6 Religious descriptors used in Templer literature (Lange 1996)	186
Table 5. 7 Comments about language preference for written articles in the monthly	
circular Templer Record	
Table 5. 8 Oracy: Self-reported language proficiency in Cohort 1 (n=21), first generati	on
Templer immigrants	
Table 5. 9 Oracy: Self-reported language proficiency in Cohort 2 (n=29), one-and-a-ha	alf
generation Templer immigrants	200
Table 5. 10 Oracy: Self-reported language proficiency in Cohort 3 (n=18), second	
generation Templer immigrants	201
Table 5. 11 Literacy: Self-reported language proficiency in Cohort 1 (n=21), first	
generation Templer immigrants	
Table 5. 12 Literacy: Self-reported language proficiency in Cohort 2 (n=29), one-and-	a-
half generation Templer immigrants	202
Table 5. 13 Literacy: Self-reported language proficiency in Cohort 3 (n=18), second	
generation Templer immigrants	203
Table 5. 14 Lifestyle domains and preferred language use of Cohort 1 (n=21), the first	
generation Templer immigrants	204
Table 5. 15 Lifestyle domains and preferred language use of Cohort 2 (n=29), the one-	-
and-a-half generation of Templer immigrants	204

Table 5. 16 Lifestyle domains and preferred language use of Cohort 3 (n=18), the second
generation of Templer immigrants
Table 5. 17 Self-ascribed actual language use and frequency three generations of Templer immigrants
Table 7. 1 Multiple Templer Identities

# **List of Acronyms**

TSA

Temple Society Australia

TGD

Tempelgesellschaft in Deutschland (Temple Society Germany)

## Glossary

- Accidental immigrants is a term used by Draper (1984) and Knowles (2000) to
  describe people who were forced into geographic displacement or involuntary
  migration. It is a term they employed to describe civilian internees in Canada. In
  this study, it describes a large group of more than 500 Templers, who were
  deported to and interned in Australia.
- 2. Adaptation refers to the process of adaptation by immigrants to a new country. In this study, the focus is on Eckermann's (1994) cultural ecology approach based on the natural process where people adapt to their new environment as a matter of economic, social and spiritual survival by making problem solving decisions. In this sense, adaptation is a coping behaviour.
- 3. **Assimilation** was a government policy in Australia during the 1940s, 1950s and 1960s. Non-English background immigrants were expected to give up their language and culture and conform to the dominant British/Australian culture.
- 4. **Bilingualism** occurs where languages are in contact and an individual has varying levels of proficiency in two languages (Dalby 2002). In this study, bilingualism is used in two ways, both to refer to an individual and a community. A bilingual person is one who uses two languages in daily life. I prefer Dalby's (2002:xi) definition which means a person who uses one of the languages 'adequately' or well enough to get by, but 'not necessarily knowing them both equally'.

- 5. **Bilingual community** is one in which two languages are used in daily life such as the national language and the immigrant mother tongue (Dalby 2002, Lo Bianco 2006). It is important to note that not all the people in the community need to be bilingual, but only some of them (Dalby 2002:xi).
- British Palestine refers to the British Mandate of Palestine (1920-1948). The British Mandate ended on 15 May 1948 with the establishment of the State of Israel (Smith 1984).
- 7. Code switching also known as code-mixing or borrowing or 'code switch' (Eckermann 1994:226) represents the situation where bilingual people use words and expressions from two or more languages in rapid succession in one conversation (Clyne 2003; Muysken 2000 in Clyne 2003; Liebscher and Schulze 2004; Giampana 2001; Eckermann 1994). It is common amongst post-war German-speakers in Australia (Clyne 2003).
- 8. **Community languages** are languages other than English and Aboriginal languages used in Australia (Clyne 1991:3).
- 9. Core value refers to Smolicz's (2001) core value theory (Clyne 2003). Every culture has certain core values that 'represent its heartland and act as identifying values for its members' (Smolicz 2001:770). Language is most effective as a core value where it is linked with other core elements such as religion and historical consciousness (Clyne 2003; Smolicz 2001).
- 10. Cyprus camp where some Templers were in the late 1940s was not an internment camp. They were moved there as refugees after the attack on Waldheim in Palestine because British authorities could no longer promise to keep them safe. On Cyprus Templers could come and go, but had little money, received regular payments from the Public Custodian and were not allowed to seek paid employment (Sauer 1991).

- 11. **Diaspora** is used to refer to any ethnic groups forced or induced to leave their original homeland and become dispersed or scattered throughout other parts of the world. They maintain their language and culture.
- 12. **Die Warte des Tempels** (*The Sentinel of the Temple*) was founded in 1885 and is the monthly circular of the Tempelgesellschaft in Deutschland (*Temple Society in Germany*). Later it was renamed Die Warte. It was also the forerunner to the Rundschreiben and Templer Record in Australia.
- 13. **Emic** perspective is an insider viewpoint obtained by participant observation when collecting data for a case study (Fielding and Moran 2006:1). It yields a rich, detailed and in-depth picture of the social relationships in a community, facilitates access to participants, and improves the level of trustworthiness between researcher and participant. Emic contrasts with the etic or outsider view.
- 14. **Established immigrants** refers to long-term settlers, in particular the large immigration intake of post-war Europeans in Australia, as opposed to more recent arrivals and emerging immigrant communities.
- 15. **Ethnic group** is a term commonly used in Australia to mean non-English speaking immigrants and distinguishes them from mainstream Anglo-Australians. It is not a very scientific term but is commonly understood and used by 'ethnic' organisations and individuals (Jupp 2002: 2-3).
- 16. **Faith community** is a collective group whose members all believe in the same religious concepts, or at least did when it was founded. An example of a faith-based community is the Temple Society.
- 17. Fluent bilingual is a person who uses both languages adequately or very well.

- 18. **German Colonies** were part of the German-speaking European settlements scattered throughout pre-World War II Palestine. The largest of the Colonies were the German-speaking Templers (Sauer 9991; Eilser 2001).
- 19. German diaspora of ethnic Germans was common in the 1700s and 1800s in Eastern Europe and parts of Russia. The Templers formed a German diaspora in nineteenth century Palestine.
- 20. German War Cemetery adjoins the Tatura Cemetery. German POWs and civilian internees who died in various parts of Australia during both world wars are buried at the cemetery. A commemoration service is held at the cemetery each November.
- 21. **Historic Palestine** refers to the linguistic, geographical and cultural Palestine that existed before World War II when the Templers lived there in German Colonies. 'Historic Palestine' is referred to in "Key of terms pertaining to Israel/Palestine" published by the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR), http://www.ohchr.org/english/bodies/cerd/docs/ngos/jointngo3.pdf
- 22. **Internees** were civilians who were living in Australia or other Allied territories during World War II, and were deemed to be a security risk because of their nationality or ethnicity. Their backgrounds were very diverse (Tatura and District Historical Society Inc.)
- 23. **Internment** refers to the wartime detention of civilian enemy aliens by the State. During World War II, internment camps in Australia incarcerated thousands of German-speaking civilians from British Commonwealth countries, including Palestine in the Middle East.
- 24. **Language maintenance** is a situation where programs aim to preserve and value the community language of a particular minority group (Fishman 1999).

- 25. Language shift describes the situation when people adopt the new national language and cease to use their traditional mother tongue language (Clyne 2003; Dalby 2002; Lo Bianco 2006). It is sometimes referred to as language transfer (Clyne 2003) or rate of assimilation in a monolingual society.
- 26. **Limited bilingual** describes a person who has unequal proficiency in two languages. A person often has full command of one language and adequate or less than adequate command of another.
- 27. **Loveday** was a civilian internment and POW camp for men only, located in South Australia during World War II. Single men over 18 were sent from the Tatura internment camp to Loveday after some time in internment. A significant number of these were young Templers. They had excellent educators at their disposal, including professors from the German-Iranian Technical University of Tehran (Sauer 1991:240-241).
- 28. Monolingualism is a national mindset that advocates that immigrants should learn and only use the dominant language in the country, as was the case during assimilationist thinking in Australia (Clyne 2005a). Crystal (1992) points out that there could be more bilingual people in an officially monolingual country than in an officially bilingual one. For example in Japan, one of the most monolingual of countries there are substantial groups of Korean and Chinese speakers. Jupp (2002) pointed out that issues of bilingualism and multilingualism scarcely arose in Australia prior to 1945 due monolingualism.
- 29. **Multiculturalism** in Australia developed as a method for dealing with the consequences of ethnically diverse immigration. It was first officially defined by the Australian Ethnic Affairs Council report, which designated Australia as a Multicultural Society in 1977 (Jupp 2002). Under multiculturalism in the 1980s and 1990s, there was a greater tolerance of ethnic diversity than under the

- previous assimilation policy. By 1996, multiculturalism had fallen out of favour amongst national policy makers.
- 30. **Multilingualism** is the inevitable result of languages in contact where individuals have proficiency in more than two languages. Multilingualism is a natural way of life for millions of people all over the world (Crystal 1992).
- 31. **Naturalisation** is the legal act whereby a person voluntarily and actively acquires a nationality other than his or her nationality at birth. It was the common term used to denote citizenship uptake during the assimilationist years in the 1950s and 1960s in Australia (Tavan 1997), later referred to as citizenship
- 32. **Pietism** was a movement within Lutheranism, which originated in the late 17th century. Pietism reached its greatest strength by the middle of the 18th century in Germany and its very individualism in fact helped to prepare the way for the Enlightenment. Some would claim that Pietism largely contributed to the revival of Biblical studies in Germany and to giving religion a personal perspective where lay people met in homes and halls to interpret Bible texts rather than rely on the priests in the Churches (Fullbook 1983; Hoffmann 1996).
- 33. **Pietist roots** are attributed to the Temple Society, which was described in most of the Australian literature of the last twenty years as a small independent Christian society that grew out of the Pietistic movement within the Lutheran Church in the State of Württemberg in Southern Germany in the middle of the 19<sup>th</sup> century (Sauer 1991: Ruff 1990; Clyne 1991; Kaplan 1988). Clyne (1991:136) refers to the Temple Society as 'the Pietist Palestinian-Swabian sect.' The ideas of the Pietists 'profoundly affected' Christoph Hoffmann, the original founder of the Temple Society in nineteenth century Germany (Goldman 2003:58; Hoffmann 1996; Sauer 1991).

- 34. **Researcher-participant** describes participant observation in qualitative research that focuses on an insider or 'emic' viewpoint (Fielding and Moran 2006:1). It is a useful tool, particularly suited to case study research in that it yields a rich, detailed and in-depth picture of the social relationships in the community, facilitates access to participants, and improves the level of trustworthiness between researcher and participant.
- 35. **Rundschreiben** was the monthly circular of the Temple Society Australia from 1947 to 1967, which then developed into the Templer Record. In the 1940s, copies were manually produced using a typewriter and carbon paper.
- 36. **Stable bilingualism** describes the social conditions that maintain bilingualism (Dalby 2002:280). Stable bilingualism in a community prevents future language losses. Dalby states that bilingualism can be maintained for a long time. For example, the Templer diaspora maintained German for over a century. Crystal (1998) points out that it is rare to find a languages-in-contact setting where languages are stable, and that fluidity and change are more likely.
- 37. **Swabian Templer ethnolect** was an idiosyncratic form of insider talk that mixed the Swabian dialect with Arabic influences identified by Clyne (2003).
- 38. **Swabian-speakers** use Swabian (*Schwäbisch*) the German dialect spoken in southern Germany (Crystal 1992). According to Clyne (1991:61 and 2003:136) Swabian forms a continuum of varieties from a more localised dialect to a strongly regionalised variety approaching standard German. Consequently, Swabian-speaking immigrants in Australia such as the Templers are able to accommodate linguistically to other German speakers and can share language maintenance efforts with the wider German-speaking community.

- 39. **Swabian-Palestinian** is a term that applied to the Templers who came from the German Colonies in Palestine and settled in Australia after World War II (Clyne 1991).
- 40. **Tatura camp, Tatura internment or Camp 3** refers to the one of seven civilian internment and POW camps located in rural Tatura near the township of Shepparton in the state of Victoria, Australia, during World War II. The Family Camp 3 housed 1,000 German-speaking internees, many women and children. The largest civilian group consisted of 665 Templers deported from Palestine in 1941 (Sauer 1991).
- 41. **Tatura museum** refers to the Tatura Irrigation and Wartime Camps Museum at Hogan Street, Tatura, Victoria 3616. It houses the Tatura World War II wartime camps collection largely donated by members of the Temple Society Australia who were former civilian internees.
- 42. **Templer Record** is a monthly circular of the Temple Society Australia (ISBN 1328 9187). The earlier version was called Rundschreiben (*circular*).
- 43. **Temple Society Australia (TSA) or Temple Society** is an independent, non-Trinitarian Christian community.
- 44. **Templers** are members of the Temple Society, a religious organisation. Included are those offspring of Templers who identify, and are identified, as Templers by birth rather than only by religious affiliation. An older spelling no longer used was Templar. They are in no way connected with the Knights Templars (Sauer 1991).
- 45. **TGD or Tempelgesellschaft in Deutschland** is a regional branch of the Temple Society located in Degerloch, Stuttgart, Germany.

46. Transnationalism is a concept that describes the interconnectivity and communication between people who live in different countries. The nature of transnationalism can be social, political, economic or religious.
Transnationalisation is significant because it affects immigrant adaptation by strengthening their connection to other people, places and their symbolic sharing and feelings of belonging to places of origin (Castles 2002; Vertovec 2004; Faist 2000).