The construction of a sense of self following early sexual experiences

A narrative inquiry

Sally Veronica Hunter

Master of Counselling (Honours), University of New England, Australia
Graduate Certificate of Higher Education, University of New England, Australia
Bachelor of Counselling, University of New England, Australia
Bachelor of Science (Honours) in Mathematics, Exeter University, England

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy of the University of New England

February 2007
Acknowledgments

I would like to acknowledge the support of my family, friends, and colleagues, without whom this thesis would not exist. In particular I would like to give a warm vote of thanks to my supervisors, Professor Jeffrey Kottler and Dr Annmaree Wilson, who have tirelessly read and commented on my manuscripts and given me critical feedback. I also owe a debt of gratitude to Professor Margot Schofield and Professor David Plummer who supervised me early in my project and encouraged me along the way.

I would like to acknowledge the support of colleagues at the School of Health who have listened to me talking endlessly about my project and helped to create opportunities for me to make progress with my writing, including Jeanne, Frances, Ann, Randolph, and Mary. I would also like to acknowledge the help of Ann with editing my thesis. I have been blessed to meet a great bunch of fellow students and we have supported each other along the way. My thanks go to David, Christine, Linda, Dorothy, Myf, Sue, Michele, Chandra, Kiran, Prawit, and the UNEsex researcher group.

My children, Clare and James, have always believed that I could achieve this goal and have been whole hearted in their support of me. I am very grateful to them for their generosity of spirit. And I have always felt the love and support of my family and friends in England and in Sydney. I am grateful to my precious Armidale friends including Mee Wun, Cliff, Mary, Frances, and Ken. Without you I would never have finished. And this project would not have existed without the openness of my participants, to whom I am very grateful.

I would like to dedicate this project to my daughter Rosie, who would have turned twenty-one in November 2006.
Abstract

The aim of this research project was to develop a fuller understanding of the process of constructing a sense of self following early sexual experiences with an adult. Twenty-two men and women, aged twenty-five to seventy years old, were interviewed about their early sexual experiences using narrative inquiry methodology. All had had an early sexual experience at the age of fifteen or under with someone over the age of eighteen.

Participants told four differing narratives about these experiences. One group of participants described how they had chosen to maintain narratives of silence for many years about their early sexual experiences. They believed that they had not been adversely affected by events in childhood, although they volunteered for the study because they were beginning to question this assumption. A second group of participants told narratives of ongoing suffering. Some of these participants were still in the process of recovering memories from their childhoods. A third group told narratives of transformation, describing how they had faced and overcome adversity in such a way that they had been changed as a result. The fourth group told narratives of transcendence. Although profoundly affected by their childhood experiences, they refused to be defined in this way since they believed that they had moved beyond these experiences.

These four narratives have been examined in the light of the literature relating to childhood sexual abuse, early sexual experiences, and the social construction of gender, as well as victim and survivor discourses. Recommendations are made for therapists, educators, health professionals, and social policy professionals about ways that early childhood sexual experiences can be understood.
Certificate of originality

I certify that the substance of this thesis has not already been submitted for any degree and is not being currently submitted for any other degree or qualification.

I certify that any help received in preparing this thesis, and all sources used, have been acknowledged in this thesis.

Signature
Publications arising from this thesis


# Table of contents

The construction of a sense of self following early sexual experiences .......... i
Acknowledgments .............................................................. ii
Abstract .................................................................................. iii
Certificate of originality ............................................................ iv
Publications arising from this thesis .............................................. v
Table of contents ....................................................................... vi

Chapter 1 - Introduction .......................................................... 1
  Background ............................................................................. 1
  Definitions and the use of language ......................................... 2
  The research question .............................................................. 5
  Aim of the research ................................................................ 6
  Locating the researcher ........................................................... 7
Summary and overview of the thesis ........................................... 10

Chapter 2 - Literature Review .................................................. 11
  Introduction ............................................................................ 11
  The prevalence of child sexual abuse and early sexual experiences .... 12
  The long-term effects of child sexual abuse ................................ 15
  The impact of the family context ............................................. 17
  The nature of gender differences ............................................. 21
  Controversies about child sexual abuse .................................... 24
  Resilience .............................................................................. 29
  Avoidant or adaptive coping mechanisms .................................. 30
  The issue of disclosure ............................................................ 33
  The impact of child sexual abuse on the sense of self ................ 37
  The social construction of gender and the victim/survivor discourse . 39
    i) Femininity and victimhood ................................................ 39
    ii) Masculinity and victimisers .............................................. 42
  Theoretical models and treatment options ................................. 45
  Implications for future research .............................................. 53

Chapter 3 - Methodology .......................................................... 55
  Introduction ............................................................................ 55
  Qualitative versus quantitative research methodologies ............... 55
  Ontological and epistemological perspective ............................... 56
  Social constructionist and narrative methodologies ...................... 60
  Methodological framework for the project .................................. 63
    i) Narrative inquiry approach .............................................. 64
    ii) Feminist approach ......................................................... 66
    iii) Combined narrative inquiry and feminist approach ............. 67
  Criteria for assessing the research methodology ........................ 69
  Recruitment and sampling procedures ..................................... 70
  Details of participants recruited .............................................. 72
  The interview context ............................................................. 73
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 4 – Narratives of silence</th>
<th>85</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1) Normal sexual development</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greta’s story</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bert’s story</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excitement and some guilt</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No need to think about it</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>You just don’t tell</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An emerging sense of self as a sexual being</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) A silence recently broken</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victoria’s story</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anthony’s story</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jim’s story</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter’s story</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some shame</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chose not to think about it</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Just moved on with life</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questioning a sense of self as a relational being</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concern about sexual behaviour</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Chapter 5 – Narratives of ongoing suffering | 119 |
| Introduction                                | 119 |
| 1) Searching for a sense of self            | 120 |
| Sylvia’s story                              | 120 |
| Tess’ story                                 | 122 |
| Paulians’ story                             | 124 |
| Anger, hatred, confusion, shame, and fear   | 126 |
| Lost memories and used ‘dissociation’       | 129 |
| Remembered as adults                        | 130 |
| Suicidality, drug and alcohol use, and non-committed sex | 132 |
| Fragile sense of self                       | 135 |
| Concern about sexual behaviour              | 138 |
| 2) Campaigning for others                   | 139 |
| Hope’s story                                | 139 |
| Colin’s story                               | 141 |
| Anger and some shame                        | 143 |
| Pushed away thoughts                        | 145 |
| Told the police as adults                   | 148 |
| Suicidality, drug and alcohol use, and non-committed sex | 149 |
| Sense of self as campaigning for others     | 151 |
| Summary                                     | 152 |
Chapter 6 - Narratives of transformation
Introduction.................................................................................................................. 154
1) Protecting and helping others ........................................................................... 155
   Jewels' story ........................................................................................................... 155
   Emm's story ........................................................................................................... 156
   Heather's story ....................................................................................................... 158
   Fear and anger ....................................................................................................... 160
   Pushed away thoughts and used ‘dissociation’ ...................................................... 162
   Didn't tell to protect others ................................................................................... 164
   Adversity faced and overcome .............................................................................. 165
   Sense of self as a protector of others .................................................................... 169
2) Seeking justice and breaking the cycle ............................................................... 171
   Karen's story ........................................................................................................... 172
   Tina's story ............................................................................................................. 173
   Jane's story ............................................................................................................. 175
   Growing fear and anger ......................................................................................... 176
   Tried to tell as children, then pushed away thoughts ........................................ 178
   Told the police as adults ...................................................................................... 181
   Adversity faced and overcome .............................................................................. 184
   Sense of self as a preventer of future sexual abuse ............................................... 188
Summary .................................................................................................................... 190

Chapter Seven - Narratives of transcendence ....................................................... 192
Introduction ................................................................................................................ 192
   Diana's story ........................................................................................................... 193
   Belinda's story ........................................................................................................ 195
   Norm's story ........................................................................................................... 196
   Rod's story .............................................................................................................. 198
   Will's story .............................................................................................................. 199
   Anger and some shame ......................................................................................... 200
   Pushed away thoughts and longed to be ‘normal’ ............................................... 202
   Didn't tell ............................................................................................................... 204
   Adversity faced and overcome .............................................................................. 207
   Sense of self as growing spiritually ..................................................................... 213
Summary .................................................................................................................... 217
   The four narratives overall ................................................................................... 218

Chapter 8 – Enough blue thread: Discussion .......................................................... 220
Introduction ................................................................................................................ 220
1) The impact of family context on the construction of a sense of self .................. 222
   Child maltreatment and socio-economic deprivation .......................................... 223
   Poor attachment relationships within the family .................................................. 224
   Chaotic families and intergenerational child maltreatment .................................. 226
2) The impact of telling or not telling ...................................................................... 227
   Main inhibitors to disclosure ............................................................................... 228
   Fear as a reason for non-disclosure ..................................................................... 229
   Shame as a reason for non-disclosure .................................................................. 230
   Self-blame as a reason for non-disclosure ........................................................... 230
   Anger and disclosure ............................................................................................ 231
Disclosure as a process ......................................................... 232
Avoidant coping ........................................................................ 235
The cost of telling or not telling ................................................ 236
3) The construction of a sense of self throughout the lifespan ........ 237
Narratives of silence .................................................................. 238
   i) Deciding not to dwell on their experiences.............................. 238
   ii) Non-traumatic pathway or relational injury ............................ 239
   iii) Resilience or denial ......................................................... 241
   iv) Questioning their own narratives ........................................ 242
Narratives of ongoing suffering .................................................. 243
   i) Ongoing process of reconstructing a sense of self .................... 243
   ii) Realisation of victimhood ................................................ 245
   iii) Contaminated, fragmented, or fragile sense of self ............... 246
Narratives of transformation ...................................................... 247
   i) Overcoming self-blame ..................................................... 247
   ii) Constructing a relational sense of self as a protector ............. 248
Narratives of transcendence ...................................................... 249
   i) Longing to be normal ...................................................... 249
   ii) Resisting stereotyping and the dominant discourse ............... 250
   iii) Constructing a sense of self through spirituality ............... 251
4) The impact of the social construction of gender ....................... 253
Issues of trust and intimacy for both genders .............................. 253
The social construction of femininity and victims ....................... 254
   i) Women as subordinate to men ......................................... 255
   ii) Madonnas and whores .................................................... 256
   iii) Non-stereotypical behaviour .......................................... 257
The social construction of masculinity and victimisers ............... 257
   i) Aggressive or stoical responses ....................................... 258
   ii) Non-relational sex ....................................................... 259
   iii) Homophobia ............................................................. 260
   iv) Difficulties exacerbated by hegemonic masculinity ............. 261
   v) From victim to victimiser .............................................. 262
5) The impact of the child sexual abuse discourse over time .......... 263
Changes in discourse over time ............................................... 264
The need to remember and the need to forget .............................. 265
Movement from victim to survivor narratives ............................ 267
Rejection of victim and survivor narratives ............................... 268
Summary ................................................................................ 269

Chapter 9 – Implications and recommendations .......................... 270
Implications for contribution to knowledge ............................... 270
   Early sexual experiences lead to relational injury ..................... 271
   The developmental difficulty of disclosure in childhood .......... 273
Many different narratives can be functional ............................. 274
Gender differences can be viewed in terms of relational injury ....... 275
Socially available narratives can be limiting ............................. 277
Implications for professional practice ....................................... 277
   Focus on relational injuries rather than abusive events .......... 278
Avoid labelling, pathologising, and making assumptions .......... 280