

Effect of alternative cropping management on soil organic carbon

Yadunath Bajgai

Bachelor of Science (Honours), Agriculture
University of Wales, Bangor, United Kingdom

Master of Science (Agriculture)
Chiang Mai University, Chiang Mai, Thailand

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree
of Doctor of Philosophy,
School of Environmental and Rural Science
University of New England
Armidale, NSW Australia 2351

January, 2013

Acknowledgements

I am grateful to the Royal Government of Bhutan for granting me the study leave to pursue this PhD study in Australia. In particular, I am thankful to Dasho Dzungdag Gosling Tshering, Pemagatshel and the then Director Chencho Norbu, Department of Agriculture for their kind support and consent to undertake this study.

I am deeply grateful to the Government and people of Australia for granting me an Endeavour Postgraduate Award, which is the Australian Government's prestigious, internationally competitive, and merit-based scholarship. The hard work put in by the staff of Department of Industry, Innovation, Science, Research and Tertiary Education (DIISRTE) in the selection process, and of Austraining International (AI) for the post-selection support services, are heartily appreciated.

I extend my heartfelt gratitude to my PhD supervisors, Dr Paul Kristiansen of the University of New England (UNE), Armidale; Dr Nilantha Hulugalle of the NSW Department of Primary Industries, Narrabri and Dr Melinda McHenry of the Central Queensland University, Bundaberg for their unwavering commitments to my supervision, guidance and support including their efforts into my draft chapters. In particular, I am highly grateful Dr Paul Kristiansen for his support in the admission stage of the program; for his help with field works, statistical analyses, intellectual guidance and administrative services. I am highly indebted to Dr Nilantha Hulugalle for his technical and intellectual guidance on soil carbon and also for his help in designing laboratory experiments. Dr Lalit Kumar of UNE was also in my supervision team during the brief initiation stage of the research.

I would like to pledge my gratitude to the School of Environment and Rural Science (ERS), UNE and the Primary Industries Innovation Centre (PIIC) (a joint venture of UNE and the NSW Department of Primary Industries) for funding operational expenses of my PhD project. I have received credits to cover analysis of up to 1250 plant and soils samples in the LECO from the PIIC and I remain grateful for this generous support to Prof. Bob Martin of PIIC and Prof. Heiko Daniel of UNE for the arrangement.

The ERS and PIIC also provided me the financial support to cover expenditure relating to conference presentations in Adelaide and Brisbane in Australia, and Leuven in Belgium. I

received financial support to cover my registration fees for 16th Australian Agronomy conference held at UNE from one of the projects of my principal supervisor, Dr Paul Kristiansen.

The biometrical guidance and suggestions for improvement for the field experiment and ideas for follow up experiments by Mr Bruce McCorkell, NSW Department of Primary Industries is gratefully acknowledged. I thankfully acknowledge the feedback provided by Mr Stephen WL Kimber, Wollongbar Primary Industries Institute, NSW Department of Primary Industries on overhead gas sampling technique. Mr Craig Birchall, lecturer helped me with setting up of a drip irrigation system in my field trials, supplied me with a stock of atrazine for experimental use, and provided wonderful feedback on general agronomic issues.

I would like to thank Prof. Annette Cowie of the National Centre for Rural Greenhouse Gas Research (NCRGGR) in UNE, Armidale for organizing and facilitating monthly meetings for postgraduates working on soil carbon and greenhouse gases, where project progression and issues of interest were discussed. The constructive criticisms and feedback for improvement on my seminar presentations by Prof. Graeme Blair, President of Agronomy Society of Australia deserves a rightful mention. Prof. Brian Sindel, UNE provided me with the logistical and administrative support to travel to Belgium to present a conference paper during my candidature.

I want to thank Dr Rebecca Haling, post-doctoral researcher for helping me on operation of the soil respirometer and Dr Kathy King, retired lecturer for helping out with the calculations of soil respiration and microbial biomass carbon from the respirometer data. Help rendered by Mr Craig Birchall, lecturer of UNE agronomic guidance for field experiment and feedback particularly regarding exchangeable cations in soil is also highly appreciated. I want thank Dr John Stanley, UNE his general mentoring support in the initial stage of my study. I want to thank Ms Vanessa Lonergan for providing general support regarding soil carbon projects.

I am highly grateful to Asso. Prof. Warren Whalloway (retired) for proof reading the final draft chapters of this thesis.

Thanks are also due to UNE Technical staff, Mss Leanne Lisle, Jan Carruthers, Gabby Ray; and Messrs. Michael Faint, David Edmonds, Gary Cluley, Greg Chamberlain and George Henderson for technical and laboratory assistance during my candidature. Mss Shirley Fraser,

Roslyn Mortimer and Elizabeth Davis and Mr Chris Cooper provided the excellent logistical support during my study period. Thanks to everyone at the Department of Agronomy and Soil Science for the friendly working environment. The staff of Dixon library deserve a rightful mention for their help regarding locating and sourcing journal articles and books.

I want thank number of volunteers; Messrs. Choney Dorji, Kashe Keotshephile, Gopal Rizal, Sangay Tshewang, Warren Whalloway, Bhahar Habibullah, Khumbu Dorji, Solomon Mwendia, Tshering Nidup, Yoga Hari Adikari and Kunzang Lhendup and Ms Phoebe Barnes who helped me out with my field work.

The night rides provided by the UNE security services did make a difference to my life while working late and I am very grateful for the excellent services provided.

I want thank fellow postgraduate candidates: Mss Phoebe Barnes, Chistine Walela, Chris Fyfe, Nazma Begum, Tania Khandakar, Eunice Agyarko-Mintah, Sara Bayat, Sahar Alshamma, Hla Myo Thwe; and Messrs. Slamet Supriya, Giregon Olupot, Nemai Senapati, Richard Flavel, Karim Bhiah, Tim McLaren, Bhahar Habibullah, Kashe Keotshephile, Chon Nguyen, Todd Green, Sangay Tshewang, Rabbi Fazle, Karl Anderson, Kristian le Mottee, Tiger Sangay, Jamal Kamaluldeen and Hai Nguyen for their friendliness and cooperation. I also want to say thank you to my flat mate, Mr Wae-Jae Tan for his friendliness and help while sharing a flat during my candidature. I thank all fellow Bhutanese in Armidale for their emotional support and encouragement.

I am grateful to my wife, Dhan Maya for her support and strength particularly during the turbulent times and for managing to look after our sons, Tilak and Govinda while I was away for 42 months. I am grateful to my mother-in-law, Ms Damber Kumari Sharma for her wonderful favour of helping to look after our boys when I was away. Last but not the least, I am grateful to my parents, my siblings, in-laws, relatives and friends for their good wishes.

Yadunath Bajgai, 21 January 2013

Abstract

Concerns about declining soil organic carbon (SOC) and increased greenhouse gas emissions due to practices such as intensive tillage and bare fallows have encouraged the adoption of practices such as no-tillage, crop rotations and residue retention. However, whilst no-till farming is suited for broadacre crops, it has not been widely adapted for most vegetable production systems. Vegetable production systems, especially organic ones, routinely use tillage to prepare beds and manage weeds. These tillage operations break soil structure and aggregates, which is known to accelerate losses of SOC stocks. Despite requiring multiple tillage operations, the vegetable systems are also characterised by little or no crop residue input, potentially further reducing SOC stocks. The effect of sweet corn (*Zea mays* L. var. *rugosa*) residue management (RM; i.e. incorporation or removal) in a corn-cabbage (*Brassica oleracea* L.) rotation on SOC parameters in two soil management systems (SMS; i.e. organic and conventional) was examined because crop residue incorporation and application of organic fertilisers could be ways to counteract loss of SOC due to tillage in vegetable systems.

The principal aim of this thesis was to examine the effect of RM in the two SMS on soil total carbon (TOC) concentrations and stock, soil carbon fractions and microbial biomass carbon (MBC) through a field experiment of a corn/cabbage rotation over two years. A laboratory experiment was performed to separate the confounding factors of SMS in the field experiment, i.e. herbicide and mineral fertilisers in the conventional SMS, and cultivation and organic fertilisers in the organic SMS. To supplement the field experiment, another laboratory experiment focused on how two potentially opposing determinants of TOC, residue incorporation and simulated tillage (sieving), influence the emission of CO₂-C. Although, the research objectives of this thesis are focused on SOC, agronomic and fertility parameters, the essential components of a crop production system, were also considered.

The field experiment was conducted from December 2009 to December 2011 in a completely randomised layout with a factorial design (2 RM × 2 SMS × 2 soil types with 4 replications) near Armidale, New South Wales, Australia. Two laboratory experiments were also conducted using factorial designs (completely randomised with 4 replications) from January to June 2011 in the University of New England, Armidale. All field and laboratory experiments of this thesis were conducted on Vertosol and Chromosol, two common agricultural soils in Australia. Yield components of corn and cabbage crops and weed

biomasses and nutrient uptake by corn stover and cabbage; and TOC and its fractions, SOC stocks and soil macro-nutrients were also analysed for the field experiment. In the laboratory experiments, TOC and its fractions and CO₂-C emissions were the main chemical analyses.

Corn and cabbage yields and nutrient uptake by corn stover (except P) and cabbage head were not influenced by RM or SMS. Yields of both crops under the organic SMS were not lower than the conventional SMS, possibly due to the equivalent N, P and K nutrients applied and also soil nutrient status might not have reached the limiting level after imposition of the treatment. Exchangeable K, but not Colwell P was significantly increased by residue incorporation. Residue incorporation and the organic SMS increased the average total N by 7% and 4% compared to the treatments without residue and the conventional SMS, respectively, indicating the longer-term fertility gains of these treatments. Residue incorporation reduced weed biomass in the cabbage crop by 22% in 2010 and by 47% in 2011. Corn residue-induced inhibitions on weed biomass may be exploited as a supplementary tool to mechanical weed control for the organic SMS potentially reducing the negative impacts of cultivation on SOC.

In the field experiment, TOC concentration increased significantly by 6.5 % in the 0-0.1 m depth by incorporating shredded residue; however the effect of SMS was inconsistent. The laboratory experiment confirmed that the use of atrazine and mineral fertiliser in the conventional SMS in the field experiment had no significant effect on TOC, whereas both the organic fertiliser and simulated tillage significantly increased TOC, as expected in the organic SMS scenario. Organic fertiliser application in the field may, therefore, balance the C lost through tillage. Soil basal respiration and MBC data showed that the soil's biological fertility could be improved by incorporating residues and by combining residue incorporation with organic fertiliser. Evaluation of the SOC stock determined that residue incorporation at about 15 Mg/ha per year (oven-dry equivalent) in soil accumulated an average of 0.96 and 1.22 Mg C/ha for Chromosol and Vertosol, respectively, in the field trial after 2 years.

With regard to TOC fractions, residue incorporation increased particulate organic C (POC) by 32% in the field experiment and 48% in the laboratory experiment. Mineral-associated organic C (MOC) and TOC were positively impacted by residue incorporation and soil type in both field and laboratory experiments alike. These results indicate that residue and the soil type were key determinants of POC and MOC fractions. MOC was the major pool of TOC in both experiments, i.e. $\geq 83\%$ in the Vertosol and $\geq 73\%$ in the Chromosol. The increase in the

stable form of C, not just in the labile forms, indicates the potential for longer term C sequestration in soil through physicochemical stabilisation in vegetables systems, if not through aggregation. Simulated tillage (sieving) had a limited impact on POC, MOC and TOC, suggesting that hand hoeing (cultivation) to control weeds in organic SMS in the field might have only a minor effect on the rate of SOM mineralisation in the short-term.

On average, residue incorporated and simulated tillage treatments emitted 2.3 and 1.5 times more CO₂-C in comparison to unamended and undisturbed treatments, respectively, across the two soil types. This suggests that C availability and form could be more important for CO₂-C emission than physical disturbance in cropping soils. Both residue incorporated and sieved treatment (organic scenario) not only emitted more CO₂-C but also had 16% and 11% higher level of SOC in Chromosol and Vertosol, respectively, compared with the treatment that was neither incorporated with residue nor sieved (conventional scenario). This confirms the observation that an organic system might retain more soil C than a conventional system. Since the CO₂-C emitted is usually a minute fraction in relation to SOC, the C lost by soil disturbance is more than compensated by incorporation of residue.

Between soil types, the clayey Vertosol conserved higher levels of soil nutrients, had better soil structural stability, had higher levels of TOC, MOC and MBC concentration and stored more SOC stock compared to the sandy Chromosol. However, SOC-rich Vertosol also emitted more CO₂-C than the SOC-poor Chromosol.

In conclusion, the observed short-term gains have the potential to translate into longer-term C sequestration and soil fertility gains, if sweet corn is rotated with vegetable crops and shredded residue is incorporated into soil. However, the effect of SMS was inconsistent because the longer time interval (8 months) between organic fertiliser incorporation and soil sampling led to loss soil C possibly due to easily decomposable C:N ratios (≤ 5.4) of the organic fertilisers. Though shredding of residue may not be practical for growers, the results highlight the potential for increasing soil C using crop residues. Moreover, these practices may be an option to counteract the loss of C due to multiple tillage operations that vegetable systems, especially organic ones, routinely use. The increase in the stable form (MOC), not just in the labile forms (POC and DOC), indicates the potential for longer term C sequestration in soil through physicochemical stabilisation.

Publications arising from this thesis

Journal articles

- Bajgai, Y., Kristiansen, P., Hulugalle, N. and McHenry, M. 2011. A laboratory study of soil carbon dioxide emissions in a Vertisol and an Alfisol due to incorporating corn residues and simulating tillage. *Journal of Organic Systems*. 6(3): 20-26.
- Bajgai, Y., Kristiansen, P., Hulugalle, N. and McHenry, M. in press. Effect of residue management and conventional and organic soil management systems on crop yields and weed biomass. *Acta Horticulturae*.
- Bajgai, Y., Hulugalle, N., Kristiansen, P. and McHenry, M. Under review. Soil carbon changes and CO₂ emissions due to incorporating corn residues and simulating tillage – A laboratory study. Paper submitted to *Soil Use and Management*.
- Bajgai, Y., Kristiansen, P., Hulugalle, N. and McHenry, M. Under review. Effect of corn residue incorporation and soil management systems on soil carbon fractions: Results of field and laboratory experiments. Paper submitted to *Soil Research*.
- Bajgai, Y., Kristiansen, P., Hulugalle, N. and McHenry, M. Under review. Influence of corn residue incorporation in organic and conventional soil management systems on crop yields, nutrient uptakes, weed biomass and soil nutrients. Paper submitted to *Renewable Agriculture and Food Systems*.
- Bajgai, Y., Hulugalle, N., Kristiansen, P. and McHenry, M. In preparation. Effect of alternative cropping management on soil carbon concentration and stock and soil microbial biomass carbon.

Conference papers (* = peer-reviewed)

- *Bajgai, Y., Kristiansen, P., Hulugalle, N. and McHenry, M. 2012. Particulate and mineral-associated organic carbon fractions as influenced by corn residue incorporation and simulated tillage. In: Yunusa, I. (Ed.) *Capturing Opportunities and Overcoming Obstacles in Australian Agronomy: Proceedings of the 16th ASA Conference, 14-18 October 2012*. Australian Agronomy Society, Armidale, Australia. pp. online.
- *Bajgai, Y., Kristiansen, P., Hulugalle, N. and McHenry, M. 2011. Corn and cabbage yields, and weed biomass in conventional and organic soil management systems. In: Biala, J. (Ed.) *International Symposium on Organic Matter Management and Compost use in Horticulture, 4-7 April 2011*. University of Adelaide, Australia, Adelaide. pp. 19.
- *Bajgai, Y., Kristiansen, P., Hulugalle, N. and McHenry, M. 2011. Interactions of corn stover incorporation and simulated tillage on emission of CO₂: a laboratory study. In: WCCA/FSD Local Organising Committee. (Ed.) *Resilient Food Systems for a Changing World: Proceedings of the 5th World Congress of Conservation Agriculture Incorporating 3rd Farming Systems Design Conference, 26-29 September 2011, Brisbane*. ACIAR, Canberra. pp. 354-355.
- *Bajgai, Y., Kristiansen, P., Hulugalle, N. and McHenry, M. 2011. Short-term effect of corn residue incorporation on soil organic carbon in conventional and organic soil management systems. In: Albrecht, A. et al. (Ed.) *Third International Symposium on Soil Organic Matter; Organic Matter Dynamics - From Soils to Oceans 11-14 July 2011*. Katholieke Universiteit, Leuven. pp. 203.
- Bajgai, Y., Kristiansen, P., Hulugalle, N. and McHenry, M. 2011. Preliminary findings - Effect of alternative cropping management on soil organic carbon. In: Cowie, A. (Ed.) *Rural Climate Change Solutions Symposium, 3-4 May 2011*. University of New England, Armidale. pp. 58-59.

Table of contents

Declaration.....	i
Acknowledgements	ii
Abstract.....	v
Publications arising from this thesis.....	viii
Journal articles.....	viii
Conference papers (* = peer-reviewed)	viii
Table of contents	ix
Chapter 1. Introduction.....	1
1.1 Rationale.....	1
1.2 Thesis aims and research questions	2
1.3 Thesis structure.....	2
Chapter 2. Literature review	5
2.1 Introduction	5
2.1.1 Soil carbon and its importance	5
2.1.2 How is SOM related to SOC	5
2.2 Factors affecting SOC	6
2.2.1 Climate	6
2.2.2 Soil type.....	7
2.2.3 Land use.....	8
2.3 Effect of agricultural management on SOC	9
2.3.1 Conservation agricultural practices	9
2.3.2 Crop residue and its quality for SOC stabilisation	10
2.3.3 Crop residue management	11
2.3.4 Crop residue and tillage.....	12
2.3.5 Fertiliser management	14
2.3.6 Organic farming.....	15
2.3.7 Organic and conventional vegetable systems.....	15
2.4 Pools of C and C stabilisation mechanisms.....	16
2.4.1 Labile and particulate organic C.....	17
2.4.2 Soil C stabilisation through aggregation	18
2.4.3 Physicochemical stabilisation.....	19
2.5 Fractionation and laboratory analysis of SOC.....	19
2.5.1 Fractionation for measurement of SOC pools	19
2.5.2 Laboratory determination of SOC	21
2.6 Research gaps and conclusion	22
Chapter 3. Influence of corn residue incorporation in organic and conventional soil management systems on the yields and nutrient uptakes by sweet corn and cabbage, and on weed biomass and soil nutrients	24

Abstract.....	24
3.1 Introduction	24
3.2 Materials and methods.....	27
3.2.1 Site and climate	27
3.2.2 Experimental design and set up	29
3.2.3 Crop and weed sampling and determination of dry weights	31
3.2.4 Soil sampling, processing and chemical analysis.....	32
3.2.5 Statistical analysis	33
3.3 Results	34
3.3.1 Corn phases	34
3.3.2 Cabbage phases	39
3.3.3 Effect of treatments on soil properties.....	46
3.4 Discussion.....	50
3.4.1 Agronomic outcomes for corn and cabbage	50
3.4.2 Nutrient uptake	52
3.4.3 Residue incorporation reduces weed biomass	52
3.4.4 Soil nutrients.....	54
3.4.5 Soil structural stability.....	55
3.5 Conclusion.....	56
 Chapter 4. Effect of alternative cropping management on soil carbon concentration and stock and soil microbial biomass carbon	 57
Abstract.....	57
4.1 Introduction	58
4.2 Materials and methods.....	60
4.2.1 Field experiment.....	60
4.2.2 Laboratory experiment	64
4.2.3 Statistical analysis	67
4.3 Results	67
4.3.1 Field experiment.....	67
4.3.2 Laboratory experiment	78
4.4 Discussion.....	83
4.4.1 Soil pH and EC	83
4.4.2 TOC and TN	83
4.4.3 Verification of TOC results of field experiment by laboratory experiment.....	84
4.4.4 Bulk density of fine earth	86
4.4.5 SOC stock.....	87
4.4.6 Soil basal respiration and microbial biomass C	89
4.5 Conclusion.....	90
 Chapter 5. Effect of corn residue incorporation and soil management systems on soil carbon fractions: Results of field and laboratory experiments	 91
Abstract.....	91
5.1 Introduction	91
5.2 Materials and methods.....	94
5.2.1 Field experiment.....	94
5.2.2 Laboratory experiment	96
5.2.3 Fractionation.....	98
5.2.4 Dissolved organic carbon	99
5.2.5 Determination of soil C and N.....	99
5.2.6 Statistical analysis	100

5.3	Results	100
5.3.1	Field experiment	100
5.3.2	Laboratory experiment	105
5.4	Discussion.....	108
5.4.1	Field experiment	108
5.4.2	Laboratory experiment	110
5.5	Conclusion	112
Chapter 6. Soil carbon changes and CO ₂ emissions due to incorporating corn residues and simulating tillage – A laboratory study		114
Abstract.....		114
6.1	Introduction	114
6.2	Methods	116
6.2.1	Soil selection and experimental design	116
6.2.2	Gas sampling and analysis.....	117
6.2.3	Statistical analysis	118
6.3	Results	119
6.3.1	CO ₂ -C flux for first simulated tillage	119
6.3.2	CO ₂ -C flux for second simulated tillage.....	120
6.3.3	Soil C and other soil parameters.....	123
6.3.4	Change in soil C	123
6.4	Discussion.....	124
6.4.1	CO ₂ -C flux.....	124
6.4.2	Remaining soil C and C:N ratio	126
6.4.3	Change in soil C	127
Chapter 7. General conclusion		128
7.1	Introduction	128
7.2	Key findings and synthesis.....	128
7.3	Theoretical and practical implications.....	132
7.4	Policy implications	134
7.5	Limitations and future research directions	134
7.6	Conclusion	136
References		137