Availability of and Accessibility to Primary Health Care Services for Women Living in Poverty: The Bangladesh Case

Bijoy Krishna Banik

MA in Development Studies, the Institute of Social Studies, The Hague, the Netherlands

MSS in Sociology, the University of Dhaka, Dhaka, Bangladesh

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy at the University of New England

School of Behavioural, Cognitive and Social Sciences

Faculty of Arts and Sciences

University of New England

Australia

September 2012

This thesis is dedicated to my mother, Pushpa Rani Banik, who always encourages me to be a good person. This work is also dedicated to my daughter, Auritrika Banik, whose birth in Armidale encouraged me to finish this long journey on time.

Acknowledgement

I earnestly articulate my gratitude to Associate Professor Habib Zafarullah, my principal supervisor, for his outstanding professional guidance and comments on my PhD research. His stimulating suggestions, encouragement and affection always inspired me. The valuable comments and guidance from my co-supervisor, Professor John Scott, really showed me the proper way to improve my haphazardly constructed rough draft and systematically present it. His written comments provided valuable inputs in rebuilding my arguments.

I would like to record my gratitude to the University of New England for awarding me the UNE International Scholarship in order to pursue PhD there. The crucial aspect of my doctoral research was the fieldwork in Bangladesh which was made possible by the extra funding from the School of Behavioural, Cognitive and Social Sciences, for which I would like to express my gratitude to the Head of School. I am also grateful to Research Services for providing me the PhD Completion Scholarship during the last two months of my candidature.

I would like to acknowledge all my well-wishers in the Department of Sociology and Criminology, particularly Dr. Elaine Barcley, Dr. Cary Bennett and Mr. Stephen Phelps. I am also grateful to the School staff, particularly Ms. Shonette Bridgeman and Ms. Pamela Roberts, and to the library staff. My special appreciation is for Dr. Rashid Sarker, Dr. Zahid Shahab Ahmed, Dr Rasheda Khanam, Mrs. Elizabeth Frances Mainwaring and Mr Keshav Kumar Acharya for their company, valuable and critical comments as well as technical inputs during my research.

I am particularly indebted to the participants (mothers, heads of the service centres and others) in my research and many officials, mainly the librarian of NIPORT and Prabortana, the Deputy Director of Naripakhya, and the project managers of UPHCP in Rajshahi and Bogra. I am also thankful to all colleagues of my Department at Rajshahi University, especially Professor Kazi Tobarak Hossain and Professor Sultana Mustafa Khanum for their valuable comments and assistance regarding the ideas generated for my study. During the field work, I was lucky enough to have both physical and mental

support from my students specially Semonty, Sabina and others. Without their support, it would have been tough to complete the field work.

Finally, I would like to express my heartfelt gratitude to Ms. Ann Young for her extensive support in making the thesis lucid and readable. My acknowledgement would be incomplete without mentioning my family members' contributions, especially my wife, Topi Rani Saha, who always extended her assistance and cooperation in successfully completing this long journey.

Abstract

Poor women, in both rural and urban areas in the northern region of Bangladesh, suffer from high maternal mortality rates (MMR), and compared to other regions, this group also has a low proportion of births assisted by skilled attendants. This thesis critically examines the availability of and accessibility to primary, particularly maternal, healthcare services, provided by government and non-government organisations in Bangladesh. The broader purpose of this thesis is to probe the gap between the national MMR in Bangladesh and the target set by the 5th Millennium Development Goal (MDG). It also explores ways of reducing the gap, especially given that the country's MMR is very high compared to other South Asian countries. The study is significant because it has gone beyond the bio-medical approach (with the focus on human patho-physiology and emphasis on cure over prevention) and develops a bio-social approach to improve maternal health. The latter encompasses strategies to reduce high MMR from sociological and public health perspectives.

The study used both primary and secondary data to meet its objectives. Triangulation of methods (questionnaire interviews of service users and providers, focus group discussions [FGD] and direct observations) were employed to collect primary data. A large number (160) of mothers who delivered at least one baby during the last ten years and the heads of relevant health centres were interviewed. Eight FGDs were conducted during the research. An assortment of articles, reports, theses and books were consulted in complementing and substantiating the arguments in this study.

The thesis developed two interrelated analytical frameworks. The first addresses both direct (eclampsia, haemorrhage, obstructed or prolonged labour) and indirect (age at marriage, anaemia, malnutrition, financial and other costs) causes of MMR. It highlights both potentials and weaknesses of different bio-medical interventions (proposed in different national and international forums for addressing direct and indirect causes of MMR) to understand how sound maternal health can be achieved. The other framework explores the effectiveness of

healthcare reform policies that attempted to introduce public private partnerships (PPP) and different healthcare financing mechanisms to increase poor women's access to primary, mainly maternal, healthcare services.

The main findings of the thesis suggest that there has been an increase in the availability of and accessibility to primary, particularly maternal, healthcare services. However, the increment varies across regions and social groups. Rural, poor and less educated mothers have less availability and access compared to urban, non-poor and better educated women. It has also been found that the PPP model has been able to increase mother's access. However, poor women are unable to use comprehensive maternal healthcare services due to higher costs and exclusion errors. Supply side problems and demand side constraints are potential barriers to making healthcare services easily available and increasing people's access to these.

The government-initiated interventions in Bangladesh address both direct and indirect medically-related causes of MMR. Social and organisational reasons (barriers of access to these interventions) have been neglected. No interventions have been effective in reducing MMR independently. The thesis therefore proposes both short-term (training of lower level health workers and task delegation) and permanent (building a strong integrated healthcare system, adopting a national health policy and introducing behavioural change communication activities at mass level) measures to help improve maternal health. Greater emphasis on a bio-social rather than a bio-medical approach to improving maternal health will perhaps assist in achieving the 5th MDG.

List of Contents

Abstract	V
Declaration	vii
List of Tables	XV
List of Figures	xvii
Abbreviations	xviii
Glossary	xxi
Chapter One: Introduction	1
1.1. Introduction	1
1.2. Entry point of the thesis	3
1.3. Research questions	8
1.4. Significance of the study	11
1.5. Structure of the study	15
Chapter Two: Medicalisation of Pregnancy and Childbirth	17
2.1. Introduction	17
2.2. Medicalisation of childbirth: historical backdrop	18
2.2.1. Biomedical/technocratic model	23
2.2.2. Natural/holistic approach	24
2.2.3. Critics of medicalisation of childbirth	25
2.2.4. Re-emergence of home birth with midwifery services	26
2.3. Different interventions	26
2.3.1. For and against of ante-natal care program	28
2.3.2. Debate about traditional and skilled birth attendants	29
2.3.3. Basic and comprehensive emergency obstetric care	33
2.4. Connection between vertical and horizontal approaches	36
2.5. Tension among policy makers	37

2.5.1. Intervention-related	37
2.5.2. Addressing health personnel shortage	39
2.6. Summary	41
Chapter Three: Empirical Ground of the Ideas Developed	43
3.1. Introduction	43
3.2. Accessibility and availability	45
3.2.1. Classification of barriers	45
3.2.2. Explanation	46
3.2.3. Addressing the issues	47
3.3. Safe motherhood initiative	51
3.3.1. Factors associated with the success of reducing maternal mortality rate developing countries	•
3.3.2. Explanation	52
3.3.3. Factors Associated with failure of the safe motherhood initiative in deve	
3.4. Maternal mortality	
3.4.1. Direct medical causes of maternal mortality	
3.4.2. Indirect (medical) causes of maternal mortality	
3.4.3. Indirect (social) causes of maternal mortality	
3.5. Millennium Development Goals	
3.5.1. Reasons for being off-track in MDG realisation	58
3.5.2. Improving the situation	58
3.6. Positive experience of some community-based programs	62
3.7. Analytical framework	64
3.8. Summary	66
Chapter Four: General Overview of Bangladesh	68
4.1. Introduction	68
4.2. Geographic location	68

4.3. Social context	69
4.3.1. Social structure	69
4.3.2. Position of women in society	71
4.3.3. Education	74
4.3.4. Rural-urban continuum	79
4.4. The economic context	80
4.4.1. Poverty	81
4.4.2. Inequality	82
4.5. Political context	83
4.6. Administrative set-up	85
4.7. Healthcare service delivery system	86
4.7.1. Different types of healthcare services	87
4.7.2. Service delivery system before independence	87
4.7.3. Service delivery system after independence	88
4.7.4. Maternal healthcare service delivery system	91
4.7.5. General healthcare delivery system	92
4.8. Summary	93
Chapter Five: Methodology	94
5.1. Introduction	94
5.2. The study objectives	94
5.3. Methods	96
5.3.1. Interviews with mothers	97
5.3.2. Interviews with service providers	99
5.3.3. Focus group discussions	100
5.4. Analysis	101
5.5. Researcher's role	101
5.6 Limitations	103

	5.6.1. Shortcomings of the personal interview	103
	5.6.2. Problems encountered during the focus group discussions	103
	5.7. Profile of the respondents	105
	5.8. Summary	109
С	hapter Six: Bangladesh Health Policy	110
	6.1. Introduction	110
	6.2. The policy process in Bangladesh	110
	6.3. Health policy making	112
	6.4. Background of different health-related policies	113
	6.5. Analyses of all health-related policies	116
	6.5.1. Identifying the problem and setting the agenda for health	117
	6.5.2. Formulating health-related policies	121
	6.5.3. Adopting health policies	126
	6.5.4. Providing health care: policy implementation	126
	6.5.5. Evaluating the impact of health policies	130
	6.6. Health policy debate	131
	6.7. Summary	135
	hapter Seven: Results and Discussions: Availability of and Accessibility to Primary Healthcare	
	7.1. Introduction	137
	7.2. Distinction between 'availability' and 'accessibility'	137
	7.3. Availability of primary healthcare services	
	7.3.1. Availability of healthcare services	139
	7.3.2. Availability of health infrastructure	143
	7.3.3. Availability of health personnel	147
	7.4. Accessibility to primary healthcare services	
	7.4.1. Regional inequality in access to primary healthcare services	
	7.4.2. Class-hased inequality in access to primary healthcare services	161

7.5. Summary	163
Chapter Eight: Results and Discussions: Barriers to Access in Primary Healthcare Services	167
8.1. Introduction	167
8.2. Physical barriers	167
8.2.1. Distance	168
8.2.2. Waiting time	170
8.2.3. Opportunity costs	172
8.3. Social barriers	173
8.3.1. People's perception, beliefs and attitudes towards health-related issues	174
8.3.2. Social networks	182
8.3.3. Position of women in society	183
8.3.4. Financial factors	185
8.4. Organisational	189
8.4.1. Gender dynamic	190
8.4.2. Quality of care	191
8.4.3. Inefficient distribution of benefits	194
8.4.4. Lack of coordination, ownership and people's participation in policy	195
8.5. Other socio-demographic factors	196
8.5.1. Maternal age	196
8.5.2. Parity	198
8.5.3. Mother's education	199
8.6. Summary	199
Chapter Nine: Results and Discussions: Safe Motherhood: Issues and Interventions	203
9.1. Introduction	203
9.2. Ante-natal care services	204
9.2.1. Effectiveness of ante natal care services	206
0.3. Traditional versus skilled hirth attendants	208

9.3.1. Selection of birth attendants	209
9.4. Selection of birth place	215
9.4.1. Reasons for selecting home delivery	217
9.4.2. Reasons for selecting institutional delivery	219
9.5. Normal versus Caesarean delivery	220
9.6. Possible ways of solving this problem	225
9.7. Summary	230
Chapter Ten: Lessons from Other Developing Nations—Nepal and Sri Lanka	235
10.1. Introduction	235
10.2. SRI LANKA	237
10.2.1. Background of Sri Lanka	237
10.2.2. Expansion of female education	238
10.2.3. Increasing female autonomy	239
10.2.4. Origin and development of family planning	240
10.2.5. Health policy and healthcare service delivery systems	240
10.2.6. Other developmental efforts	245
10.3. NEPAL	247
10.3.1. Background of Nepal	247
10.3.2. Position of women	248
10.3.3. Increasing female education	250
10.3.4. Origin and development of family planning	250
10.3.5. Health policies and healthcare service delivery systems	251
10.3.6. Other developments	260
10.4. Similarities and differences among three countries	261
10.5. Lessons learned	262
10.6. Summary	264
Chapter Eleven: Conclusions	266

	11.1. Introduction	266
	11.2. Increasing the availability of and accessibility to primary (maternal) healthcare services	269
	11.2.1. Healthcare services	269
	11.2.2. Health Infrastructure	270
	11.2.3. Health personnel	271
	11.2.4. Accessibility to services	272
	11.2.5. Barriers to access	273
	11.2.6. Snapshot of the whole discussion	275
	11.3. Limited effectiveness of different medical interventions	278
	11.3.1. Ante-natal care	279
	11.3.2. Traditional versus skilled birth attendants	279
	11.3.3. Home versus facility centre-based delivery	280
	11.3.4. Caesarean versus normal delivery	280
	11.3.5. Snapshot of the whole discussion	281
	11.4. Review of the study	284
	11.5. Policy recommendations	286
	11.6. Contributions of this study	289
	11.7. Limitations of the study	290
	11.8. Future direction	292
Bi	bliography	295
۸.	opendices	336

List of Tables

Table 3.1 Millennium development goals	44
Table 4.1 Distribution of healthcare services provided at different levels	92
Table 5.1. Demographic profile of the respondents	106
Table 5.2. Socio-economic characteristics of the respondents	108
Table 7.1 Government facilities for EmOC services, 2006	140
Table 7.2 Distribution of health centres where respondents went for maternal healthcare servi	
Table 7.3 Distribution of nearest health centres in the study areas	
Table 7.4 Distribution of healthcare facilities available at centres of areas studied where respor visited during their conception and after delivery	
Table 7.5 Distribution of health personnel in areas studied	156
Table 7.6. No. of times respondents visited the nearest centres for maternal health care	158
Table 7.7. Study area-wise distribution of place of delivery	159
Table 7.8. Study area wise distribution of mode of delivery	161
Table 8.1 Distance of the nearest centres	168
Table 8.2 Distance of nearest centres in study area-wise	169
Table 8.3 Who accompanied you when you went outside for seeking healthcare?	173
Table 8.4 Perception of how life should be patterned during pregnancy (multiple)	180
Table 8.5 Distribution of controllers in areas studied	184
Table 8.6 Distribution of decision makers about seeking healthcare in areas studied	185
Table 8.7 Different ways of managing extra money if needed	188
Table 8.8 Different methods of repaying money	188
Table 8.9 Knowledge of health personnel on baby delivery and its related issues	193
Table 8.10 Capacity of the health personnel to identify pregnancy-related complications and the treatment	
Table 8.11Distribution of hygienic procedures the health staff of centres have been following	194
Table 8.12 Age intervals of the pregnant mothers (multiple)	197

Table 8.13 No. of previous pregnancies (multiple)	198
Table 9.1 Distribution of attendants during deliveries (multiple)	210
Table 9.2 Choice of health personnel in last delivery	210
Table 9.3 Distribution of the health personnel choice in the study areas	211
Table 9.4 Relation between mother's education level and birth attendant choice	211
Table 9.5 Relation between mother's age and birth place selection	216
Table 9.6 Relation between educational level and last birthing place choice	217
Table 9.7 Associational relation of female autonomy with choice of birth place	217
Table 9.8 Relationship between different factors and choice of place for delivering babies	219
Table 9.9 Distribution of delivery mode in area wise	223
Table 9.10 Relation between mother's education and birthing mode selection	223
Table 10.1 Similarities and differences among three countries	261

List of Figures

Figure 3.1 Analytical framework for maternal mortality	65
Figure 4.1 Different streams of education system in Bangladesh	76
Figure 4.2 The administrative hierarchy	86
Figure 4.3 Availability of healthcare services at different levels	89
Figure 4.4 Administrative structure of health personnel in Bangladesh	90
Figure 6.1 A path chart on Bangladesh health policy process	131
Figure 6.2 Impact of the HSRP on maternal health sector	134
Figure 8.1 Partial application of figure 6.2	202
Figure 9.1 Partial application of figure 3.1	233

Abbreviations

AFW Auxiliary Field Worker
ANC Ante Natal Care

B&CE/EmOC Basic and Comprehensive Essential/Emergency Obstetric Care

BCC Behavioural Change Communication

BCRHCC Bogra Comprehensive Reproductive Health Care Centre

BE/EmOC Basic Essential/Emergency Obstetric Care

BMA Bangladesh Medical Association
BNP Bangladesh Nationalistic Party

BOC Basic Obstetric Care

CE/EmOC Comprehensive Essential/Emergency Obstetric Care

CHWs Community Health Workers
CPR Contraceptive Prevalence Rate
CRS Compulsory Rural Service

CSBAs Community-based Skilled Birth Attendants

DFID The UK Development Fund

DGFP Director General of Family Planning
DGHS Director General of Health Service

DSF Demand Side Financing

E/EmOC Essential/Emergency Obstetric Care

ESP Package of Essential Service FCC Fukanda Community Clinic

FCHVs Female Community Health Volunteers

FGD Focus Group Discussion FHM Foetal Heart Monitoring

FHPP Fourth Health and Population Project

FIGO International Federation of Gynaecology and Obstetrics

FIMR Female Infant Mortality Rate
FLFP Female Labour Force Participation
FLTHP First Long Term Health Plan

FP Family Planning

FSE Female School Enrolment

FSP Female Secondary School Stipend Project

Family Welfare Assistants **FWAs FWV** Family Welfare Visitor **GDP Gross Domestic Product GNP Gross National Product** GTZ German Assistance **HCPs Health Care Providers** HDI **Human Development Index** HDR **Human Development Report**

HDSM Healthcare Service Delivery Mechanism

HNPSP Health, Nutrition and Population Sector Program

HPNSDP Health, Population and Nutrition Sector Development Program

HPSP Health and Population Sector Program
HPSS Health and Population Sector Strategy

HSRP Health Sector Reform Policy

IAG Inter Agency Group

ICDDRB International Centre for Diarrhoea Disease Research of Bangladesh

ICM International Confederation of Midwives

ICPD International Conference on Population and Development

JAICA Japan Fund

KCRHCC Kashiadanga Comprehensive Reproductive Health Care Centre

LLHWs Lower Level Health Workers

MBBS Bachelor of Medicine and Bachelor of Surgery

MCH Mother/Maternal and Child Health

MCH-FP Mother/Maternal and Child Health-Family Planning

MCHWs Maternal and Child Health Workers

MCWCs Maternal/Mother and Child Welfare Centres

MDGs Millennium Development Goals

MHC Maternal Health Care

MMM Maternal Mortality and Morbidity

MMR Maternal Mortality Rate

MO/MCH Medical Officer for Mother and Child Health
MOHFW Ministry of Health and Family Welfare
MOMS Mothers and Others with Midwifery Skills
MoP&C Medicalisation of Pregnancy and Childbirth

NCRHCC Noadapara Comprehensive Reproductive Health Care Centre

NGOs Non Government Organisations

NHP National Health Policy

NIPORT National Institute of Population Research and Training NIPSOM National Institute of Preventive and Social Medicine

NPM New Public Management

NUHFWC Nirmoil Union Health and Family Welfare Centre
OGSB Obstetrical and Gynaecological Society of Bangladesh

PHC Primary Health Care

PHCCs Primary Health Care Centres
PHMs Public Health Midwives

PNC Post Natal Care

PPH Post Partum Haemorrhage
PPP Public Private Partnership
QHCPs Qualified Health Care Providers
RHS Reproductive Health Service
SBAs Skilled Birth Attendants

SDIP Safe Delivery Incentive Program

SHP Sub-Health Post

SLTHP Second Long Term Health Plan
SMIs Safe Motherhood Initiatives
SMP Safe Motherhood Policy

SPSS Statistical Package for Social Sciences
SRH Sexual and Reproductive Health
SSMP Support to Safe Motherhood Program

SUHC Shapahar Upazila Health Complex

SWAPs Sector Wide Approaches
TBAs Traditional Birth Attendants

TFR Total Fertility Rate

THE Total Health Expenditure

UFPOs Upazila Family Planning Officers

UHC Upazila Health Complex

UHCPs Unqualified Health Care Providers

UHFPO Upazila Health and Family Planning Officer

UHFWC Union Health and Family Welfare Centre

UHOS Upazila Health Officers
UHSC Union Health Sub-Centre

UNDP United Nations Development Program UNFPA United Nations Fund for Population

UNICEF United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund

UNO Upazila Nirbahi Officer

UPHCP Urban Primary Health Care Project

USAID United States Agency for International Development

VDCs Village Development Committees

VHVs Village Health Volunteers
VHWs Village Health workers
WHO World Health Organisation

Glossary

Adhivasi Aboriginal religion

Ayurveda Herbal medicine mainly used by the Hindus

Bastee Slum

Batash Evil wind

Bhadharlock Respected person

Bibhagh Division

Buddha-Purnima Full moonlight night

Clothes-hanger Keeping clothes and valuable items

Dais Locally known traditional birth attendants with or without training

Dakter Doctor

Dal Pulse

Dekhi An instrument for paddy and wheat husking

Dhaitani Traditional birth attendant

Durga Puza A Hindu religious festival

Eidul-adha A Muslim religious festival of sacrificing animals

Eidul-fitre A post-Ramadan Muslim religious festival

Grandparous More than four pregnancies

Kutcha The walls and/or roofs of houses are made from materials, such as

un-burnt bricks, bamboos, mud, grass, tin, etc.

Lungi A kind of long skirt

Mahila Sangha Female association

Maktabs or Madrasa Religious schools for Muslims

Moulvis Islamic religious leaders/preachers

Multiparous More than one pregnancy

Palli Chikitiksaks Village doctors

Pani Bhangga Leak in the membrane

Pathsalas Religious schools for Hindus

Pohela Baishakh Celebration of the first day of Bengali calendar

Prebendalisation Revenue collection by Zamindars, Talukdars, and Jagirdars—all are

temporary revenue collectors

Primiparous A single pregnancy

Pucca Walls of house are made with burnt bricks and roof is concrete

Purdah Veil or seclusion

Purush Male

Rahu A Hindu god

Salwar kameez Two parts of female dress, one for upper portion and the other

for the lower

Sari It is a 18 feet long cloth covering the whole female body

Semi-pucca Walls of burnt bricks and roof is made of corrugated tin

Sharam Shame

Tawiz Amulet

Tempo An automated three-wheeler

Unani Herbal medicine primarily used by the Muslims

Upazila Sub-district

Zamindar Landlord

Zila District