AN ECONOMIC ASSESSMENT OF THE SPLIT ROCK DAM OF NEW SOUTH WALES

A Dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Degree of Master of Economics

by

Abdullah Al-Harun

M.Sc (Dhaka); Dip. Ag. Ec (UNE)

Department of Agricultural Economics and Business Management University of New England Armidale, N.S.W.

January 1986



Dedicated to my beloved father whom I lost during my study in Australia (Oh God, the Merciful, let his soul be rest in peace).

I certify that:

- (a) the substance of this dissertation has not already been submitted for any degree and is not being currently submitted for any other degree.
- (b) any help received in preparing this dissertation and all sources used have been acknowledged herein.



ABSTRACT

This study investigates the relative profitability of the Split Rock dam in New South Wales from the view point of the participating new irrigators and society. A review of the economic literature on contemporary project appraisal techniques, in an attempt to justify the choice of the analytical method and the Conventional Efficiency Analysis (Gittinger 1982) is presented in detail. In the appraisals, the net present value, internal rate of return and benefit— cost ratio are calculated based on direct costs and benefits related to agriculture with social discount rate of 7, 10 and 13 per cent in real terms. Secondary/intangible costs and benefits are not included in the anlysis, but identified with a view to make the decision maker aware of their impacts on the society. The implications of the project are also highlighted.

The main conclusion of the study is that investment in Split Rock dam is economically unsound from the view point of society, but would be highly profitable to new irrigators, based on the assumptions underlying the appraisals. It is also concluded that even if the water price is increased to the extent of full economic water development cost, irrigated production at the farm level would still be profitable at a rate greater than the opportunity cost of private investment. Increased water price at an appropriate level would help improve efficiency in irrigation water utilization, reduce wastage and facilitate the effective use of sleeper licenses.

The study has outlined policy guides on how to maximise efficiency per dollar invested in the project.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

At the very outset I wish to thank the Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh for nominating me and the Government of Australia for sponsoring my study in Australia.

I am very grateful to my supervisor, Associate Professor P.G. James for not only his close guidance and assistance in getting materials for the study, but also his enormous help in editing the dissertation with a view to bridging the gap between what I thought in Bengali and expressed in English.

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to Prof. W.F. Musgrave, Dr. J.B. Hardaker, Dr. J.A. Sinden, Dr. N.J. Dudley (Sydney University), Mr. Euan Fleming, Mr. Mike Bryant (Dept. of Agriculture, Gunnedah), Mr. Paul Verdich (Water ResourcesCommission, Sydney) for their valuable advice and encouragement during the study.

I would also like to thank Messrs Brain Davidson, Andrew Robertson, B.K. Shaha, Sean O'Sullivan (ABRI), Andrew Yeomans (Librarian, Lewis Library) and others in this Department and Computer Centre, UNE who helped me at the various stages of the study.

Finally, I would like to thank my wife, Gulnahar and son, Rubens for their patience during many long hours of absence.

Thanks to 'The Almighty Allah' for timely completion of the study.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT		iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS		iv
LIST OF TABLES	3	viii
LIST OF FIGURE	S	х
LIST OF MAPS		х
Charles and		
Chapter	ODUCTION AND OUTLINE OF CTUDY	
	ODUCTION AND OUTLINE OF STUDY	1
1.1		1
	The Problem	2
	Objective of the Study	4
	Hypotheses	4
	Justification of the Study	4
1.6	Plan of the Study	5
2 BACK	GROUND OF THE PROJECT	
2.1	Introduction	6
2.2	Water Rights in New South Wales	8
2,3	Development of Irrigation in Namoi Valley	8
2.4	Nature and Purpose of the Project	9
2.5	Location and Project Area	11
2.6	Physio-Climatic Characteristics	11
	2.6.1 Soils	12
	2.6.2 Climate	12
2.7	Present and Proposed Land Use Pattern	14
	2.7.1 Present Land Use	14
	2.7.2 Future land use	15
2.8	Description of the Dam	17
	2.8.1 Technical details	17
	2.8.2 Period of construction and cost estimates	17
	2.8.3 Financing of the project	18
2.9	Operational Policy	18
	2.9.1 Behaviour of downstream flows	21
	2.9.2 Optimal reliability of supply for irrigation	21

		νi
	2.10 Organization and Management	22
3	LITERATURE REVIEW, CHOICE OF ANALYTICAL METHOD AND	
	THEORETICAL CONSIDERATIONS	
	3.1 Introduction	23
	3.2 Review of Alternative Approaches	24
	3.3 Choice of Analytical Method	29
	3.4 Theoretical Considerations	31
	3.4.1 Basic notion of benefit-cost analysis	31
	3.4.2 Economic basis of benefit-cost analysis	32
	3.4.3 Diagramatic representation of irrigation	
	project	33
	3.4.4 Limitations of benefit-cost analysis	35
4	THE CONVENTIONAL EFFICIENCY ANALYSIS	
	4.1 Overview	37
	4.2 Application Procedure	38
	4.2.1 The Numeraire	38
	4.2.2 Premium on foreign exchange and standard	
	conversion factor	38
	4.2.3 Identification of costs and benefits	39
	4.2.4 Determination of proper values	40
	4.2.5 The economic value of land	41
	4.2.6 The economic value of labour	41
	4.2.7 Discount rate	44
	4.2.8 Decision criteria	45
	4.2.9 Intangible benefits and costs	49
	4.3 Sensitivity Analysis	49
5	ESTIMATION OF INCREMENTAL BENEFITS OF IRRIGATION PROPOSA	\L
	5.1 Background to the Analysis	50
	5.1.1 Period of economic analysis	50
	5.1.2 Commodity yields and prices	50
	5.1.3 Costs and benefits identification	50
	5.1.4 Choice of discount rate	52
	5.1.5 Data sources	54

			vii
	5.2	Estimation of Financial Return to Individual Farmer	55
		5.2.1 Introduction	55
		5.2.2 Initial farm model	56
		5.2.3 Variations in initial farm model	57
		5.2.4 Incremental cost and benefit	58
	5.3	Estimation of Economic Returns to Society	63
		5.3.1 Opportunity cost of acquired land	63
		5.3.2 Determination of economic values	63
		5.3.3 Incremental cost and benefit to society	66
	5.4	Sensitivity Analysis	66
6	RESU	ULTS AND DISCUSSION	
	6.1	Results of the Farm Level Analysis	74
	6.2	Results of the Analysis from Society's Viewpoint	75
	6.3	Results of the Sensitivity Analysis	75
	6.4	Interpretation of Results	79
	6.5	Secondary Costs and Benefits	82
		6.5.1 Increased revenue in transport sector	85
		6.5.2 Flood control benefit	85
		6.5.3 Fishing and Outdoor recreation benefits	85
		6.5.4 Drought protection	85
	6.6	Implications of the Project	86
7	SUMM	MARY AND CONCLUSIONS	
	7.1	Summary and Conclusions	88
	7.2	Policy Considerations	90
	7.3	Limitations of the Study	91
	-7.4	Scope of Further Research	91
Appendix			
1	Tech	nical Details of the Split Rock Dam	93
2	Plan	ating and Harvesting Time of Crops	94
3	Farm	Budget for Crop Activities	95
4	Irri	gation Development Costs per Hectare	97
5	0ppc	ortunity Cost of Land Acquired for the Dam	98
REFERENCE	S		101

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Title	
2.1	Typical Water Use in New South Wales	7
2.2	Area under Surface and Groundwater Irrigation in	
	Namoi Valley	10
2,3	Monthly Climatic Data of Selected Stations of the	
	Project Region	13
2.4	Number of Establishments, Area and Land Use in the	
	Project and Adjecent Areas in 1983/84	16
2.5	Investment Cost of the Split Rock Dam	19
2.6	Annual Operating/Recurring Cost on Completion of the	
	Split Rock Dam	20
3.1	Summary of the Salient Features of Project	
	Appraisal Methods	26
4.1	Decision Tree for Determining Economic Values	42
4.2	Comparison of Discounted Measures of Project Worth	48
5.1	Estimated Incremental Net Benefit with Initial Farm	
	Model from the Viewpoint of Individual Farmer	60
5.2	Estimated Incremental Net Benefit with Farm Model-A	
	from the Viewpoint of Individual Farmer	61
5.3	Estimated Incremental Net Benefit with farm Model-B	
	from the Viewpoint of Individual Farmer	62
5.4	Export Prices, Marketing and Transport Costs of	
	Selected Commodities	64
5.5	Estimated Incremental Net Benefit to Society with	
	Initial Farm Model	67
5.6	Estimated Incremental Net Benefit to Society with	
	Farm Model-A	69
5.7	Estimated Incremental Net Benefit to Society with	
	Farm Model-B	71
6.1	Measures of Financial Profitability of the	
	Participating Individual Farmer	74
6.2	Measures of Economic Profitability from the	
	Viewmoint of Society	75

6.3	Sensitivity Analysis with Variable Water Charges	
	from the Viewpoint of Individual Farmer	76
6.4	Sensitivity Analysis with Variable Water Charges	
	from the Viewpoint of Society	77
6.5	Social Profitability Analysis with Zero Opportunity	
	Cost for the use of Unskilled Labours	78

ix

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure	Title	
3.1	Net benefits from an irrigation project	34
6.1	Net present value from the viewpoint of	
	individual farmer	80
6.2	Net present value from the viewpoint of society	81
6.3	Financial rate of return to individual farmer with	
	different rates of water charge	83
6.4	Economic rate of return to society with different	
	rates of water charge	84
	LIST OF MAPS	
Map	Title	
2.1	Statistical Agricultural Areas of New South Wales	
2.2	Project Area and Location of the Split Rock Dam	